

# FARAN JOURNAL OF HISTORICAL STUDIES

Volume: I Number: 1 (January - June)



## ARTICLES

- A Tale of Two Cities: Reflections on Entrepreneurism in Sialkot and Jalandhar  
*Dr. Ilyas Chattha*
- Historiography of Partition of India: A Critical Appraisal  
*Dr. Adnan Tariq*
- Faraizi Movement: Impressions on Muslim Decline  
*Dr. Rizwan Ullah Kokab*
- Textbooks of History and Pakistan Studies in Punjab: An Analysis  
*Dr. Akhtar Hussain Sandhu & Dr. Amna Mahmood*
- US Sanctions on Iran and their Impacts on Iran's Economy  
*Zainab Mohsin & Sana Rasheed*

## BOOK REVIEWS:

Alyssa Ayres,  
Speaking Like a State: Language & Nationalism in Pakistan  
Shafqat Tanveer Mirza  
Resistance Themes in Punjabi Literature  
Dalver Singh Pannu  
The Sikh Heritage: Beyond Borders  
María I. Maldonado García  
Urdu: Evolution and Reforms

**RESEARCH FORUM**  
**GOVERNMENT ISLAMIA COLLEGE, CIVIL**  
**LAHORE**

Volume: I

Number: 1

January-June 2020

# **FARAN JOURNAL OF HISTORICAL STUDIES**

**BIANNUAL RESEARCH JOURNAL**



**RESEARCH FORUM  
GOVERNMENT ISLAMIA COLLEGE, CIVIL LINES,  
LAHORE (PAKISTAN)**



Volume:I

Number: 1

January-June 2020

## FARAN JOURNAL OF HISTORICAL STUDIES



Articles	Page No.
▶ A Tale of Two Cities: Reflections on Entrepreneurism in Sialkot and Jalandhar <b>Dr. Ilyas Chatha</b>	6
▶ Historiography of Partition of India: A Critical Appraisal <b>Dr. Adnan Tariq</b>	27
▶ Faraizi Movement: Impressions on Muslim Decline <b>Dr. Rizwan Ullah Kokab</b>	39
▶ Textbooks of History and Pakistan Studies in Punjab: An Analysis <b>Dr. Akhtar Hussain Sandhu &amp; Dr. Amna Mahmood</b>	56
▶ US Sanctions on Iran and their Impacts on Iran's Economy <b>Zainab Mohsin &amp; Sana Rasheed</b>	95
<b>BOOK REVIEWS:</b>	
<b>Alyssa Ayres,</b> <i>Speaking Like a State: Language &amp; Nationalism in Pakistan</i>	105
<b>Shafqat Tanveer Mirza</b> <i>Resistance Themes in Punjabi Literature</i>	107
<b>Dalver Singh Pannu</b> <i>The Sikh Heritage: Beyond Borders</i>	109
<b>María I. Maldonado García</b> <i>Urdu: Evolution and Reforms</i>	113

RESEARCH FORUM  
GOVERNMENT ISLAMIA COLLEGE CIVIL LINES,  
LAHORE.

## **Advisory Board**

<b>Dr. Pargat Singh</b>	Chairman, Sikh Educational Council, UK
<b>Dr. Afroz Taj</b>	University of California, USA.
<b>Cosmin Tudor CIOCAN</b>	Copernicus University, Torun, Poland
<b>Dr. Muhammad Idris</b>	Punjabi University, Patiala
<b>Dr. Mahboob Hussain</b>	University of the Punjab, Lahore.
<b>Dr. Faraz Anjum</b>	University of the Punjab, Lahore
<b>Dr. Husain Ahmad Khan</b>	G.C. University, Lahore.
<b>Dr. Rizwan Ullah Kokab</b>	G.C. University, Faisalabad.
<b>Dr. Shafique Bhatti</b>	Bahaudin Zakariya University, Multan.
<b>Dr. Muhammad Ijaz Butt</b>	Government College Township, Lahore.
<b>Dr. Ilyas Chatha</b>	Department of History, School of African and Oriental Studies (SOAS) University of London, UK



## **A TALE OF TWO CITIES: REFLECTIONS ON ENTREPRENEURISM IN SIALKOT AND JALANDHAR**

**Dr. Ilyas Chattha**

Department of History

School of African and Oriental Studies (SOAS)

University of London, UK

Email: ic17@soas.ac.uk

### **ABSTRACT**

Sialkot (Pakistan) and Jalandhar (India) have not only become the largest production centres of surgical instruments and sports goods in their respective countries but also have emerged as the world players in these export-oriented products. The cities have only reached this stage after negotiating through numerous challenges. Sialkot's industrial clusters had thrived during the colonial rule; Jalandhar's developed impressively after independence. This paper identifies similarities and differences in the development patterns of industrial growth in the cities in the aftermath of the Partition of India. Drawing attention to the historical success of the Sialkot cluster, the paper shows how the city faced economic hardship in 1947 arising from the migration of Hindu trading classes to Jalandhar where they sought to establish a powerful regional competitor. This points to specificity of local contingent factors—particularly, Sialkot's local entrepreneurial base—as specific features of the city's post-1947 success. This reflects on the resilience and self-reliance of the city to compete with larger urban centers. The emphasis is on the entrepreneurial history of the local artisans. How did they fill various niches left by the departure of Hindus and Sikh traders? In the case of Jalandhar, the paper considers the extent to which the input of refugee labour and capital from Sialkot was locally significant in the development of the contemporary industry of Jalandhar. This is not merely an attempt to provide historical depth to studies on the development of industrial clusters; such a perspective carries the potential to improve our understanding of how a new class of small industrialists rises through this 'development'. The paper argues that understandings which do not view these processes as interconnected will fail to design appropriate policies to facilitate industrialization and entrepreneurship.

## INTRODUCTION

Contemporary globalization and problems of de-industrialization in such cities as Ahmedabad and Bombay have encouraged what Gyan Prakash (2002) has termed an urban 'historical turn' in the past two decades. Much of the new urban history has focused around metropolitan centers or port cities where rapid urban expansion and industrial growth generated the 'problems' which occasioned dramatic interventions by governing authorities in the fields of housing, public health and policing (Chandravarkar 2009; Heitzman 2008; Fawaz and Bayly 2002). With respect to India as elsewhere, the wider themes on the new forms of urbanity and modernity have been marked by interdisciplinary approaches (Talbot and Kamran 2015; Glover 2011; Freitag 2011). In his recent work, *Small Towns Capitalism in Western India*, Haynes (2012) stresses the histories of different industries in the informal sector can only be understood through close examination of regional economics in a different part of the subcontinent. In considering the advances in the new urban history and importance of small towns economics, however, the artisanal cities of Sialkot and Jalandhar should not be overlooked. Not only because they have become the major manufacturing centres of surgical instruments and sports goods, they also have emerged the world players in these export-oriented products, and thereby contribute to the regional, national and, to a lesser extent, global economy. About two-thirds of India's export of sports goods is from Jalandhar alone. Sialkot caters 85 per cent of the total world demand for hand-stitched inflatable balls, with an annual value of exports over 1.6 billion dollars (Lund-Thomsen and Nadvi 2010). How have the cities achieved this performance? We argue that the explanation to this conundrum lies in closely studying their intertwined histories through a comparative analysis.

The role of industrial clusters in rapid industrial development has attracted much attention in the last two decades from development economists and policymakers, because they create ample employment opportunities, generate capital stocks and thereby contribute to economic growth and poverty reduction (Zhu 2012; Sonobe and Otsuka 2011; Roy 1993; Long and Zhang 2011; Schmitz and Nadvi 1999; Porter 1998). By exploring the historical processes in which the 'informal' sector have related to the 'formal' sector over time, Haynes (2012) treats artisan manufacture as being part of capitalist development and more critical to the current contours of the regional and global economy. There is a large body of literature that offers relevant insights (*Jakobsen 2015*; Acs and Audretsch 1990 and Brock and Evans 1989). As for the empirical studies specifically relating to the Punjab cities and towns, Sharma (1994) and Hazlehurst (1966), for example, show the influence of caste and family background on entrepreneurial success. Singh's (1994) account of Ludhiana's bicycle cluster and Menning's (1997) work of Surat's Silk industry produced similar findings. More recently, some authors have stressed



the importance of taking stock of region-specific factors (Sonobe and Otsuka 2011). Others have laid stress on the role of the government, which makes entrepreneurship productive, unproductive or destructive (Baumol 1990).

Given this variety, to what extent is this scholarship a significant factor in the case of Sialkot and Jalandhar? How have the cities' clusters developed? What are the characteristics of their development? The historical growth of the cities' industrial clusters is markedly different from each other. Sialkot's well-defined export-oriented clusters producing surgical instruments and sports goods had thrived during the colonial rule. They not only fulfilled the bulk of the subcontinent's requirements but were also exported worldwide. How did the city develop such competencies? This paper seeks to answer this question by exploring the entrepreneurial history of the local artisans (*mistri*). The Hindu and Sikh commercial and trading classes of Sialkot monopolised the industry, although the Muslims largely formed its workforce. The city suffered widespread demographic shifts and economic hardship at the time of Partition in 1947, as it lost its capitalist classes, traditional markets as well as sources of raw materials. It also faced a powerful regional competitor in Jalandhar where Hindu refugees from Sialkot sought to establish a rival sports goods and surgical instruments industry. The cities provide a rare opportunity to examine the contrasting experiences of the development of industrial clusters, comprising of the supply of skills brought by the migrant communities, and the severe pressures imposed upon by Partition-related dislocations concerning the loss of Hindu traders.

The paper argues that Sialkot and Jalandhar could be seen as regional exemplars on how to manage demographic change. Although this research is based on source material dealing directly with these two artisanal cities and informed by a relevant theoretical framework, the insights apply to other cities and towns in the region and beyond. Considering how the demographic and economic depletion handicapped the commercial activities in Sialkot, this paper provides the key to understanding how the city recovered from its Partition-related economic depression to become a thriving industrial town of the region. It shows how members of the local skilled population responded to the changed circumstances and seized new opportunities to start new ventures following the departure of Hindu traders. It examines the extent to which the Muslim artisans' success depended on the pre-existing skills, marketing network and government assistance.

Jalandhar's emergence as a major production centre is more recent than Sialkot's. The case study of Jalandhar provides an in-depth analysis to uncover the role of migrant communities in the emergence and performance of surgical instruments and sports goods industry. It considers the extent to which the input of refugee labour and capital from Sialkot was locally significant in the development of the contemporary industry of Jalandhar, India's largest production centre of

sports goods and surgical instruments. It draws special attention to the ethnic entrepreneurship by certain caste groups, especially the Ad-dharmi and Chamars, and attempts to account for their success as the city's leading traders. The paper argues that the demographic change at Partition significantly impacted the cities' economy and brought new niches for economically-backward communities in different sectors of the economy, which is not fully recognised in scholarship. It not only explains the processes in which small and medium enterprises can develop and relate to the formal sector but also facilitate upward mobility of the underprivileged classes.

## THE GROWTH OF JALANDHAR INDUSTRY

Jalandhar has played an important role in India's economic development. Its industrial clusters producing surgical instruments and sports goods have developed dramatically since independence, which barely existed before 1947. How can we explain this impressive growth in the immediate post-colonial period? A survey of the firms producing surgical instruments and sports goods was conducted in Jalandhar in order to gather information on the historical development of the cluster and the major characteristics of entrepreneurs and their enterprises. The industry in Jalandhar was initiated in 1947 when the migrant communities from Sialkot had resettled in the city following the Partition of India. According to our survey, out of 125 sample firms, over seventy per cent businesspeople inherited their businesses from their fathers who had worked in Sialkot before becoming entrepreneurs in Jalandhar. The most successful of these individuals belonged to the Khatri, Bania and Arora castes. The leading families who dominated the industrial sector included Dutt, Roy, Uberoi, Agarwal, Nanda, Rai and Ahluwalia. They also included Sikh Ramgarhias and other caste groups, namely the Ad-dharmi, Meghs and Chamars. In a short period, members of these migrant communities had established many sports goods units in Jalandhar. Their efficiency is evidenced clearly in the fact that by May 1949, they had established about seventy-five large and small enterprises for the manufacture of sports goods, and their monthly production was worth about Rs 200,000.<sup>1</sup> Since then, the industry has been growing vigorously. Although the Sialkot cluster is three times bigger than Jalandhar's in terms of numbers of firms and eight times in value of export (Lund-Thomsen and Nadvi 2010: 208), the development phenomenon is unique in Jalandhar in that sense that the emergence of clusters has not been experienced in any other cities in the region on such a large-scale and at such a rapid rate.

How can we account for Jalandhar's more rapid industrial growth than other cities in the region? What enabled the migrant families to become successful

---

<sup>1</sup> *Civil and Military Gazette* (Lahore) 3 May 1949, p. 7.

entrepreneurs in the industry? A wide range of studies has identified the impact of refugee skill and capital in the urban regeneration and industrial development of different cities and towns of Punjab. Notable works include Talbot's (2006) on Lahore's post-1947 growth in the carpet industries and Pippa's (2008) on the development of the textile industry in Lyallpur. Building upon this insight, this paper shows that the previously acquired industrial skills and capital in Sialkot were important factors not only in Jalandhar's rapid post-independence economic growth but also in individual refugees' success. According to our interviews with traders in Jalandhar, members of these migrant communities utilised their pre-existing family ties and business connections and transferred their previous experience and skills to the city's surgical instruments and sports goods economy.

This process can be illustrated through the case of the city's well-known Pioneer Sports Goods, which was initiated by a migrant family—the Ahluwalia in 1948. Before Partition, the Ahluwalia Brothers, namely Kirpal Singh and Rajindar Singh, owned Sialkot's successful Pioneer Sporting Goods, which had branches not only in other Indian cities such as Jalandhar, Bombay and Calcutta but also at 6 Rangoon Street, London by the name of J. S. Ahluwalia.<sup>2</sup> They were experts in the techniques of procurement, quality control and arrangements for export and marketing network. The family, which had migrated to Jalandhar in 1947 utilised previous trading experience and emerged not only as one of the most successful businessmen of the city, but also played an important role in establishing a major rival to the Sialkot sports goods industry in India. The firm mostly employed refugee labour. From this pioneering enterprise, a number of spin-off entrepreneurs emerged who established their own firms in the city. It is also important to note that some of Sialkot's Hindu traders who earlier had opted to resettle in Delhi and elsewhere in India subsequently shifted to Jalandhar, because of the concentration of refugee workers in the city who totalled over 26,000 in 1951 (Chattha 2011). As revealed through interviews, Hindu entrepreneurs freely acknowledged the technical mastery of refugee labour.

Academic literature on the theme shows that clusters tend to foster more clusters (Zhu 2012; Sonobe and Otsuka 2011). The Jalandhar industry grew rapidly in the early years of independence. Practically all the prominent refugee manufacturers of the surgical instruments and sports goods industries had modest beginnings. Small units have traditionally dominated the industry. There are three types of enterprises connected with one another in the production system and marketing network: (1) registered firms; (2) unregistered workshops; and (3) subcontractors. These industries depended on the skills, capital, connections and networks of trust amongst the refugee communities. The example of an Aggarwal businessman illustrates a success story. The family business has grown from small

---

<sup>2</sup> An Unpublished Autobiography of Dr. Kishan Chand of Sialkot, p. 70.

beginnings to become one of the biggest sports goods operators and dealers in Jalandhar. As emerged from informal interviews, the family had engaged as middlemen in the sports goods in Sialkot before migration. According to our respondents, community support from people who came from similar localities and ethnic backgrounds was another way to set up a new venture in Jalandhar. One success story is Shinder Singh; the Sikh Ramgarhias, whose family came from Sialkot and now live in Jalandhar's Basti Nau. Like other respondents, his father was also able to secure assistance in setting up trade because of the pre-Partition connections. 'My father owned a *tonga* (horse-cart) in Sialkot and mainly got labour of delivering raw material and products one place to other. He personally knew many traders... these contacts helped setting up a business in Jalandhar'. The account highlights that the previously 'being known' was an important element for enhancing social capital and developing business for even an underprivileged individual in the new opportunities after 1947.

### **ECONOMIC MOBILITY OF REFUGEES: FROM 'UNTOUCHABLES' TO ENTREPRENEURS**

This paper argues that the demographic transformation in the wake of Partition brought new opportunities for both locals and refugees in different sectors of the economy. Many refugee workers achieved upward economic mobility in Jalandhar through their own efforts, and because they brought trading experience, skills and contacts from Pakistan, in particular. Members of the scheduled caste groups, namely the Ad-dharmi, Meghs and Chamars, were a part of a larger group of people who migrated to Jalandhar from Sialkot in 1947 (Chattha 2011). These caste groups formed about forty per cent of the population of Jalandhar. In many ways, they benefited from the opportunities created by Partition-related dislocation. In actuality, they were not traditionally business people, as the groups customarily limited themselves to trading professions like in the handling and processing of the rawhides. As revealed through interviews, members of these lower caste groups have experienced social, economic and political mobility through entrepreneurship largely by diversifying their traditional caste occupations. Possessing skills and practical experience, combined with the favourable business environment provided by the Indian government, many succeeded in establishing themselves as independent producers. They monopolised the sector of surgical instruments and leather-based industries during its earlier years. According to Jodhha (2003, 39), the Ad-dharmi and Chamars had controlled roughly as much as an astonishing 70 per cent of the big units and about 80 per cent of the medium and small units producing surgical instruments in Jalandhar by the 1960s. Their presence was also quite significant in the sports goods and leather industries in the city (Bal and Judge 2010).

Aside from trading experience, one of the primary reasons for success in business of the Ad-dharmi and Chamars is their extensive kinship network in Jalandhar. As emerges from informal interviews, they, like those of many other migrant business communities in the city, are a closely-knit group, bound tightly by trust and cooperation. These flexible networks give them access to community resources and allow them to adapt to market fluctuations and avoid bureaucratic restrictions. Some cluster studies have stressed the role of social capital in industrial development (Nadvi 1999b; Weiss 1991). Our informal interviews with the migrant groups of entrepreneurs in Jalandhar indicate that their kinship and social ties with people in the same industry help them gain access to trade credit and important business-related information. Many of the traders are connected with each other either through kinship or are acquaintances because of their previously shared locality (Sialkot) and collective memory of the 1947 mass migration.

As revealed through interviews, location is also vital to influence individual access to market potential. They reside nearby and are also related as neighbours and as kin, and such kinship bonds are socially reproduced through socio-economic interactions and intermarriages. As emerged through interviews, informal contacts and previously-shared community values were two of the reasons that led to joint action, co-operation, and the success of the migrant communities in the surgical instruments and sports goods trades. Nonetheless, in these communities, like in any other, cooperation and support coexist with gossip, competition and rivalry.

Lack of credit was cited as a major initial constraint by most of the refugee entrepreneurs in Jalandhar. Despite the Indian government's schemes to fund refugee businessmen, the theme, which emerges from informal interviews, is that most of the capital, which was raised, came from their own family funds. The capital assets, which they had carried with them during the migration from Sialkot, constituted an important source of their investment. The other source was the compensation they received in lieu of their 'claims' of various kinds of immovable properties that they had abandoned in Pakistan. The state was of course involved in overseeing this process, but refugees regarded it as part of their 'right'. Therefore, again, they tend in interviews to play down any notion of state assistance in their success. In reality, the Indian government's assistance in creating the conditions for small-scale capital accumulation among skilled sports goods and surgical instruments workers was a key element in Jalandhar's economic dynamism. The government's policies towards the refugees in the 1950s in terms of loans at a low rate of interest and raw material quotas encouraged them to start new ventures. The government also assisted small-scale units under the Freight Equalisation Scheme of 1948 (Singh 1994). The cost of transport of raw material to the factory decreased significantly in Punjab because of this scheme. Certainly, Jalandhar's industry was one of the beneficiaries of this assistance. The city's strategic location ensured for

it a prominent commercial position in Punjab. From here goods could be easily transported to many big inland cities, such as Amritsar and Ludhiana. Jalandhar also had an advantage in terms of access to raw materials of willow and mulberry wood. The former was found chiefly in the region of Jammu and Kashmir, and subsequently, the Indian government made efforts to grow willow wood on the banks of the Beas River in the Kulu Valley of East Punjab (Tyagi 1958: 160)

Indeed the Jalandhar industry, like many in the country, took advantage of new state structure associated with Nehruvian socialism, which regulated factory production. As early as in June 1948, to help develop the sports goods industry of Jalandhar, the Indian government banned the illegal flow of Sialkot-made sports goods into the country. After Partition, a great number of unfinished sports goods had been smuggled to India through 'illegal channels'. Some indication of the scale of this activity can be seen in the fact that the Indian government had seized over Rs 2 million worth of 'Sialkot sports goods' by June 1948.<sup>3</sup>

Most importantly, factors associate with the global economy were no doubt important to the shape of the artisanal manufacture of Jalandhar. In one instance, Jalandhar benefited greatly from the devaluation crisis and began competing with Sialkot's industry. The crisis in 1949, following the devaluation of the sterling, threatened to ruin the Sialkot industry as its export prices increased.<sup>4</sup> Pakistan's refusal to devalue its rupee resulted in a great financial loss to all the exporters of the country. Sialkot's industry, as a part of a global market, was especially badly affected. Its goods were successful because of their lower prices, so a sudden increase of 44 per cent in the prices of sports goods forced many European, and Commonwealth firms to cancel their orders. Amidst this crisis, Jalandhar's industry took off, as international demand for the city's sports goods increased considerably in Britain, Europe, Australia, New Zealand, Malaysia, and the West Indies. Now 100 Pakistani rupees were equal to 144 Indian rupees. This imbalance priced Sialkot's goods out of many markets. Facing the threat of being wiped out by the currency crisis, the local trading communities and the government of Pakistan took a series of collective measures to save the industry, as we shall see.

## THE DEVELOPMENT OF SIALKOT INDUSTRY

Sialkot's experience of post-independence industrial growth stands in stark contrast with Jalandhar. This is in terms of the role of locals rather than migrants.

---

<sup>3</sup>*Inquilab* (Lahore) 9 June 1948, p. 3.

<sup>4</sup> On 18 September 1949, the British Chancellor of the Exchequer, Sir Stafford Cripps, announced a 30 per cent devaluation of the pound from 4.03 dollars to 2.80 dollars per pound. Almost immediately, the European and Commonwealth countries, including India followed suit, but the government of Pakistan refused to devalue its rupee. The main reason put forward for this course of action was that Pakistan had not had an unfavorable balance of payments mainly because of its agricultural economy.

In part, Sialkot's geographical handicap of being on the border, particularly with disputed Jammu and Kashmir, provided opportunities for local communities, as the city failed to attract refugee workers and entrepreneurs in the wake of Partition. Refugees in Sialkot chiefly came from the Jammu region. The 'Kashmiri refugees' migration experience and pattern of the settlement were sharply different from their East Punjab counterparts. Despite the central government's sympathy for the Kashmiri refugees, Pakistan's claim over the disputed territory of Kashmir, not only excluded them from the permanent settlement schemes for a long time, but also omitted them from inclusion in the 1951 Census.<sup>5</sup>

Sialkot suffered serious hardship from the migration of Hindu trading classes, capital flight, loss of financial expertise in the banking and business sectors, and loss of access to traditional markets and raw materials. Hindu and Sikh traders had started shifting assets and capital out of Sialkot weeks before the formal Partition happened. It took decades to overcome the 1947 depression as its industrial production and export declined by 90 per cent.<sup>6</sup> Out of fifty-three registered factories working in 1946, only twelve factories remained in partial operation after Partition. The year before Partition, Rs 149 *lakhs* worth of capital was invested in Sialkot's factories, but this had decreased to Rs 14 *lakhs* in 1947 (Abdul 1953: 61-67). The continuing closure of industries rendered over 90 per cent of the labouring classes without job. More than five months after Partition over 35,000 former workers were still 'sitting idle'.<sup>7</sup>

How did Sialkot's labour respond to this hardship? Source material shows, despite demographic doldrums and economic depletion, that the city's local entrepreneurial base and pre-existing skills were important for the post-1947 recovery. Its existing artisans and investors not only utilised the pre-existing global marketing network to their advantage, but also saw an opportunity to take over as owners in the entrepreneurial vacuum, which was created with the departure of the Hindu traders. Though they were initially slow to make any headway, with the assistance of government, they began to gain ascendancy and contributed greatly to Sialkot's economic dynamism. Before turning to this theme, it is important to take stock of the local skill, which was central to the city's post-1947 success.

## **SIALKOT—THE UNIVERSITY OF ENTREPRENEURS**

This section proposes an explanation of the historical success of industrial clusters in Sialkot through exploring the artisanal origins of Sialkot's contemporary

---

<sup>5</sup> According to the 1951 Census, Sialkot's population showed a decrease nearly 2 per cent, which was due to exclusion of the Kashmiri refugees. See for example Population Census of Pakistan, 1951, Vol. 1, pp. 11-20.

<sup>6</sup> PLAD, from 29 February to 15 March 1952, Vol. III, pp. 663-8.

<sup>7</sup> *Inquilab* (Lahore) 8 February 1948, p. 3.

industrialisation. Some cluster studies have attempted to explain the processes that lead to certain industrial clusters growing faster than others. Nam, Sonobe and Otsuka (2009), for example, find the advent of modern industrial clusters from traditional villages where time-honoured products, such as silk and agricultural tools, have long been produced. Sialkot lends support to this view. Famous for its local initiatives, Sialkot had long ago developed industrial clusters formed by small workshops. It is interesting to ask why clusters in Sialkot managed to grow successfully. Historically, the city was on the invasion route from Central Asia. As a result, it developed specialised expertise in manufacturing metal-based weapons over the centuries. The city's small-scale iron manufacturing was intertwined from its inception with the expertise of local craftspeople, namely the Lohars and Tarkhans, along with the Sikh Ramgarhias, who possessed similar metalworking and carpentry skills. Locally known as *mistri*, the groups had long been famous as technical innovators and had made their mark on Sialkot's trade scene through the centuries. They had a long-established reputation for making agricultural implements, household items and ironworks.

Research on the artisanal industry (Haynes 2012; Roy 2007) shows artisanal production was a phenomenon associated with smaller cities and towns. A large chunk of the ironworks was situated within Sialkot and its satellite localities of Gujranwala, Wazirabad, Nizamabad and Kotli Loharan. In these artisan localities there was a high level of geographical mobility (emigration) and trade activities. The case study of these localities provides a good opportunity to trace the development process of industrial clusters and to identify the factors affecting their transformation from traditional to modern sectors. A large cutlery industry cluster had developed in Nizamabad where around two hundred families of Lohars plied their craft in about twenty-five workshops, and products made here were sent all over India. In 1881, John Lockwood Kipling, then the Principal of Lahore's Mayo School of Art, described the Lohars of the locality as 'the better class of artisans'. Similarly, the nearby village of Kotli Loharan, about three miles northwest of the Sialkot cantonments, was famous beyond India for the ironwork of its artisans. These skilled artisans introduced innovations and supplied the artisanal goods all over the country and beyond. According to Kipling, 'The smiths or koftgars of Kotli-Loharan, near Sialkot, produce[d] a large quantity of caskets, shields, salvers, and other articles of ornament'. The articles manufactured in the village were found all over India and even in some parts of Europe. Kipling noted that the hawkers of Kotli Loharan were 'frequently seen in the streets of Calcutta and Bombay; and the writer is acquainted with one who has included Italy, France, and England in his travels'. The articles made of 'Kotli' found their way in 'considerable quantities to Europe and America' (Latifi 1911: 127-31).



Sialkot's early role as an emporium for artisanal manufactures left a strong imprint on the local culture of enterprise. It continued to influence the city's commercial life and resulted in its renewal as an industrial centre. Many of its 'unique' characteristics were in Chandavarkar's terms (2009), 'incidental' rather than 'generic'. Sialkot was immensely affected by the colonial impact in Punjab, as the city's strategic location led to the construction of one of the largest cantonments, the opening of the railways and the settlement of 'civil lines' for Europeans. While migrants were drawn to the city to construct and service the European population, this period was especially important in increasing the mobility, technical skills and capital of the local artisan communities through the development of the city. By the turn of the twentieth century, both Lohars and Tarkhans employed in Sialkot and Gujranwala combined numbered over 13,000 (Chattha 2011).

Given the *mistri*' traditional specialisation and initiatives in the ironworks and carpentry skills, it is not surprising that they were among the early pioneers of the surgical instruments and sports goods industry in Sialkot. How did this transition happen? The demands of Westerners and their styles of consumption provided a good opportunity for shifting from traditional to modern sectors. Sialkot's rapid urbanisation was intrinsically linked with the strong European presence in the civil lines and cantonments. In the immediate aftermath of the events of 1857, the number of European troops had increased in the city, along with the arrival of a large number of Western Christian missionaries. This led to rapid growth in commodities trading and the creation of new markets. In less than five years, with the construction of cantonments, the population of the Europeans exceeded 1,800 in the city, nearly half of them being civilians (Chattha 2011). In 1870, for the first time, some *mistri* of Sialkot repaired surgical instruments for the American Mission Hospital. Encouraged by the hospital staff, they gradually started manufacturing replicas of the originals, and subsequently, a new industry steadily grew in Sialkot. In a similar manner, a British missionary in the Sialkot cantonment went to a carpenter's shop and got a badminton racquet repaired for Rs 2. Afterwards, a swarm of imitators emerged, and the city hawkers started visiting all cantonments, near and far, and the British quarters, where they supplied and repaired sports goods.

While the actual stimulus for this manufacturing came from the Europeans and their styles of consumption, Sialkot's modern industries owed their emergence to the existing stock of the artisan classes. With time, they moulded their traditional skills and entered the newly emerging modern sports goods and surgical instruments industries. It was not until 1908 that Sarder Shiv Dew Singh founded Sialkot's surgical instrument sector. It initially was a scissors and small surgical equipment concern, which chiefly supplied 'private practitioners'. In 1911, another firm Uberoi Surgical Industry emerged, which employed foreign machinery and

Sheffield steel for the manufacture of its equipment (Latifi 1911: 234). These pioneer enterprises had significant influence both on acquiring industrial skills and the production of equipment. They started supplying surgical instruments to Missionary hospitals.

The big demand of orders during World War I for the British Indian Army was the catalyst for a significant expansion of clusters in Sialkot. This period saw the burgeoning prosperity of a set of artisan groups who adopted novel product lines with new forms of technology. In the time around twenty-six medium factories arose, which were producing surgical instruments annually worth Rs 3 million. After the war, Sialkot made instruments for export to all parts of the subcontinent, as well as to Burma, Afghanistan and Egypt. World War II brought further 'blessing for industry' and many new firms sprang up, as there was an industrial slump in the UK and the USA. On the eve of Partition, the annual export of the surgical instruments was worth Rs 5 million.<sup>8</sup> These industries were Hindu-owned, but they were destined to be taken over by Muslim artisans after the migration of Hindus and Sikhs in 1947.

The emergence of the modern sports goods industry owed itself to the Uberoi Brothers—Jhanda Singh and Sardar Ganda Singh—who in 1894 started manufacturing badminton and tennis racquets with only half a dozen workmen. With rising demand by the European population in the cantonments, production was expanded to include polo sticks, cricket bats, hockey sticks, footballs, golf clubs and apparatus for gymnastics. Alfred Marshall (1890) indicated the development of an industrial concentration dependent on available physical conditions (i.e. raw material resources and transport conditions). Sialkot benefited from its location at the intersection of the rivers of Chenab and Jhelum and the proximity to the states of Jammu and Kashmir and Chamba. The easy access to natural resources of timber was vital for the production of goods.<sup>9</sup> Sialkot's sports goods industry was the main consumer of the Kashmiri willow. The combined benefits of raw materials, technical labour resources and the naturally favourable climatic conditions ensured the continued growth of the city's modern sports goods industry.

The development of Sialkot's industry is markedly different from larger cities of Bombay and Ahmedabad where some of India's early composite textile industry sprang up in the 1850s (Ray 1992). Sialkot's industry grew out of small household workshops. It was competitively disadvantaged in technology, labour

---

<sup>8</sup>*Civil and Military Gazette* (Lahore) 25 November 1957, p. 3.

<sup>9</sup>Timber was also vital in the furniture-making trades, not only in Sialkot, but also in neighbouring towns. According to an estimate, during 1934–5, approximately 2,031,717 cubic feet of timber in logs and sawn form was annually floated down from the two states through the Chenab River into the Wazirabad Depot. The Punjab Government's Forest Department was earning Rs 18,000 in annual rafting fee from the trades.

quality and skills, access to credit and materials through official channels. 1911 was the first turning point in the development of Sialkot's sports goods industry, when Ganda Singh Uberoi for the first time imported the English willow, power machines, and English experts. By the end of that year, the Uberoi Limited started a system of apprenticeship, and under a European foreman, workmen were contracted and trained to follow English methods. They tested new innovations and experienced with new forms of technology and organisation. At first the workers were taken on for two months to judge their suitability, and were paid 4 *annas* a day. Their parents were then approached to agree that the boys could enter into a five year 'indentured contract'. They initially specialised in light work such as stitching balls, and as they improved, they were pushed into higher-grade work in the same line. In this way, a large number of workers obtained industrial skills that subsequently created a pooled market for the workforce with similar skills. Technical efficiency was certainly a critical factor behind the city becoming a seedbed of entrepreneurs and skilled workers.

The Uberoi, as the university of entrepreneurs, not only fostered the growth of a skilled workforce but also played a crucial role in encouraging entrepreneurship and supporting a culture of drive and thrift in Sialkot. From this pioneering enterprise, a number of spin-off entrepreneurs emerged who established their own firms while imitating what they learned from the Uberoi. The existing literature suggests that imitation is rampant in industrial clusters. In this way, an industrial cluster is formed, though the key to success depends on 'multifaceted innovations' (Snoden and Otsuka 2011: 5). The industrial training of Sialkot's workforce at the Uberoi was certainly an advantage over the neighbouring towns such as Wazirabad and Gujranwala.

How did Sialkot's products expand to broader domestic and worldwide demand? The outbreak of the First World War stimulated the demand for Sialkot products because of the stoppage of the corresponding European industries. The buoyant market led to the emergence of some new firms and the mass entry of imitators. Soon there were some twenty new firms and numerous cottage industry dealers. Among others, the most famous firms were Ali Shabier's Ali Trading Sports and Kishan Chand's joint venture, the Phillips and Co. They were set up by workmen who had learnt their trade while working with the Uberoi. The latter was the only innovative enterprise, at that time, which employed power machines and the 'latest appliances' whose production capacity was so large that much larger orders could be fulfilled in a shorter period. By the end of the war, Sialkot had become the centre for sports goods. The city's products were exported to Japan, America, Australia, Africa, and other countries, chiefly within the British Empire, and the output of goods amounted to Rs 10 million in value annually (Chattha 2011).

Amidst rising world demand of the Sialkot products, the city was electrified in 1928, and within two years, it had supplied electric power to the leading industrial concerns. By the end of British rule, the surgical instruments and sports goods industry of Sialkot had become one of the most important export centres in India. In 1940, when the Governor of Punjab visited Sialkot for the War Fundraising purposes, he recorded that ‘Sialkot is an industrial city of considerable importance’. He hoped that the government’s ‘Supply Department’ would place orders from the town.<sup>10</sup> On the eve of Partition, in 1946, the average annual export value of the city’s industry stood at over Rs 35 million. Its products found their way throughout the empire, the USA and Europe. As have already noted, while Hindus owned the factories, Muslims supplied the skilled workforce. The city’s continued prosperity was badly hit by Partition. It took decades to overcome the 1947 depression. The economic dislocation, however, proved to be ephemeral. With the birth of Pakistan, a new chapter was opened in Sialkot’s development and it rebuilt itself as a new industrial city by shaping its clusters. But like the colonial era, it was to build on pre-existing skills and capital development to usher in a rapid period of economic growth. The government assistance in transforming and diversifying the local skill base and shaping the modern industry of the city was crucial.

### **GOVERNMENT ASSISTANCE FOR SIALKOT’S INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT**

The post-independence development of Sialkot was seen as central to the national interest because the city’s industrial clusters were regarded as important generators of both foreign exchange and employment. The state’s assistance in Sialkot’s industrial recovery was, therefore, speedier and more substantive than for any other city of Punjab. In early 1948, the Punjab Department of Industries surveyed ‘the special difficulties’ of small-scale manufacturers of sports goods and surgical instruments of Sialkot. In this survey, the main difficulties were pointed out concerning credit, industrial organisation, and power infrastructure. The department recommended to the Central Ministry of Commerce and Industry the necessity to take consistent measures to restore the city’s banking sector. In 1949, to help provide finance, the Small Scale and Cottage Industries Development Corporation was set up, with an authorised capital of Rs 5,000,000.<sup>11</sup> In April 1950, Pakistan National Bank was opened in Sialkot. In the ensuing year, five leading banks were operating in the city, including the Central Exchange Bank, Habib Bank

---

<sup>10</sup> Craik to Linlithgow, 19 February 1940, L. Carter (ed.), *Punjab Politics, 1940–1943: Strains of War* (Fortnightly Reports) (New Delhi: Manohar, 2005), p. 76.

<sup>11</sup> First Five Years of Pakistan, 1947–1952, File E1 (9), A 82 (2), p. 34, PSA.

and the Central Co-operative Bank, Sialkot. The latter agreed to advance long-term credit to small manufacturers engaged in the local industries. Besides, the Pakistan government persuaded the Bank of Turkey and Bank of Egypt to open their branches in Sialkot, as well.<sup>12</sup> The Punjab Board of Industries also persuaded the Pakistan Industrial Finance Corporation to relax its rules in favour of small-scale industries and to open a branch in Sialkot. The small-scale manufacturers and traders were granted loans at the rate of interest of 3 ¼ per cent annually and the repayment period of the loan was fixed at ten years.<sup>13</sup> Such monetary efforts helped considerably in solving the problem of credit, which was often the main problem of industrial enterprise. The manufacturers received assistance from the government in the form of tax reductions, issuing of import licences and subsidies. From 1951 onwards, sports goods were completely exempted from the sales tax and customs duty on the raw material. Freight charges were also reduced. Some measures were adapted to control the smuggling of semi-finished sports goods across the border.<sup>14</sup>

In 1951, the Export Promotion Bureau studied the export problems of Sialkot's sports goods industry and took some 'drastic actions' for the uplifting of production. It tried to solve the raw material problems by substituting 'Afghan willow' from the forests of Hazara and Swat for the 'Kashmiri willow'. A new willow was also introduced from the state plantations in Changa Manga and the NWFP.<sup>15</sup> The flexibility of the small manufacturers had been demonstrated immediately after 1947. For example, the Trumans Enterprise's speciality before Partition was shuttlecocks, but then it switched to making sports gloves, balls, and apparel because of supply problems with imported raw materials of goose feathers and cork used for the base of the shuttlecock. Similarly, the well-known firm Centre de Commerce shifted from manufacturing cricket bats and tennis rackets to wooden hockey sticks because of the unavailability of willow from Kashmir (Weiss 1991: 127).

The other raw material items were glue and nylon gut strings. They were mainly imported. A leading artisan of Sialkot was trained in gut manufacture in Japan.<sup>16</sup> Subsequently, the manufacturing of gut strings started locally and it proved 'as good as any foreign-made'. Some steps were also taken to standardise sinew gut manufacture to enable it to compete with the nylon gut. The availability of raw materials led not only to the mushrooming of small establishments but increased

---

<sup>12</sup> PLAD, from 29 February to 15 March 1952, Vol. III, p. 812.

<sup>13</sup> *Civil and Military Gazette* (Lahore) 22 December 1951, p. 5.

<sup>14</sup> PLAD, from 29 February to 15 March 1952, pp. 596–7.

<sup>15</sup> M. Anwar, 'Sialkot Strives for Trade Revival', *Civil and Military Gazette* (Lahore) 18 February 1950, p. 6.

<sup>16</sup> PLAD, from 29 February to 15 March 1952, pp. 596–7.

production as well. This fact, along with rising world demand, enabled the volume of exports in 1951 to exceed the 1947 figure by over 400 per cent.<sup>17</sup>

### **‘MADE IN SIALKOT’: A DRIVE TO PATRONAGE SPORTS GOODS**

The government adopted a variety of export-enhancing devices and schemes for the promotion of Sialkot’s goods. To provide adequate markets for the city’s products, the central government, while entering into trade pacts with other countries, took ‘special care’ to include sports goods as one of the important items of export. Intending to attract increased demand for the products in other countries, the State Bank of Pakistan increased the rate of a commission granted to the ‘lobbying agents in the foreign lands’. The United Kingdom Board of Trade was also successfully persuaded to raise the import quota of Pakistani sports goods by a substantial margin.<sup>18</sup> The government also publicised goods worldwide. In this regard, diplomatic and trade channels were used for ‘greater publicity’ in foreign countries. ‘Special Arrangements’ were made for the display of ‘Made in Sialkot’ goods at the British Industrial Fair in London, and other international, commercial, and industrial exhibitions in such cities as Lille, Milan, Izmir and Prague. A couple of American business magazines were also used for publicity. Sialkot’s industrialists were persuaded to open branches of their business offices in foreign countries, especially in London, which imported more than half of the output of the sports goods industry. By the early 1950s, one such office had already been established, while more were expected to open shortly thereafter.<sup>19</sup> In the ensuing years, a number of Sialkot firms opened overseas offices and entered into collaborative arrangements with overseas retailers.

In the economics literature, most studies attribute the quality upgrade to market competition and exportation (Cozzi 2007; Schmitz and Nadvi 1999). How did Sialkot upgrade its manufacturing industry to achieve competitiveness? The success of the city’s sports goods industry in the colonial era depended, firstly, on its low prices, and secondly, on the quality of its products. After 1947, the quality of sports products decreased considerably as per international requirements. Many international firms and buyers started complaining about sub-standard products. This became especially important when the city was facing fierce competition based around improvement in the quality of the products from Jalandhar. Quality control had become a very high priority in the government’s policies and incentives to meet the arising international requirements. To try to address this issue, in 1951, the government prepared a scheme for the registration of ‘bona fide manufacturers and exporters’. From March onwards, it became mandatory for the exporters of

<sup>17</sup> *Civil and Military Gazette* (Lahore) 26 July 1951, p. 3.

<sup>18</sup> PLAD, from 29 February to 15 March 1952, pp. 596–7.

<sup>19</sup> *Ibid.*

sports goods to register with the Punjab Department of Industries and certification of quality was required for export. This meant that only 'approved manufacturers' were allowed to export goods and were required to quote their registration number on consignments so that exporters responsible for 'malpractices' could be traced. The authorities also categorically warned of the cancellation of the registration of any exporter who was found 'guilty of supplying goods to foreign markets below standard'.<sup>20</sup> Other measures included the opening of a Development Centre for Standardization and a Metal Works Institution, for the enhancement of skills courses in the various manufacturing fields. The UK government was approached to provide a sum of Rs 500,000 for the purchase of modern electrical machinery.<sup>21</sup>

Government policy in terms of promoting the industry was very clear. Towards the end of the 1950s, and especially during the early 1960s, different Pakistani governments adopted a number of export-incentive schemes and bonus. The most important was the introduction of the Export Incentive Scheme in 1955. It encouraged the establishment of large industrial firms. At the time, three types of enterprises existed in Sialkot: the big establishments, generally geared to export; small manufacturers, who catered to the domestic market; and finally, numerous unregistered home-based units in the urban pockets and rural areas, which were usually run by family members. The first two groups produced finished products while the last group only produced parts.

In 1959, perhaps the most significant move was the Export Bonus Voucher Scheme, which stimulated new industrial entrepreneurs and exporters. Under the scheme, the exporters received a fixed percentage of their exports in terms of the entitlements to imports. They were entitled to receive the import entitlements to the extent of 20 per cent and 40 per cent, respectively, of their export proceeds. The government received the foreign exchange earnings, and, in turn, gave the exporting firms an additional percentage share from the hard currency transaction. The scheme encouraged firms to boost productivity by using their hard currency vouchers to import machinery. Such measures facilitated access to imported capital equipment and gave rise to a new class of small industrialists. The introduction of the new machinery not only increased production but its quality level as well. The economist Shahid Javed Burki (1974: 1132) has pointed out that the Bonus Voucher Scheme 'reduced the monopolistic profits of big industrial houses and ultimately resulted in the emergence of a large number of medium and small industrialists. These newcomers to the industrial sector were responsible for creating the now important Lahore-Lyallpur-Sialkot industrial triangle in the centre part of the country.'

---

<sup>20</sup> *Civil and Military Gazette* (Lahore) 26 July 1951, p. 3.

<sup>21</sup> *Ibid.*, 4 December 1956, p. 3.

By the end of the 1950s, Sialkot's traders had captured the most important foreign markets. The main market was the UK, with over 60 per cent of total export sales. In 1959, the overall value of the export of sports goods from Sialkot had grown to above Rs 14 million, but the city was to wait a decade more before it matched the 1946 export amount of Rs 30 million. This reveals the setback to the industry arising from Partition and the length of recovery time that was required, despite government assistance and the stock of local entrepreneurial skills. Loss of Hindu expertise and capital, the non-devaluation of the rupee, and most importantly, the shifting of former owners of Sialkot to establish a powerful rival in the Jalandhar-based business, were all important factors in this slow recovery. It also arose from infrastructural problems, which were the bane of all of Sialkot's post-independence industries, as elsewhere in West Punjab. Nevertheless, the achievements were by no means inconsiderable, given the huge problems arising from Partition. We shall now turn to the role of the local skilled population in this industrial recovery, as this has seldom been proven statistically. Special emphasis is placed on how they filled various niches left by the exodus of Hindus.

### **ECONOMIC MOBILITY OF LOCALS: FROM ARTISANS TO INDUSTRIALISTS**

A former trustee of the Uberoi Cooperative Society exclaimed during an interview, 'Who benefited from the migration of Hindus? Those who had got skill, experience, information, and family background... Look at the Sublime Industry [presently one of the most successful firms of Sialkot]... Father of the owner of this big enterprise had worked in the city's oldest firm the Uberoi Sports Goods.<sup>22</sup> At the very outset, Sialkot's industries were organised along cooperative lines of kinship and community. By the mid-1950s, about thirty co-operative societies had been established in the city.<sup>23</sup> They were formed on occupational grounds, corporate linkages, family networks and kinship basis.<sup>24</sup> Initially, working as the interlocutors, they filled the gap created by the departure of the Hindu middlemen. They supplied not only the raw materials to household manufacturers but also in return, arranged to export their finished and unfinished products. In this way, at the outset, small units survived without investing much capital.

While the co-operative society enterprises spread across a number of industries, they were most influential in the sports goods sector. The most important and largest were the Pakistan Sports Co-operative Industrial Society and the Uberoi

---

<sup>22</sup> Interview with Khalid Mahmud, Sialkot, 21 January 2007.

<sup>23</sup> Finance and Industry Minister, Chaudhary Nazir Ahmed Khan, to the Governor of Punjab, Sardar Abdul Rab Nishtar, 2 December 1949, (Ministry of Industries, Government of Pakistan), File No. 5, pp. 2-3, NDC.

<sup>24</sup> Uberoi Limited Record, Uberoi Co-operative Sports Society, (Uberoi Building, Paris Road, Sialkot).



Co-operative Sports Society. The former was the main source for procuring and supplying raw materials to small and home-based manufacturers at cheap rates. The latter mainly furnished the common arrangements for marketing. These societies not only gained credit on easy terms but were also granted export-import licences on a 'more liberal scale'.<sup>25</sup> The Central Co-operative Bank of Sialkot earmarked an amount of Rs 2,000,000 to advance loans at concessional rates. The society provided valuable marketing information and technical expertise for the small-scale producers in the period immediately following Partition.

In the 1960s, the Sialkot industry entered a new phase. Many concerns changed their ownership structures from cooperative-owned and joint liability units to private-owned family enterprises. Almost all the workers who had worked in the Uberoi opened up their own firms. Some succeeded in gaining access to credit and became joint-venture units. The reorganisation of these factories helped them enhance competitive capacities and enter global markets. Our informal interviews with the entrepreneurs in Sialkot attest to the importance of previous experience and kinship networks in establishing business activities in Sialkot (Chattha 2011). These findings are similar to the case of sports goods producers in Jalandhar, as highlighted earlier. In both cases, the workers' previous trading experience proved to be compatible with the economic expansion of the cities.

During the first decade after Partition, while a few newcomers entered the industries, the departure of Hindus, simultaneously, provided new opportunities for the population already associated with the industry. Indeed a new artisan-cum-industrial class had begun to gather considerable economic power during the 1950s and 1960s. As emerges from interviews, most of the owners of leading firms of Sialkot described the state's Export Bonus Voucher Scheme as the first major incentive for modern industrial development. In the 1970s and 1980s, further government patronages boosted the industry due to the establishment of joint ventures and transfer of technology.<sup>26</sup> In this period, some new communities such as Arains, Sheikhs, and Jats with no previous occupational experience and practical skills entered the industry. In the age of globalisation, as Sialkot and its industry grew, new forms of socio-economic cohesion rose and older practices of connotation dispersed as individuals competed in a new environment in response to shifting business trends and threats. At a time when the dynamics of the global economy are leaning more towards China, both Sialkot and Jalandhar are facing competition from Chinese producers using machine-stitched equipment.

---

<sup>25</sup> PLAD, from 29 February to 15 March 1952, pp. 596–7.

<sup>26</sup> On Sialkot's sports goods industrial development during the 1970s and 1980s see Weiss, *Culture, Class, and Development in Pakistan*, pp. 120-45.

## CONCLUSION

This comparative analysis adds to our knowledge of the aftermath of Partition regarding industrial development in Punjab's cities by contrasting the experiences of Sialkot and Jalandhar. The patterns of development highlight the dynamic character of artisanal manufacture in the cities. As the evidence shows, both cities experienced different sets of problems and opportunities in terms of their industrial growth. Sialkot had been the pioneering city for the production and promotion of surgical instruments and sports goods. The city because of its pre-existing economic base and entrepreneurial drive overcame the 1947 economic depression and handicap of proximity to a volatile international border, together with the emergence of an Indian economic competitor. In that sense, Sialkot can be viewed as a local model on how to overcome economic depletion. The evidence presented also shows that Jalandhar, by contrast, is a beneficiary of the Partition-related dislocation. One of the secrets of its success was a system of ethnic entrepreneurship in which refugee labour and entrepreneurs relied on trading experience and previously acquired skills and capital as well as on informal networks based on ties of kinship, caste and place of origin. Despite these inheritances and regenerations, the study has shown that the contemporary success of the two cities also depended on timely government action and financial assistance.

Jalandhar and Sialkot could be presented as 'gainers' from the 1947 events, as were the cities of Ludhiana and Lyallpur (Pippa 2008). In one way, Sialkot's experience of post-independence industrialisation stands in contrast with the experiences of these cities, not only in terms of export-led growth but also the dominant role of locals rather than migrants. Moreover, the city's development differs not only from other border towns as Amritsar (Talbot 2006), which have never fully overcome the handicaps of their new geographical location after Partition but also from larger cities of Bombay and Ahmedabad. The formerly dominant textile economics of the latter cities have shrunk (Prakash 2002), Sialkot's have flourished.

This study also explicates the demographic change at Partition as a means to economic affluence for the underprivileged communities, whether they were the artisan Lohars, or non-artisanal background caste groups, Ad-dharmi and Chamars. They saw an opportunity to take over as owners in the commercial situation or entrepreneurial vacuum, which was created in 1947. They utilised the pre-existing marketing network, experience, skills, capital and mobilised ethnic resources to their advantages. They also proved to be compatible with the economic diversification of the cities and in return gave rise to a new class of small industrialists. In many respects, the development model of Sialkot and Jalandhar could be presented as a benchmark for other cities and towns to follow.

\*\*\*\*\*

# **HISTORIOGRAPHY OF PARTITION OF INDIA: A CRITICAL APPRAISAL**

**Adnan Tariq**

Assistant Professor of History  
Government Islamia College, Civil Lines, Lahore.  
adnantariq@giccl.edu.pk

## **ABSTRACT**

Historiography of *Partition of India* has been a subject of a wide range of interpretations, approaches, and positions. Expressions of all those historiographical interpretations have their tilts according to the circumstances. That range could be classified under many thematic shifts and perspectives. This research paper attempts to study the various interpretations by different historians and writers. By doing this it brings into fore the shifts, every new position brought out. Those shifts would enable the thematic scheme of this article to indulge in the intellectual exercise to comprehend the *Partition of India* at a broader level. It would further be studied that how came the current exercise in partition historiography comprehends the partition in a far more plausible manner by ascertaining the particularities of that transformation, which still haunts the present situation in India and Pakistan in relevant aspects. Thus an effort is offered to critique the trends while elaborating them and then to evaluate the focused historiography of the scattered, subaltern, and marginal aspects of partition. In that way, this research tried to bring all the trends from the onset of partition to the current exercises in thematic integrity. The intended outcome is to bring out the new avenues stemming from the fault-lines of the current literature on the partition.

**Keywords:** Partition, India, Pakistan, Historiography, Violence,

## **INTRODUCTION:**

The partition of India in 1947 was an atrocious and appalling episode of sub-continental history because it resulted in the displacement of 12.5 million people in the former British Indian Empire and with an estimated loss of life near to one million. That mega incident had transformed the history and civilization of the whole of the Sub-continent more largely. The process and impact of that

historical transformation had been studied since then under a range of interpretations. Every school of historiography has tried to visit the partition of India according to a different frame of reference. Along with that many new positions and human dimensions have also tried to alter the conception of that mega incident.

In this described perspective, studying the partition of India would entail every single region or locality, ethnic aspect, religious grounds, communal position and communitarian perspective to conceive what was happened. Those particular experiences with confined definition had a few pertinent features based on its legacies of regional or localized socio-political frames to move in and manifest many outcomes of the partition. We see some major thematic shifts in the trends of historiography in the domain of partition studies. In that range, the first trend emerged due to the British official's conception about the process of partition. The second trend emerged with the commentaries on high politics involving partition strategies. Another theme evolved by the autobiographical position of many contemporary politicians active during the end game of the British Empire. Nationalistic aspirations from India and Pakistan paved the way for the official version of the Indian partition. Finally, academic pursuits played their intellectual contribution towards extending an understanding of that whole episode of partition. Thus we come across a comprehensive range of historiography in respect of producing the corpus of partition literature. Let us start with the exercise to differentiate the partition historiographies with shifts spanning over decades.

### **FIRST TREND: EARLIER GENRE OF PARTITION HISTORIOGRAPHY**

The first trend comprised those works which were the earlier genre comprising the memoirs and autobiographies produced by British officials and many of the Indian politicians focusing the *Haute politique*<sup>1</sup> had produced their memoirs which including the commentary on the communalism scene of India.<sup>2</sup> It is a known fact that British officials were very conservative while dealing the communal affairs which ultimately led to the partitioning the country. For instance, these works emphasize the neutrality of their responsibilities in the emergency conditions India had face during the tumults times of partition. Those works are not to provide such information which could help the modern-day historian to ascertain the actual happenings in the corridor of power. The major emphasis is on the

<sup>1</sup> Penderel Moon, *Divide and Quit: An Eye Witness Account of the Partition of India* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1960) Philips, C. H. and M. D. Wainright (eds.), *The Partition of India. Policies and Perspectives 1935-1947* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd, 1970).

<sup>2</sup> Alan Campbell-Johnson, *Mission with Mountbatten* (London: Robert Hale Limited, 1951), Hudson, *Great Divide* ((London: Hutchinson, 1969)); C.H. Philips and M.D. Wainright (eds.), *Struggle for Pakistan* (Karachi: University of Karachi, 1965); S. S. Pirzada (ed.), *Foundations of Pakistan: All-India Muslim League Documents, 1906-1947* (Karachi: National Publishing House, 1969-1970), Vol. 11.,

communalism posture adopted by the different rival communities. In that way of argument, their main focus is to put all blame on the indigenous forces for the violent happenings. However, their primary source value has been important.

### **SECOND TREND; SETTING OF NATIONALISTIC DIMENSION**

The second trend emerged with the writing of partition affairs from the indigenous perspective. That perspective varied from India to Pakistan's positions. Many of the politicians had written their memoirs about the partition of India.<sup>3</sup> That Pakistani perspective tagged with Pakistan Movement relied on that particular perspective in which both Indian National Congress and British Government were being seen on the same page and Muslims (not merely All India Muslims League) were depicted as the marginalized segment in the larger Indian political scene. In the same way from the Indian perspective, all onus was put on the Muslim League. In that very perspective, political and communal happening in each city and region was undermined by the communalistic posture, resulted in the weakening of the Indian freedom movement. This perspective blames Muslim Leagues for the start of communal violence in Bengal and Punjab. The Indian side had produced one side version about the violence of partition. This version deals only with the violence in west Punjab by Muslims.<sup>4</sup> The Pakistani version on the other side produces a few versions about the proactive role of the various non-Muslim organization and princely states highlighting the planned-conspiracy to annihilate Muslims.<sup>5</sup> There were some other books as well written by Urdu writers to compile the eyewitness accounts. Such as, *Murtaza Khan Maikush* had produced a book about the Muslims of East Punjab about the massacres they had faced in various parts of East Punjab including some princely states.<sup>6</sup>

### **THIRD TREND; STARTING OF ACADEMIC PURSUITS**

The Third trend was set in the sixties with academic pursuits. The publishing of the 'Transfer of Power' series had altered the previously held positions of the historians. New schools perpetuated by different historians of India and Pakistan. A new class of historians emerged on the scene with the expertise works with different angles. Now the region had centrality as a new theme in partition studies. The provinces of Bengal and Punjab has more attention as

<sup>3</sup> Ali, Chuadhari Muhammad. *Emergence Of Pakistan*. Lahore: Research Society Of Pakistan, 2012.

<sup>4</sup> There were many such book portraying the atrocities committed on the non-Muslims in west Punjab highlighted. S. Gurbachan Singh Talib, *Muslim League Attack on Sikhs and Hindus in the Punjab 1947* (New Delhi: Voice of India, first published in 1950, reprinted New Delhi, 1991); G. D. Khosla, *Stern Reckoning: A Survey of the Events of Leading Up to and Following the Partition of India* (First Published in 1949, New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1989; K.L. Gauba, *Inside Pakistan* (Delhi: Rajkamal Publication, 1948); Punjab Uprooted by J. Nanda, Hind kitab limited Bombay, 1948.

<sup>5</sup> *RSSS in The Punjab; A Note on the Sikh Plan; and Sikhs in Action*, printed and published by the Superintendent, Government Printing, West Punjab, Lahore, 1948.

<sup>6</sup> Murtaza Ahmad Khan Maikush, *Akhraj-e-Islam az Hind* (Lahore: Taj Company, 1948)

compared to the other regions due to their particular damage in both intensities and far-reaching impacts.

In this trend regarding partition, studies intend to include various subaltern human dimensions. This contemporary trend is evolving a scheme, focusing on the theme that partition was more than an accomplished episode and it still exists with huge margins to be explored. Those margins could be traced by tagging them with many categories such as gender, community, subaltern segment, cities, localities, and others. This trend had shifted the focus from the high politics to the impact of partition at the regional level. Thus much thought was made on the regional studies of the provinces of Bengal and Punjab. Nonetheless Sindh, Assam U.P. Tripura, etc also remained under the spotlight. For instance, Yasmeen Khan has studied the responses of the government and extremists to the incoming non-Muslims refugees in U.P. she talks about the ill-treatment and not welcoming response of the RSS and *Hindu Mahasabha* in U.P. to the incoming refugees.<sup>7</sup> However, the noteworthy point here is that those refugees were very different in terms of their ethnic and linguistic composition thus it was not unexpected to face such a level of dismal treatment. On the contrary, another research about the Hindu space in West Bengal in the wake of Bengalis refugees from the east part was also not a case of warm welcome. In that research, Romola Sanyal has explored the evolving hegemonic character, the Bengali refugees had adopted in the immediate course in the urban locale of the post-partition Calcutta. The writer tried to detect the struggling character adopted by those refugees from East Bengal in the urban environment of the Calcutta-locating a 'fault line' in a post-colonial urban center.<sup>8</sup>

Another important study, which is about the immigration influx in Tripura from east Bengal, is helpful to evaluate that particular dimension. That research explores the wide hospitality extended by the authorities of Tripura to the refugees. That study had focused more on the state and central government policies to rehabilitate those refugees. Thus, it was a kind of state version.<sup>9</sup> Sarah Ansari also explored the rehabilitation process in the wake of ethnic strife in Sindh among the

<sup>7</sup> Yasmeen Khan, *Arrival Impact of Partition refugees in Uttar Pradesh, 1947-52*, Contemporary South Asia, 12(4), December, 2003, 508-518.

<sup>8</sup> Hindu Space; *Urban dislocation in the post-partition Calcutta*. Romola Sanyal.

<sup>9</sup>The kings of Tripura was also very great patron of Bengali language and even the court language of Tripura was Bengali. All this favored the refugees from the east Bengal to utmost. Nevertheless, there was another factor, which had assisted their merging. Two factors encourage the influx of refugees into the state. First, there was no perceptible local resistance to the refugees and secondly a sizeable Bangla speaking community already living over there had helped a lot to rehabilitate those partition relate refugees in Tripura. That study had focused more on the state and central government policies to rehabilitate those refugees. Thus, it was a kind of state version. Even then, it entails many feature that how and confined area region could come up with the partition related displacement Gayatri Bhattacharyya, *Refugee's rehabilitation and its impact on the Tripura economy*, 1988 Omson publications New Delhi, 15.

Urdu-speaking migrants in Karachi and other parts of Sindh.<sup>10</sup> According to the writer, that settlement was quite chaotic, because of the lack of resources and appropriate system.<sup>11</sup> She has not mentioned the experience of Punjab.<sup>12</sup>

Another acclaimed historian Gyanendra Pandey examines that an episode of violence was not an outcome of immediate wrong calculations; rather it had involved complicated affairs from all occupations. Starting from the dealings of high politics, the writer investigates deep into the complex of the communal syndrome.<sup>13</sup> From that generalized theorization to the localized specialization, Ishtiaq Ahmad has produced a monograph on the character of violence with its outcome in the city of Lahore. That work intends to produce a theory to understand the violence in Lahore with the applied theory of ethnic cleansing with modifications.<sup>14</sup> Urvashi Butalia had compiled a book, setting the way for many others to dare on the same.<sup>15</sup> This book contains much valuable and important regarding the literature on Partition. The scope of this book limits only to Punjab. Women writers of India partition is another such attempt to present the finest write-ups about the literary expressions by women writers in the feminist discourse.<sup>16</sup> Community suffering and their role in development also considered an innovative dimension in that trend.<sup>17</sup> For instance, a study conducted for those Punjabi migrants settled in Post-Partition Delhi.<sup>18</sup> The state authorities assisted their settlement in Delhi but the real credit for their successful settlement owed to the long-run effort they had produced. Their stories did not only describe the individual's success but also provide in-depth assessment of their readjustment in the new society with all the insecurities and hurdles from the locals of Delhi. In that perspective role of different hostile elements and negligence by state authorities also got ample space for the comprehensive understanding of the contemporary

<sup>10</sup> Sarah Ansari, *Life After Partition: Migration, Community and Strife in Sindh 1947-1962* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2005)

<sup>11</sup> Ibid.

<sup>12</sup> Mohammad Waseem, 'Muslim Migration from East Punjab: Patterns of Settlement and Assimilation', in Ian Talbot and Shinder Thandi (eds.), *People on the Move: Punjabi Colonial and Post-Colonial Migration* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2004), 63-77.

<sup>13</sup> His works primarily focus on genocidal violence by seeking to investigate the violent foundations of partition, communal background, ethnic cleansing, cross migration, and their interaction to formulate the genesis of both nation states-India and Pakistan. Gyanendra Pandey, *Remembering Partition: Violence, Nationalism and History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), 45-6.

<sup>14</sup> Ishtiaq Ahmad, *Forced Migration and Ethnic Cleansing in Lahore in 1947*, in Ian Tolbot, 'Partition and the Region', (Karachi; Oxford University Press, 2002),

<sup>15</sup> Urvashi Butalia, *The Other Side of Silence: Voices from the Partition of India* (New Delhi: Penguin

<sup>16</sup> R. Menon and K. Bhasin, *Borders and Boundaries: Women in India's Partition* (New Delhi: Sage Publications, 1998), 57

<sup>17</sup> R. Menon and K. Bhasin, *Borders and Boundaries: Women in India's Partition* (New Delhi: Sage Publications, 1998), 31-32.

<sup>18</sup> Ravinder Kaur, *Since 1947: Partition and Punjabi Migrants of Delhi* (OUP India (12 January 2007)



frame. This type of studies also digs out the real background of the façade, state version developed while presenting the partition management. The *Long Partition and the Making of Modern South Asia: Refugees, Boundaries, Histories* are another important work produced by Wazira Fazila-Yaqoob Ali Zamindar. This work is about the displaced communities in the cities of Karachi and Delhi.<sup>19</sup> With the help of ethnographical material scattered stories of the people migrating to and from Karachi and Delhi with their experiences of Partition. By taking these communities as an ethnographic subjects, Zamindar places a potentially marginalized history at the center of her text and the heart of the narrative of nation-state creation, complicating any automatic or easy assumptions about Indian or Pakistani citizenship. Zamindar seems to be of the suggestive arguments that the nature of the partition is not confined to the violence and genocidal incidents rather it has some other crucial and defining features. Her book shows that bureaucratic violence has also put its role in making the helm of affairs more and more complicated for the incoming migrants from across the border and thus ultimately draws political boundaries.

Iqbal Chawla occupies a prominent place in the latest contribution while challenging some of the stereotypes of the historiographies of Partition of India. In one of his articles on the role of Mountbatten, he lamented on the orthodox and conservative position adopted by many of the schools of historiographers.<sup>20</sup> He maintains that the violence as the biggest stigma of partition was not the sole responsibility of the higher authorities including, particularly Mountbatten. In his well-researched opinion, it was the already existed genesis of polices supplemented with other factors that resulted in the broad-based malfunction, for which Mountbatten is blamed. Thus, his research would open the closed avenues for the future course of historicizing partition violence. Another research by Prof. Chawla investigates the real dynamics of the violence.<sup>21</sup> That article is first of its kind in the domain of historiography of partition violence as it challenged the stereotype of blaming the British authorities as to the main responsible for the eruption of the violence. The masterstroke of that article would bring a completely significant and innovative exercise to study the violence in its perspective of dynamics. Thus, this article invites the new attention of the modern reader of the partition towards studying the partition in a completely new paradigm.

---

<sup>19</sup> Wazira Fazila-YaqoobAli-Zamindar, *The Long Partition and the Making of Modern South Asia: Refugees, Boundaries, Histories*(Karachi,OUP,2009)

<sup>20</sup>Muhammad Iqbal Chawla Mountbatten's Response to the Communal Riots in the Punjab, 20March to 15 August 1947: An Overview. Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society, Available on CJO 2016 oi:10.1017/S1356186316000225

<sup>21</sup>The Punjab Disturbances of 1946-47: Revisited,Prof Dr. Muhammad Iqbal Chawla, Journal of Applied Environmental and Biological Sciences, 4(9S)1-6, 2014

#### FOURTH TREND: REVISIONISM STARTED

A new scheme emerged in the same progression by the turn of the twentieth century. That is about the specialized studies over the different aspects of the partition of India. This is about bringing more focused attention to various aspects of partition. Those aspects could be gender, community, city, or locality with limited definitional parameters as in the case of the Locality as a defined scope to investigate specified transformation with specified dynamics and impacts. The locality is the in-fashion focal theme entered in the realm of partition studies. It is indeed a theory incorporated in many studies with various modifications; ranging from the requirement of the hypothetical limitation and discipline subjectivity.<sup>22</sup> Acclaimed academic Tai Yong Tan and Gyanesh Kudaisya introduced this trend by incorporating the capital cities of united India hit by partition violence. They had examined the experiences of different cities through the consideration of the impact of partition on South Asian capital cities. We also see the various shifts in the style and thematic approaches of those works. For instance, Ian Talbot in his landmark book has presented a comparative case study of adjoining cities of Lahore and Amritsar. That effort is far more detailed as it is the study of the processes of violence, migration, and resettlement arising from the partition of the subcontinent in 1947.<sup>23</sup> This work highlights how communalism in Lahore germinated a bloody wave of genocide and communities in Lahore had to go through the worst wave of violent incidents. It also sheds light on the future development of Lahore in the post-partition scenario.

The Ganesh Kudisyia and Tan Tai young initiated the concept of locality into that domain and Ian Talbot had come up with the comparative study of the Amritsar and Lahore. On the same research design, Pippa Virdee had presented her comparative study of the Ludhiana and Lyallpur with far more exploration in the theoretical domain of that scholarship. Ilyas Chatha also developed his acclaimed works on the Sialkot and Gujranwala keeping the locality concept in the pivot of his dissertation. The study by Chatha has explored those aspects, a locality was supposed to move on. The transition of partition had amplified that graduation in its own rapid and haphazard way. Somehow, there were some retrospective legacies in that altered change connected with the pre-partition fabric of that locality. The writer laid his emphasis on the factual pieces of history that Muslim perpetrators were all responsible for the atrocities committed against non-Muslims.

---

<sup>22</sup>Chatha, Ilyas, *Partition and Locality; Violence, Migration and Development in Gujranwala and Sialkot:1947-1961*.(Karachi,OUP,2011)

<sup>23</sup>Ian Talbot, *Divided Cities: Partition and its aftermath in Lahore and Amritsar 1947-1957* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2006).

### **FIFTH TREND; STUDYING VIOLENCE WITH LOCALIZED APPROACHES.**

So far, we had various studies of those violent experiences in different places. Many of those studies are up to the acclaimed theoretical level, providing and well-connected understanding of that violence phenomenon. There is, however, generalization in those studies. For instance such studies have their bases on the generalized paradigms, all works evolve their theoretical frameworks to study partition violence. Nevertheless, all works had limitations of stretching those theories either all India level or to the regional level in a very categorical way. Its generalization was across the Indian regions. From the North-Western Provinces to the Tamil Nadu, Kerala and Assam were also hit according to their low-level communal precedents, with a wide degree of difference in intensity. Violence was a national problem thus generalized depiction is justified. Nevertheless, we see the trickling down to the regions and it was different even from its next regional counterpart. Apart from the socio-politics, there were many indigenous behaviors, corresponding with the larger Indian communal claims, but still having their indigenous functions to activate into the pre-decided course—violence against the rival community. Those indigenous behaviors need to be out into clear and defined identification to make an understanding of the violence in this own spatial frame.

There are four major differences, which should have been on major consideration while making any study over the violence during partition. First is about the spatial /regional variation, which manifests the conspicuously different character of violence. The second is about the type of violence that whether it was riots or one-side acts of ethnic cleansing or massacre. There were again spatial variations regarding the occurrence of violence. There were many episodes where riots had turned into one-side acts of violence passing through different phases. The third is about the retributive genocide as propounded by Paul Brass with a slight effort of difference. The trains' massacres in east Punjab had provided a new meaning to those transforming character of violence. The fourth difference is about the difference between organized violence and spontaneous acts of violence.

These talked about difference would fall in the domain of each defined area that could be provincial, divisional, and district level. Also, at another level, it could vary from geographical landscape such as the difference between the Shimla Hill States and other parts of British east Punjab. Princely states of Punjab have shown its required form of violence due to the huge Sikh majority in those states. The Pothohar Plateau had shown quite different forms of violence. The massacres in Kahuta and Pir Suhawa villages were occurred due to the deep-rooted antagonism and arranged by the war veterans. It was the landscape where Muslims and non-Muslims villages were stated long each other on separate lines for centuries. In south Punjab, we can see the only examples of organized raids on non-Muslims

raids. The Muslims of Dera Jaats conducted those raids. In central Punjab, the violence was more or less urban terrorism, comprising random street stabbing and arson. Urban terrorism was aimed at creating enough panicky to force non-Muslim to leave those areas. The strategy was successful at the maximum level. We hardly found any account of the dead bodies found in the burnt houses. All the houses in the arson-hit areas were empty already.

Those urban parts of central Punjab had not seen that fatalistic trends of violence in which the number of killings could have gone to a horrendous level. By late July, the death toll for the whole of Punjab was not to cross the figures of 4632 in total.<sup>24</sup> However, in the later period, particularly after the Radcliff award, the numbers of the killing went on the extraordinary rise. Those figures were from two lacs of conservative level goes to the level of one million roughly. The reasons behind that leap rise fall in the category of different nature. It is no doubt that the large category of all that was happening fits into the generalized category depicting violence. Nevertheless, there are many other concepts, which could be supplementary but still important. One such aspect is the situation in the Princely States. In those princely states massacres occurred in which the number s of killing was far greater than the other parts. Those massacres could not be put simply in the same bracket with the other generalized depiction of partition riots. Thus, a question emerged hat how came that horrendous scale of later violence is falls in the theorization of retributive genocide. It is not a simple chain reaction involving one incident proactively and counterpoising others reactively. Because conversion of that reactive act into a new proactive affair causing ultimately into a chain. The larger national political development was causing enough communal antagonism, which had delegated sufficient instigator as sloganeering. There was no specific need for the retribution. If that assertion granted the recognition, then it could be replaced with the localized dynamics in socio-politics involving economic interests to cast an immediate factor to move the things in the pre-realized course of the incidents.

There were certain fault lines both in the theory and in its critique. Such as, Paul Brass was talking about the retribution genocide on the bases of Evan Jenkins's three phases of violence in Punjab and other source-full studies.<sup>25</sup> He was coming up with major fault lines of the gaps of the 'later-on-phases' of violence that could not be substantiated in his theory when relying majorly on the phases. Those phases were drawn at the end of July when the figures were lesser than five

---

<sup>24</sup>Jenkins to Mountbatten, Governor House, Lahore, August 4,1947, IOR, L/PO/6/123.

<sup>25</sup> Paul Brass, 'The Partition of India and Retributive Genocide in the Punjab, 1946-1947: Means, Methods, and Purposes', in Talbot, Ian. *The Independence of India and Pakistan:New Approaches and Reflections*.Karachi:OUP, 2006),71-101.

thousand.<sup>26</sup> Another theoretical fault line talks about the retribution on the same level involving every partisan group. However, the differentiated forms of violence, which were just elaborated at the start of this part, were not sufficiently justifying the violence with real footing. Rather they produce varying degrees in respect of territory and locality. In that regard, the authorities' role and character were also of deep influential nature. That role had played somewhere detrimental and somewhere they could not perform according to their job due to the circumstantial difference.

Another point on which those assertion blaming those who executed the *Pothohar* massacre in the Rawalpindi region was that no Muslim League leader had condemned that incident. That silence had sent a strong message to those culprits that 'guilty had no punishment.' It was the major strong statement that had unleashed the chain of bloodshed in the whole of Punjab. Ian Talbot had also of the opinion that due to the non-condemnation by the Muslims league the communal powder-keg of Punjab had started to get inflamed which lasted to all the followed episodes of partitioning Punjab and of bloodshed on the horrendous level.<sup>27</sup> That thesis is very power full and needs very careful effort to criticize. Nevertheless, at the same time, it is also another point that the correspondence of that statement could only supplement many of the other places in Punjab. It could have a national level strong repercussions but how come all the places in Punjab, having their social-dynamics could be influenced by that statement as an instigator. This is not a kind of critique of that very statement. However, it will facilitate to indulge academically, in the effort to dig out the internal dynamics of the locality in respect of the socio-political complexion and desires, different classes could exhibit with communal identification.<sup>28</sup> That scheme would be helpful to understand the social sources of the violence. In that very proposed scheme, mob formation and resultant acts of violence could be an important cohesive theme to study in detail. The urban violence as a distinct category could further be studied according to the locality difference. Such as the continuance of riots in Amritsar until late July, while Lahore had ended riots on 11 of March. After that date, no riots occurred in Lahore. It was a major difference which needs to be studied as it would set many layers of understanding the localized purpose basing on types of violence. Gurgaon and Delhi had seen many raids by the organized raiders from the surrounding rural areas

---

<sup>26</sup> Jenkins to Mountbatten, Governor House, Lahore, August 4, 1947, (IOR)L/PO/6/123.

<sup>27</sup> Interview with Ian Talbot on 6 September, 2015. Southampton, UK. I am very thankful to Prof. Ian Talbot for this time and precious advice along with many intelligent insights about my works.

<sup>28</sup> Swarna Aiyar, '*August Anarchy: The Partition Massacres in Punjab 1947*', South Asia, South Asia, Vol. XVIII, Special issue, (1995): 13-36.

of their cities.<sup>29</sup> While Lahore had not seen such types of aids. There were many massacres even in Wes Punjab but there were no major massacres in Lahore except one or two, which were also debatable due to definitional problems.

To study that violence happening in phases needs to be categorized into the dissected form of research. For instance, Ilyas Chatha had studied the role of blacksmith in violence against non-Muslims in Gujranwala.<sup>30</sup> That is an important dimension, which clear many ambiguities to understand the culprits in their community perspective with stake and opportunity. It could be applied in Lahore on various clans with far more clarity. This method could revolve many detailed dimensions behind the violence. In the same line of study, it soul also be studied that those groups had also participated in the acquiring of social spaces in the backdrop of violence. Their role in nexus with localities dignitaries, *Pehehwans*, and officials from Magistracy and police would also facilitate ascertaining the local-political motives behind the complete purgation of the non-Muslims from the city of Lahore. Deputy Commissioner of Lahore John Eustace had written a detailed report to Lord Mountbatten in which he stated that the crowd in Lahore was imbibing very peculiar mob psychology needed to be studied as a Ph.D. research. "It has been most interesting work: anyone doing a thesis on mob or mass psychology could have got his doctorate"<sup>31</sup> Thus, the interlinking of crowd and landscape emerged in our study as an important starting concept in local studies.<sup>32</sup> This theme is applied through linking those local dynamics including the localized forms of division of labor, residents, and commercial premise.<sup>33</sup> In that defined framework, our study needs to substantiate various arguments regarding violence relying on the local historical social sources, the study moves from the pre-partition public euphoria, with its desire to alter it accordingly, to the capitalizing of that desire.

---

<sup>29</sup> In the later July governor Punjab Jenkins had reported that many armed villagers around Delhi and Gurgaon had attacked on Gurgaon and were reported many cases of theft and violence. (IOR)R,3/1/90, Extract from Governor Punjab to Viceroy, Lahore. 14 July, 1947.

<sup>30</sup> The Lohars of the region with the connivance of local railway staff systematically carried out violence. In many instances, hamlahawars (attackers/raiders) had purpose and meaning, though they rationalized their activities in terms of the attacks in East Punjab by killing Hindus and Sikhs and to expelling them from their property. They carried out the attacks with impunity because of the breakdown of government authority. see Ilyas Chatha, *Partition and Localities*, 134.

<sup>31</sup> , John Eustace to George Abell. Deputy Commissioner Office, Lahore, 29 July 1947. (IOR) R/3/1/91.

<sup>32</sup> Doing Irish Local History, P J Duffy.

<sup>33</sup> K R Cox, Department of Geography, Ohio State University, Columbus, USA ; A Mair, Institute for Urban and Regional Planning, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, 3030 Heverlee, Belgium; Faculty of Economic and Social Sciences, Université de Lille I, 59650 Villeneuve d'Ascq, France

## CONCLUSION

It was all about a discursive practice. That was to introduce the existing discourse of historiography of partition with all of its possible contours. Having critically analyzed the different understandings by historians about the partition of India in a larger historical perspective, our study explores the various fault lines found in the margins of all positions. By identifying that faultiness our study substantiated the broader argument that all those trends are important markers towards conceiving a comprehensive outlook of the partition of India in the tapestry of ideas, approaches, and themes. It is studied that nationalistic aspirations, communal approaches, conservative vision, autobiographical accounts all had their share in the broader corpus of partition literature. Therefore an all-encompassing glance towards the polemical positions on plural bases is essential to formulate the current pre-requisite for understanding the partition incident. Those pre-requisites exercise has enough potential for the opening of new horizons in the discipline of historiography while extending new observations on the partition of India isa far broader level; by excluding maximum of biases in scholarship. This study is a small claim to burgeon the scholarly strength in the partition studies.

---

# **FARAIZI MOVEMENT: *IMPRESSIONS ON MUSLIM DECLINE***

**Dr. Rizwan Ullah Kokab\***

Associate Professor/Chairman  
Department of History and Pakistan Studies,  
Government College University, Faisalabad.  
[rizwankokab@hotmail.com](mailto:rizwankokab@hotmail.com),

## **Abstract:**

Faraidi Movement started in the last phase of Mughal rule. It was a period when the Mughal Emperor was ruling over India in name only and the East India Company was extending its rule in all parts of South Asia. The Faraidi Movement was raised in Bengal, the area from where the British had started to occupy India. The Muslims of this area was feeling the changing conditions of the time more than those of other areas. The movement was founded by Haji Shariatullah in 1818 and carried on its activities in the area of Bengal for more than one century. Having examined the Faraidis in the framework of a movement, this study is directed to discover how Faraidi Movement did percept the conditions of Muslim Bengal as a situation of decline; where did the leaders of the movement find the roots of that decline; what corrections were suggested; and what efforts were rendered to resolve the decline of Muslims. The paper highlights that Faraidis, thinking the remoteness of Muslims from the observance of basic duties of Islam and suppression oppression of landlords as major causes of Muslim decline, tried to check this decline by social and economic reforms and militant struggle against the oppressors.

**KEYWORDS:** Faraidi movement, Abu Hanifa, Bengal, India, Shariat, Muslims, Brahmin, British,

---

\* The author is Associate Professor and Chairman, Department of History and Pakistan Studies, Government College University, Faisalabad. [rizwankokab@hotmail.com](mailto:rizwankokab@hotmail.com), [rizwankokab@gcu.edu.pk](mailto:rizwankokab@gcu.edu.pk). The paper is derived from the M.Phil. Thesis of the author that was temporarily published with VDM, Germany.



## LITERATURE REVIEW

Faraidi Movement is a movement that has largely been paid less attention by scholars. A few books written particularly on the Movement are available. Two of them are with the titles *Faraidi Movement in Bengal* by Muin-ud-Din Ahmad Khan and *History of Faraidi Movement* by Muin-ud-Din Ahmad. In these balanced research works, the authors have worked hard for the collection and analysis of the origin of the leaders and activities of the Movement. The teachings and ideas of the Movement have been mentioned in comparison with the ideas of other contemporary movements.

The paucity of material on Faraidi movement is reflected from the fact that not a single book attributed to Haji Shariatullah or Dudu Miyan is available. Muin-ud-Din Ahmad Khan, in his study *Faraidi Movement*, has given a detailed description of the sources about Faraidis which he consulted. He mentioned not even a single treatise produced by the main leaders of Faraidis. He based his study on the tomb inscription of Haji Shariatullah, a letter giving power of legal attorney, a *fatwa* on the unlawfulness of holding congregational prayers of *Juma* and *'Id*, and two this (a sort of poetry). He also consulted one book "Muslim Ratnahar" by Wazir Ali, being a sketch of the life and career of the Faraidi leaders. The other biography of Shariatullah is that written by Munshi Abd al-Halim. The ideas of the Faraidis are known either by the records of their opponents or through traditions and poetry. A researcher never finds the books written by the leaders of the movement, which may help him to form an idea about the Faraidi Movement.

There are many obvious reasons for this lack of primary source material. Faraidi leaders led a practical life. They did not pay much attention to writing. The backwardness of their focus area and disturbed conditions also played a role in persuading them to limit themselves only to verbal preaching. Moreover, their target people were illiterate and written literature was not useful for the activities of the movement. These factors leave a historian of Faraidis in a position in which he cannot find any substantial first-hand material on Faraidis. It is also a fact that Faraidi movement has been paid much less attention than other movements.

## INTRODUCTION OF MOVEMENT

The founder of Faraidi Movement, Haji Shariatullah, was born at an uncertain date in a humble family in the pargana of Bandarkhwla, a district of Faridpur (East Bengal).<sup>1</sup> His father and mother died at an early age and he was

---

<sup>1</sup>*Encyclopedia of Islam*, 3rd ed., s.v. "Faraidi Movement," by C. E. Boseworth; Murray T. Titus, *Islam in India and Pakistan* (Karachi: Oriental Book Reprint Corporation, 1990), 186.

entrusted to his uncle Ashiq Miyan. Taking his wife and the boy Shariatullah with him, his uncle set out for the district of Bakarganj in a small sailboat. On the way, they met a boat disaster in which both his uncle and aunt were drowned, while Shariatullah escaped death by dint of good luck.

This sudden calamity struck so deep in Shariatullah's mind that he gave up all intention to go home; rather he proceeded to Calcutta and presented himself before his old teacher Maulana Basharat Ali. The Maulana at that time had got disgusted with the British regime and decided to immigrate to the holy city of Mecca. The boy Shariatullah also accompanied him. They set out for Arabia about A.D 1799. Scholars differ widely in describing the chronology of Shariatullah's later life, though all contemporary and later writers agree that he undertook the journey to Mecca at the age of 18 and returned to Bengal after an absence of 20 years<sup>2</sup>.

Haji Shariatullah took the best advantage of his stay in Makkah (1799 to 1818). Hidayat Hussein testifies that he came back as a good Arabic scholar and a skillful arguer.<sup>3</sup> His stay in Arabia can be divided into the following three phases. In the 1<sup>st</sup> phase, he spent the initial two years in the residence of Maulana Murad, a Bengali domiciled at Mecca, and studied Arabic literature and Islamic jurisprudence under the Maulana.

During the second phase, which lasted for 14 years, he received guidance from Tahir Sumbal, who was either a Hanafi jurist<sup>4</sup> or a Shafai scholar<sup>5</sup> but who, according to the Faraidis, was reputed for his scholasticism as Abu Hanifa the junior. Haji Shariat Ullah was also initiated into the *Qadiri* order of Sufism. In the third phase, Haji Shariatullah busied himself in the famous University of Al-Azhar at Cairo. It is not known whether he attended any regular course at Al-Azhar; he is said to have spent long hours at the library. He returned to Mecca and paying a short visit to Medina decided to return to Bengal.<sup>6</sup>

On return to India, in 1818 A.D after an absence of about twenty years, Haji began quietly to promulgate his newly formed doctrines in the villages of his native district. Although he encountered much opposition and abuse, he succeeded in

---

<sup>2</sup>*Encyclopedia of Islam*, s.v. "Faraidi Movement."

<sup>3</sup>*Encyclopedia of Islam*, 1st ed., s.v. "Faraidi," by Hidayat Hosain.

<sup>4</sup> Ahmad, *Faraidi Movement* (Karachi: Pakistan Historical Society, 1965), 3-7.

<sup>5</sup>*Encyclopedia of Islam*, 3rd ed., s.v. "Faraidiyya," by A. Bausani.

<sup>6</sup> Ahmad, 3-7

gathering around him a body of devoted followers<sup>7</sup> and launched a reform movement, which mainly attracted the lower classes of Muslims in Bengal.<sup>8</sup>

Haji Shariatullah was a man of struggle and keen foresight and knew well how to steer his movement clean through political intrigues and temptation. He had a strong but amiable personality. According to James Wise, he was a man of middle height, of fair complexion, and wore a long and handsome beard.<sup>9</sup> He possessed a stout and robust health, and usually covered his head with “a voluminous turban.”<sup>10</sup> In short Haji Shariatullah, from the platform of Faraidi Movement, was the first preacher to denounce the superstitions and corrupt beliefs, which long contact with Hindu polytheism, had developed.

To rouse the apathetic and careless Bengali peasant was not an easy task. To effect, this required a sincere and sympathetic preacher; and no one ever appealed more strongly to the sympathies of Bengali people than Shariatullah, whose blameless and exemplary life was admired by his countrymen, who venerated him as a father able to advise them in times of adversity, and gave consolation in cases of affliction.<sup>11</sup> He died at his native village Shamail in AD 1840 at the age of 59 and was buried at the backyard of his residence, which was, however, washed away by the river Arialkhan (Padma) not very long after his death, leaving only the tomb inscription.<sup>12</sup>

The leader of the Faraidi Movement after Haji Shariatullah was his only son, Muhsin al-Din Ahmad, alias Dudu Miyan (1819-60). He has been regarded by some as a co-founder of the Faraidi Movement. He was born in 1819<sup>13</sup>, at Mulfatganj then a *thana* in the Madaripur subdivision of Bakarganj district, which was transferred later to the district of Faridpur.

Although a less accomplished scholar than his father, Dudu Miyan played a role in the history of the Faraidi Movement, which was second to none. Rather in certain respects, he even excelled his father notably in organizing the Faraidi brotherhood into a well-knit and powerful society. The energetic and dashing career of Dudu Miyan from A.D. 1838 to 1857, struck awe and terror in the mind of his

---

<sup>7</sup>Burhan Ahmad Faruqi, *The Mujaddad's Concept of Tauhid* (Lahore: n.p. 1989), 7. The date of his return to Bengal varies in the different sources, which give it as 1807, 1822 or 1828, while certain writers affirm that he made two journeys to Mecca, returning home to his country in the interval. See *Encyclopedia of Islam*, “Faraidiyya.”; Titus, *Islam*, 186-187.

<sup>8</sup>*Encyclopedia of Islam*, s.v. “Faraidi Movement.”

<sup>9</sup>James Wise, *Eastern Bengal*, 23.

<sup>10</sup>Ahmad, *Faraidi Movement*, 21.

<sup>11</sup>Titus, *Islam in India and Pakistan*, 186-187; Azizur Rahman Mallick, *British Policy and the Muslims in Bengal 1757-1856* (Dacca: Asiatic Society of Pakistan, 1961), 71.

<sup>12</sup>*Ibid.*, 2.

<sup>13</sup>*Ibid.*, 187.

enemies and brought relief to his friends and followers. The popular imagination was replete with his adventurous exploits against the oppressive landlords and indigo-planters.<sup>14</sup>

Dudu Miyan's early life passed smoothly under the immediate care of his father, who made provisions for his education at home in Arabic and Persian languages. After he had acquired some proficiency in this elementary education, he was sent to Mecca.<sup>15</sup> As to his activities at Mecca and the duration of his stay there, we have no reliable source of information. He returned to Bengal after an absence of 5 years. The government sources mention him for the first time in 1838 A.D., as disturbing the peace of Faridpur.<sup>16</sup> This indicates that he had returned sometimes earlier.

Thereafter, Haji Shariatullah kept Dudu Miyan in his company and gave him lessons in higher studies. Towards the end of Haji Shariatullah's life, Faraidis faced the conflict with the Hindu zamindars. To resist them, fighting men were needed. Haji Shariatullah had assigned Jalal-ud-Din Mullah of Faridpur to collect clubmen. Dudu Miyan, on his return from Makkah, joined hands with Jalal-ud-Din Mullah in organizing clubmen's exercises. He appears to have proved more capable in this practical field of the movement than in the field of acquisition of theoretical knowledge.<sup>17</sup>

Dudu Miyan was a handsome and tall person with dark flowing beards. He wore a large turban on his head. British officials accused him of various criminal acts. However, the fact that till the very last his followers did not desert him and remained faithful to his leadership testify to his noble character. The British, nevertheless, tried, convicted, and imprisoned him on the charge of forcibly carrying off a Brahmin girl. In 1857 he was removed to Calcutta and kept in custody there until the close of the great upheaval. His followers, however, believed in him to the last and liberally spent their hard-earned savings in promoting the interest of the movement.<sup>18</sup> He died at Dacca in 1268 A.D.<sup>19</sup>

The banner of the Faraidi Movement, after Dudu Miyan, was raised by his second son, Abd al-Ghafur *alias* Naya Miyan. He was born in A.D. 1852, at Bahadurpur. Naya Miyan's education started under his father. It must, however, be recalled that Dudu Miyan was imprisoned in A.D. 1857 at the 5<sup>th</sup> year of Naya

---

<sup>14</sup> Ahmad, *Faraidi Movement*, 23.

<sup>15</sup> *Encyclopedia of Islam*, s.v. "Faraidi,"

<sup>16</sup> James Wise, *Eastern Bengal*, 25.

<sup>17</sup> Ahmad, *Faraidi Movement*, 23-25.

<sup>18</sup> Wise, *Eastern Bengal*, 26.

<sup>19</sup> Ahmad, *Faraidi Movement*, 46-47.

Miyan's age. The opportunity of education from Dudu Miyan, therefore, must have been short. He was elected leader of the Faraidi Movement in A.D. 1864.

The date of Naya Miyan's actual assumption of leadership is not known. He was, however, too young to take the responsibilities of leadership on his shoulder and the Faraidis were wise enough to appoint the three illustrious lieutenants of Dudu Miyan, namely Munshi Faid al-Din Mukhtar, Bani Yamin Miyan, and Khalifah Abd al-Jabbar, to act as his guardians. To their credit, they acted with singular devotion and remarkable harmony until the time their protégé became capable of taking his responsibilities in his hand.

The greater numbers of Muslims of East Bengal, notably of Faridpur, were Faraidis who accepted Naya Miyan's words as divine revelation. Naya Miyan had established a state of his own under the banner of the Faraidi Movement within the British Regime. He succeeded in regaining a good deal of the lost power and prestige of the Faraidi movement.<sup>20</sup>

On the death of Naya Miyan in 1884 A.D., the third and the youngest son of Dudu Miyan, Said al-Din Ahmad became the leader. He was born in 1855 A.D., at Bahadurpur. His education started at home under one Munshi Bashir al-Din of Faridpur. Later on, he was sent to Dacca for higher education, where he had the opportunity to study Islamic sciences under the then renowned philosopher Maulana Din Muhammad.

Said al-Din enrolled himself as a student in *Muhsiniyah Madrasah* of Dacca in 1874 A.D. and prosecuted studies under Maulana Ubaid Ullah Ubaydi for a considerable time. He got married at Dacca and often lived there until the time of his election to the leadership in 1884 A.D. As the leader of the Faraidi movement, Said al-Din scrupulously maintained the policy of co-operation with the government, which was adopted earlier by his elder brother Naya Miyan.

In A.D. 1899, the government of India conferred on Said al-Din the title of "Khan Bahadur". His close relationship with the British government appears to have caused some amount of suspicion among a section of the Faraidis, who although did not create any dissension within the movement, themselves gradually slipped out of it. When the question of the partition of Bengal came in A.D. 1905, he supported Nawab Sir Salim Ullah Bahadur in favor of partition.

The policy of co-operation with the government was continued even by his successor Rashid al-Din Ahmad *alias* Badshah Miyan down to 1913 A.D. when the European powers began to show all-out hostility against the Turkish Empire.<sup>21</sup>

---

<sup>20</sup>Ibid., 51-55.

<sup>21</sup>Ibid., 56-57.

Afterward, the leadership adopted the way of constitutional struggle against the British.

The great effect of the Faraidi Movement was the start of a conflict between the peasantry and the *zamindars* of Eastern Bengal. This conflict continued until the formation of the Muslim League that resulted in the partition of Bengal. The other major effect of the Faraidi Movement was the fighting of the Muslims in the Bengal against British rulers. That fight continued in the shape of conflict until the period of Miyan Said when the strategy of Muslims of South Asia of a direct fight against the British on the battlefield changed into the political struggle against British imperialism.

Faraidi Movement has often been accused of forming a new sect in the world of Islam. However, this is not completely true as it just focussed on reviving Islam to its pristine purity and thus carried on the reform and revival tradition in South Asian Muslim society. The Faraidi Movement is conspicuous for some of its notable features. Firstly, it was raised among pure Hanafi Muslims. Secondly, it was the first to deal with the British directly. Thirdly it was unique in the way that is particularly focused on the economic revival.

### PERCEPTION OF DECLINE

On the political level, the Faraidis found that the Hindus and the British were dominating the political horizon and Muslims were in the position of decline. The *fatwa* of Faraidis, that India was *dar-ul-Harb*, definitely marked the fact that they considered the political dominance of the British over India as a mark of decline. They were so firm in claiming India as *dar-ul-Harb* that they asserted that the offering of *I'd* and *Juma* prayers were unlawful in India. Abdullah Malik states that:-

Certainly, the purpose of Haji Shariatullah by asserting the offering of 'Id and Juma prayers unlawful would be to produce hatred against the British among his followers.<sup>22</sup>

The first thing that could disturb the Faraidis was the political domination of the British and Hindus over the Muslims in Bengal. The political domination of the British, through which they had replaced the Persian with the English as the official language and the doors of government jobs were shut on Muslims could be easily taken by Faridis as "adversity" and afflictions". One of the most important historians of Faraidi Movement has said:

---

<sup>22</sup> Abdullah Malik, *Bengali Musalmanon ki Sad Salah Juhd-e-Azadi 1757-1857* (Lahore: Majlis Taraqi-e-Adab, 1967), 145.

Haji Shariatullah being a profound scholar in Islamic sciences, and one who had the privilege of being associated for a considerable time with the birth-place and center of Islamic culture must have been pained to see such a deplorable state of affairs. It is no wonder, therefore, that he dedicated himself to the onerous task of reforming the Muslim society of Eastern Bengal.<sup>23</sup>

On the social level, the ignorance from Islamic rites in Bengal disturbed the Faraidis. The Bengali Muslims had acquired the Hindu rites during their long association with Hindu society.<sup>24</sup> The Faraidis saw that the purity of Islam had been diluted under the dominating social set up of Hindus. Economically, there was an agricultural crisis that had begun before the nineteenth century and ruined Muslim peasants. In that situation, only Faraidi Movement tried to awaken them from sleep and produced a new hope and desire in their hearts.<sup>25</sup> Though its focus area was limited to some districts of Bengal, not even the whole of it, yet, following the tradition of Islamic revivalism, it tried to bring about substantial change in the lives of the Muslims of Bengal.

### ROOTS OF DECLINE

The Faraidis thought that Muslim decline was due to two factors: non-observance of Islamic *faraid* and adoption of non-Muslim practices. Their attitude towards various social and semi-religious celebrations was completely orthodox and in strict conformity with Islam.<sup>26</sup> Haji Shariatullah denounced strongly the innovations and corruption in Indian Islam, introduced by long years of contact with Hindu polytheism.

In the time of Faraidis, the atmosphere in the villages of Bengal had the deep influence on Hindu rites. Islamic beliefs had been intermingled with Hindu ideas that the difference between them was hard. Faraidis called it most important to act upon Islamic teachings. They told that the greatest cause of Muslims' ruin and destruction is disaffiliation from Islam. Therefore it looks obvious that the basic cause of Muslim downfall, in the view of Faraidis, was from within and that was the oblivion of Muslims from the teachings of Islam.

The Faraidis felt that there were wrongs with Muslim society. They preached honesty among the poor and imported them a sense of self-respect. They also emphasized the concept of brotherhood and mutual help, which were lacking

---

<sup>23</sup> Ahmad, *Faraidi Movement*, 9.

<sup>24</sup> Razia Akhtar Banu, *Islam in Bangladesh* (Leiden: E.J.Brill, 1992), 36.

<sup>25</sup> Malik, *Bengali Musalmanon ki Sad Salah Juhd-e-Azadi*, 154.

<sup>26</sup> Ahmad Abdullah, *The Height* (Karachi: Tanzeem Publishers, 1984), 360.

among Muslims.<sup>27</sup> Faraidi Movement not only found fault with the Muslim masses they also felt that the Sufi procedure was also somewhat faulty.

Haji Shariatullah, therefore, opposed the prevalent procedure of *Sufi* initiation and replaced the expression *piri-muridi*, which suggested complete submission by the term *ustad, shagird*. He discontinued the laying on of hands customary at the time of initiation but required from his disciples *tauba* or repentance for past sins and a resolution to lead a righteous and godly lives in the future.

The movement, on the economic plane, viewed the suffering, impoverished, and ruthlessly exploited Muslim peasantry. The movement felt that the Permanent Settlement of 1793, introduced by Lord Cornwallis and Sir John Shodre had reduced the Muslim peasantry to the position of the agricultural laborer, entirely at the mercy of the Hindu middle man, who had emerged as the newly created landlord.<sup>28</sup>

Faraidis were not only against the landlord class but also regarded the industrialist class as a factor in the fall of Muslims. The Faraidis viewed the plight of weaver class and had seen the effect of the utter dislocation of the land loom industry in Bengal. Not only the peasantry was in bad condition but also the industrial labourers were in trouble. The whole economic condition was out of order. Although with the British rule came the money economy and the peasants had to witness its disastrous effects on Muslim daily life.

The Faraidis were thus red republicans in politics and broke into the houses of Hindu and Muslim landlords with perfect impartiality. Dudu Miyan thus inevitably came into conflict with the Hindu and Muslim landed aristocracy & the British planters in the district of 24 parganas.<sup>29</sup>

In the political field, the Faraidis regarded the British as intruders and the Hindus as exploiters. The main opponents of Islam in the eyes of Faraidis were Hindus. It is viewed that the movement protected the British.<sup>30</sup> Though this view requires further examination yet it is obvious that the Hindus were considered the main cause of Muslim troubles. The political branch of the Faraidi organization was an outcome of the conflict between the Faraidi peasantry and the Hindu Zamindar. Haji Shariatullah protested against the imposition of idolatrous cesses by the Hindu Zamindars on the Faraidi peasantry. Though the fight of Faraidis was not directly

---

<sup>27</sup> Ibid.

<sup>28</sup> W.W. Hunter, *The Indian Musalmans* (Lahore: Sang-e-Meel Publications, 1999), 17.

<sup>29</sup> M. A. Karandikar, *Islam in India's Transition to Modernity* (Wesport: Greenwood Publishing Corporation, 1969), 135.

<sup>30</sup> Barbara Daly Metcalf, *Islamic Revival in British India, Deoband: 1860-1900* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1982), 68-69.



against the British government they did not spare the British owners of the indigo factories.

The Faraidis felt the two main factors for Muslim decline; the social customs in the imitation of Hindus and the economic exploitation of the landlords and the industrialists, Faraidis thought when these factors would be tackled the political situation will automatically change. They felt the British occupation wrong but had not thought it the main cause of Muslim decline.

The assessment of the causes of the decline in the eyes of Faraidis developed with time. In the initial period, the Faraidi was a purely spiritual movement aimed at the regeneration of the personal virtues of Muslims and the duties enjoined by Islam.<sup>31</sup> And thus felt the ignoring the duties of Islam were the main cause but in the later period, the movement felt the economic bad conditions as the cause of Muslim decline.

### CORRECTIONS SUGGESTED

The main and founding objective of the Faraidi Movement was the widespread application of the *Shariah*, so often spoken of in Islam, but so laxly applied. The very name of the movement from *Faraid*, religious duties, underlines this aspect. The doctrine *faraid* as enjoined by Islam was the central principle of the Faraidi reform program. By the term "*faraid*", Haji Shariatullah meant all the duties enjoined by God and the Prophet. He put special emphasis on the absolute necessity of observing the five fundamentals of Islam which were (a) profession of *kalimah* (the article of the faith), (b) five-time daily prayers (c) fasting during the month of Ramadan (d) payment of *zakat*, and (e) pilgrimage to Makkah or hajj.<sup>32</sup>

The Faraidis insisted on the observance of these fundamentals by all members of the movement in an attempt to create in Bengal large numbers of practicing Muslims.<sup>33</sup> Therefore, the foremost remedy of decline in the eyes of Faraidis was to enforce the original teachings of Islam and to purge the society of various superstitious rites and ceremonies, which were widely practised by the Muslims of Bengal.

The first policy of Faraidis was to call upon the Muslims to perform *tauba* for the past sins, as a measure for the purification of the soul.<sup>34</sup> According to Haji Shariatullah, *tauba* meant penitence for the past sin and a resolve to abstain from

---

<sup>31</sup> Abdullah, *The Height*, 360-361.

<sup>32</sup> *Encyclopedia of Islam*, s.v. "Faraidi Movement."

<sup>33</sup> Banu, *Islam in Bangladesh*, 36.

<sup>34</sup> Ahmad, *Faraidi Movement*, 61.

sinful act in the future.<sup>35</sup> After this purification, Faraidis called upon them to observe strictly the *faraid* or the duties enjoined by God and the Prophet.

Then the doctrine of the *tawhid*, as enunciated in the Quran, was strictly enforced; and whatever beliefs or customs were found repugnant to it were to be given up. Faraidis interpreted *iman* or faith as founded on two pillars, viz., to believe in the unity of God and to stick to it firmly in practice and to refrain from ascribing God's partnership to any other person.

Thus, in Faraidis' opinion *tawhid* was not only a theory but also a principle to be practiced. Any belief or action, which had the remotest semblance of *kufr*, *shirk* or *Bid'ah*, such as subscribing money to or participation in Hindu rites and ceremonies, unusual reverence to the *Pirs*, the traditional *fatihah* and such other practices, was, therefore, declared as repugnant to the doctrine of *tawhid*.<sup>36</sup>

Moreover Faraidis denounced all popular rites and ceremonies which had no basis in the Quran and the prophetic tradition and abolished them unsparingly. In this context, they professed to adhere strictly to the letters of the Quran and to reject all ceremonies that were not sanctioned by it.<sup>37</sup> They denounced the worship of Hindu gods and goddesses, the adoration of Hindu midwife to cut the umbilical cord of new-born children, and similar customs and religious rites which Bengali Muslims had acquired during their long association with Hindu society.<sup>38</sup>

Many *Bid'ah* had crept into the fold of Bengali Muslims. In his *Puthi*, Durr-i-Muhammed said that Haji Shariatullah did abolish the custom of *fatihah*, the worship of shrines and stopped the corrupt Mullah when he came to Bengal. When he set his foot in Bengal, all *shirk* and *Bid'ah* were trampled down. He then listed those *shirk* and *Bid'ah* which were abolished by Haji Shariatullah, such as, worship of shrines of Bibi Fatimah, Ghazu, Kalu, Pinch Pir, floating of *Bhera*, holding of the martyrdom of Hasan and Hussayn, observance of ceremonious dance, music and *fatihah*, planting banana tree around the residence on the occasion of first menstruation of a girl and participation in the *Rathen Yatra* and other idolatrous customs of Hindus. Durr-i-Muhammad went on to say that all these innovations were then abolished and the "sun of Islam rose high in the sky."<sup>39</sup>

For the solution of the economic problem of the Muslims, the Faraidis' diagnosis resembled modern day communism. Dudu Miyan asserted the equality of mankind, and taught that the welfare of the lowly and poor also had a high

---

<sup>35</sup> Wise, *Eastern Bengal*, 22.

<sup>36</sup> Ahmad, *Faraidi Movement*, 61; *Ibid.*, 66.

<sup>37</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>38</sup> Banu, *Islam in Bangladesh*, 36.

<sup>39</sup> *Ibid.*, 8.

priority in the agenda of the movement. According to him, whosoever exploited the poor masses ought to be dealt with iron hands and should not be forgiven. If some rich people oppressed the poor, they should be attacked and forced to give the poor their due. For this purpose the poor, the peasants and the labourers should be organized. They should help each other.

Faraidis taught that when a brother fell into distress, it was the duty of his neighbours to assist him, and for this purpose, the Faraidis were prepared to go to any extremes, even the breach of law.<sup>40</sup> In the middle of nineteenth century, Dudu Miyan raised the slogan that the land was property of Allah and private property was against the teaching of Islam. For this the payment of the taxes to landlord, as the price of the cultivation of the land, was not necessary. Only some dues were essential to be paid to the government for the sake of administration. *Zamindar* had not right to claim his ownership on any type of land.<sup>41</sup>

### EFFORTS TO RESOLVE DECLINE

As the first head of Faraidi movement, Haji Shariatullah urged that the country had to be liberated through *jihad*, which, in his view, would involve two phases. In the first phase Muslims had to develop themselves as perfect Muslims. The second phase was actual war against the enemies of Islam.<sup>42</sup> During Shariatullah's lifetime, the movement worked in the first phase of its reform programme and only focussed on religious revival, save for one or two conflicts between some of his radical followers and non-Faraidi members of the Muslim society over dogmas, there was no direct clash with the propertied classes.<sup>43</sup>

Shariatullah said that his own *jihad* was limited to the first phase that was building the soldiers of Islam. He discontinued the term *pir* and *murid* and substituted, on their place, the titles of *ustad* and *shagird*, because they did not imply complete submission of the pupil to the religious preceptor as the other terms did. For the same reason, he prohibited the ceremony of joining hands, which was customary at the initiation of a disciple, but instead, he required from every one of his disciples *tawbah* for the past sins, and declaration of intention to lead a more righteous and godly life in future.<sup>44</sup> Dudu Miyan spread his father's doctrines, besides adding some new ones of his own. Faraidi movement, therefore, during the first phase, was restricted to its agenda of purging Muslim society from the *bid'ah*.

---

<sup>40</sup> Titus, *Islam in India and Pakistan*, 181.

<sup>41</sup> Malik, *Bengali Musalmanon ki Sad Salah Juhd-e-Azadi*, 158.

<sup>42</sup> Banu, *Islam in Bangladesh*, 36.

<sup>43</sup> Malik, *Bengali Musalmanon ki Sad Salah Juhd-e-Azadi*, 72.

<sup>44</sup> Titus, *Islam in India and Pakistan*, 187.

Due to frequent visits of Haji Shariatullah to Nayabari, it became a centre of Faraidis. In Nayabari village, probably first clash between the Faraidis and Hindu landowners took place. In April 1831, Faraidis attacked and plundered a village Nayabari (in the modern Charigram of the Dacca district) due to the fact that the land lords of the village had suppressed the Muslims and the judgment by the British Courts was influenced by the Zamindars.<sup>45</sup> The incident of Nayabari points to the fact that from 1831 the Faraidi Movement came into conflict with the traditional Muslim society on the one hand and with the Hindu Zamindars on the other. As time went on this conflict became more and more clear.<sup>46</sup>

Muin-ud-Din, in the light of some evidence, concludes that towards the end of Haji Shariatullah's life, the Faraidi peasantry were coming increasingly into conflict with the Hindu Zamindars, probably due to the initiative of Dudu Miyan. But the violent fighting and large scale affrays, which were to characterize their mutual relations a few years later under the leadership of Dudu Miyan, did not take place during the lifetime of Haji Shariatullah.

During this preliminary phase, Faraidi movement spread most extensively in those rural areas where Hindu *zamindars* and Christian indigo-planters held sway over the Muslim peasantry, or in areas where Muslim aristocracy had lost control.<sup>47</sup> Therefore, very early, Faraidis became involved in agrarian struggles, which often pitted Muslim peasants against Hindu and European landlords, thus adding a religious element to the socio-political communal antagonism spreading in the Bengali countryside at that time.<sup>48</sup>

Haji Shariatullah's pre-occupations, more concretely, were with the wretched condition of the oppressed Bengal peasants, especially as their lack of financial means prevented them from turning to the courts. He tried to alleviate their miserable state by living among poor peasants as one of them and by making efforts to organize them to escape from the unjust demands of the landowners, whom he found not just oppressors but also transgressors of the holy law of Islam.<sup>49</sup>

The reasons of the conflict with Hindu *zamindars* is not far to seek. Taking a view of the weakness of Muslim masses in the beginning of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, the Hindu *Zamindars* imposed not only various restrictions on the Muslim peasantry, such as, prohibition on the slaughter of cows in the areas of their *Zamindari*, but

---

<sup>45</sup> Faruqi, *Mujaddad's Concept*, 15.

<sup>46</sup> Ahmad, *Faraidi Movement*, 16.

<sup>47</sup> Banu, *Islam in Bangladesh*, 36.

<sup>48</sup> *The Oxford Encyclopedia of the Modern Islamic World*, 1993 ed., s.v. "Sirhindi, Ahmad," by Francis Robinson.

<sup>49</sup> *Encyclopedia of Islam*, s.v. "Faraidi Movement."

also collected exorbitant taxes, in addition to the land revenues, such as tax on the celebration of ceremonies, which was strongly resented by the Muslims.<sup>50</sup>

In their attempt to check the slaughter of cows (which the Faraidis openly practised), and realize idolatrous taxes for the celebrations of *Kali Puja* and *Durga puja* (which the Faraidis refused to pay on principle), the Zamindars had devised a variety of intensely painful methods of physical torture, such as chili powder snuff, severe flogging, breaking red-ants' nest on the bare body, throwing chest-deep into a well of rubbish especially devised for the purpose and shutting up such insects as grass hopper and white ant on the novel. The Zamindars also imposed the infamous beard tax.<sup>51</sup> Faraidi movement, being the exponent of Islamic revivalism, disapproved of these unjust and oppressive measures of the Zamindars on the Muslim peasantry, especially because of the encouragement to idolatry involved therein.<sup>52</sup>

On the assumption of leadership by Dudu Miyan, after death of Haji Shariatullah in 1840, Faraidi movement decided to take firm action against the Zamindar due to their oppression on the Faraidi peasantry. In 1841 and 1842, he led two campaigns against Zamindars of Kanaipur. These campaigns proved a success and helped him to mould a new policy which gave a newer outlook to the Faraidi movement as a militant group.

The initial victories of Dudu Miyan captured the imagination of the masses. The prestige of Dudu Miyan rose high in the esteem of the downtrodden peasantry, who hailed him as their saviour.<sup>53</sup> He had a genius for organization, and, making his headquarters at Bahadurpur, he divided eastern Bengal into circles (*halqah*) appointing a *khalifah*, over each to collect contribution from the members for furthering the ends of the central association. He also established an espionage system, and used his agents to secure information throughout their areas for the purpose of protecting members of the sect against landlords.<sup>54</sup>

Since the taxes and forced labour imposed by the landlords on peasants were illegal from the point of view of the *Shariah*, Dudu Miyan advised landless peasants to leave the privately owned estates and settle on the *Khass sahall* - state property - thus avoiding all taxes other than those paid to the government. The Faraidis took arms on as many as six occasions - 1804, 1831, 1834, 1841 and 1846.<sup>55</sup> These clashes of the Faraidis did not lessen the plight of the Muslims but it infused in them a sense of the unity and an acknowledgment of their power against the

---

<sup>50</sup> Ahmad, *Faraidi Movement*, 17.

<sup>51</sup> Ibid., 26-27.

<sup>52</sup> Ibid., 17.

<sup>53</sup> Ibid., 20-29

<sup>54</sup> Titus, *Islam in India and Pakistan*, 189.

<sup>55</sup> Karandikar, *Islam in India's Transition*, 136.

landowner or capitalist class. These activities provided them psychological relief in those troubled times.

Faraidis used to assemble from all quarters most suddenly and secretly and after the attack, dispersed in the same manner. In 1841,<sup>56</sup> Dudu Miyan and Jala al-Din Mullah proceeded to Kanapiur at the head of a few hundred club-bearers and encamped within the sight of landlord's place (Ravan Kuti). Dudu Miyan then held out the Zamindar the threat of taking away every brick of the palace if he did not come to terms. The *sikdar* was frightened, and extortion of illegal and idolatrous taxes were stopped forth with.

Emboldened by easy victory over the *sikdar*, Dudu launched another campaign against the powerful Ghosh family of Faridpur in the earlier part of 1842.<sup>57</sup> Then on the 5<sup>th</sup> of December 1846, a large body of armed men of Faraidi movement attacked and burned to the ground the factory at Panch char. After pillaging the adjoining village, Faraidis departed, taking with them the Brahman Gomastah, who was afterwards murdered in the Bakargonj district.<sup>58</sup> The movement, thus, in a way, continued a class struggle. The poor peasants were also joined by the unemployed weavers. It was, on a small scale, a sort of a protest of the Muslim craftsmen against the introduction of machine goods.<sup>59</sup>

Opponents used two methods to stop Faraidis; court cases and religious propaganda against them. The later method proved more successful. Dudu Miyan was even prosecuted on charges of rapine. In 1836, the enemies of the Faraidis succeeded in having Dudu Miyan sent to prison in Alipur. Despite the cases against him, numerous disturbances broke out in the areas controlled by the Faraidis and the landowners resorted to barbarous tortures.<sup>60</sup>

The movement continued to vegetate under the direction of Dudu Miyan's sons, who were lacking in energy and whose qualities of organization were very inferior to those of their father. The Faraidis regarded the Turkish Sultan as the rightful *Khalifah* of the Muslim world and they were completely disillusioned at the end of World War I, when the European powers including the British dismembered the Turkish Empire and divided its territories among themselves. In 1922, Badshah Miyan joined *khilafat* and the non co-operation movements and was arrested and imprisoned.<sup>61</sup>

---

<sup>56</sup> Wise, *Eastern Bengal*, 25.

<sup>57</sup> Ahmad, *Faraidi Movement*, 37.

<sup>58</sup> *Ibid.*, 38.

<sup>59</sup> Karandikar, *Islam in India's Transition*, 135.

<sup>60</sup> *Encyclopedia of Islam*, s.v. "Faraidi Movement."

<sup>61</sup> Ahmad, *Faraidi Movement*, 57.

In their opposition to British rule, the Faraidi *Ulama* stressed the theory of *Darul Harb* over and over again.<sup>62</sup> According to this theory, Faraidis suspended the congregational prayers of Jumah and 'Id under the British regime in Bengal on the plea that in accordance with Hanfi law, the congregational prayers were not permitted except in *misr al-jami* i.e., in such a township where the Amir and the Qazi were present; and were appointed by a lawful Muslim Sultan.<sup>63</sup> In reality, this *fatwa* of Faraidis was an obvious refusal to give legitimacy to the British Government.

On this *fatwa*, the Faraidis faced a lot of opposition from a few *ulama* like Mawlawi Karamt Ali but they were too firm in their opposition against the non-Islamic government of the British to accept Bengal as *dar-ul-Islam*. Malik has opined that it is difficult to substantiate the charges of anti-government (British) activities against Dudu Miyan. His programme spoke of lawlessness committed against the landlords and Indigo planters and their supporters, and in some cases, against those Muslim peasants who refused to follow him, but nowhere there was any intention to challenge the British government.<sup>64</sup>

On the other hand many scholars observe that this view is not totally correct. Dudu Miyan organized parallel religious courts for the Muslims.<sup>65</sup> The Faraidis were not allowed to bring any dispute or legal suit before the government courts without obtaining permission from the *khalifah* or the *Ustad*. The non-Faraidis, having a dispute with the Faraidi, were encouraged to bring the case before a Faraidi court, instead of taking it to the government court.<sup>66</sup>

Before Dudu Miyan died in 1860, he was well on the way of organizing something like a parallel government in some parts of Bengal.<sup>67</sup> Wise, commenting on the influence of the government of Faraidis, observes that the *Panchayats* of Faraidis possessed great influence on the people and in Faraidi villages, as they took cognizance of all offences, it was exceedingly rare that any case of violence or assault, committed within them, found its way to the regular courts.<sup>68</sup>

Even after the death of Dudu Miyan, Naya Miyan established a state of his own within the British regime. In every village, he appointed a superintendent and a *piyadah*, through whom he kept the Faraidis in his control. No dispute of the village could be submitted to the civil or criminal court, without the permission of the superintendent.<sup>69</sup> The existence of the government of Faraidis is evident by one

---

<sup>62</sup>Ibid., 135.

<sup>63</sup>Ibid., 67.

<sup>64</sup> Malik, *Bengali Musalmanon ki Sad Salah Juhd-e-Azadi*, 75.

<sup>65</sup> Aziz Ahmad, *Studies in Islamic Culture in the Indian Environment* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1964), 216.

<sup>66</sup> Ahmad, *Faraidi Movement*, 113.

<sup>67</sup> Ahmad, *Islamic Culture*, 216.

<sup>68</sup> Wise, *Eastern Bengal*, 25.

<sup>69</sup> Ahmad, *Faraidi Movement*, 112.

of the arguments of Maulana Karamat Ali against the Faraidis. He contended that, as the Faraidis had established a sort of their own regime in Eastern Bengal, they had no excuse to shrink from the prayer of Juma.<sup>70</sup>

## CONCLUSION

The measures adopted by the Faraidi movement to check the decline show that it was purely a local movement that started first as a religious movement, and later took on social and economic aspects. It initially focussed on eradicating the vices and *bid'ah*, which had crept into Muslim body politic, due to centuries of contacts with the Hindus. Secondly, this religious ideal was coupled, at a later stage, with the desire to better the socio-economic conditions of the Muslims. It, then, set its goal as to protect the helpless Muslim masses from the tyranny and oppression of *zamindars* of rural Bengal.

To achieve this objective, Faraidis resorted to militancy and for this they had to face serious hardships and persecution. However, their struggle boosted the morale of the Muslim peasantry of Bengal and psychologically, if not materially, enabled them to face the dual challenges of economic exploitation of the Hindu *zamindars* and political domination of the British.

---

<sup>70</sup>Ibid., 113.



# TEXTBOOKS OF HISTORY AND PAKISTAN STUDIES IN THE PUNJAB:AN ANALYSIS

**Akhtar Hussain Sandhu**

Professor of History

&

**Dr. Anna Mahmood**

Professor of Politics & IR

International Islamic University, Islamabad

## ABSTRACT:

KK Aziz<sup>1</sup> in Pakistan castigated the governments and the textbook authors on 'distortion' of the historical events and deleting important segments of history from the syllabi. Romila Mariam Chughtai shared her reservation regarding textbooks. Thapar in India raised objections against the BJP government's effort of 'religionizing the syllabi' and tried her best to introduce the non-communal approach in the textbooks while writing history books but her effort remained a mere desire because the 'religiously' extremist political party occupying the main corridor of the national government and having no compatibility with her ideas refused to accept the undisputed historical facts. Dr. Mubarak Ali opined while writing on the textbooks that 'defective textbooks create a defective mindset. Ideology limits people from acquiring new knowledge to understand the fast-changing world.'<sup>2</sup> Objections raised by KK Aziz regarding historical and social narrations can hardly be met if some author or government plans to follow.<sup>3</sup> For the reason, different people criticized the textbooks of History and Pakistan Studies but not a single author has compiled any textbook as a model. If changed as desired by the critics it will lead to a new controversy and people satisfied with the excluded things will be critical of the new

---

<sup>1</sup> KK Aziz, *Murder of History: A critique of history textbooks used in Pakistan* (Lahore: Vanguard Book Pvt, Ltd., 1993).

<sup>2</sup> Mubarak Ali, 'Lies and half-truths,' daily *Dawn*, 31 January 2016.

<sup>3</sup> *Murder of History* authored by KK Aziz has about 260 pages that mostly raise objections and one can imagine that if addressed all the grievances how many pages will be required for this detailed discourse. The details sought by KK Aziz in the textbooks cannot be covered in the allocated space of 9<sup>th</sup> grade textbook of Pakistan Studies.

incorporations and people dissatisfied with the other things will react in the same manner. So no full stop can be dropped anywhere in this case because school or college syllabus consisting of data discussed briefly with a specific direction cannot accommodate all aspects of history. 'National History' reflects a national point of view to produce a generation that represents some specific land, culture, religion, political ideology, art, and social ethics. Hardly an example of such a country can be quoted which does not educate the posterity according to its national interpretation of the historical events. The children are taught to grow with their own culture, religion, and social norms. This study finds that the syllabus of the subjects of History and Pakistan Studies produced by the Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board (PCTB), like other countries, aims at educating the posterity on specific direction, therefore, no gaps seem in the textbooks of History and Pakistan Studies. Criticism arises mostly on the old textbooks while the PCTB had revised the textbooks massively and all the historical periods including Indus Valley Civilization, ancient India, Sikh rule, etc. are being taught at the school and college level. Is the 'history textbook' a 'history?' How distortion is possible if historical facts survive in history? Is the interpretation of events a 'history?' Why did the critics of the subjects of History and Pakistan Studies not offer an alternative to the 'flawed' textbooks; they wrote hundreds of pages on objections while the alternative textbooks need a little effort in producing few pages to fill the gap if it exists. The direction taken in the study is that the critique on the textbooks of History and Pakistan Studies does not separate 'events' from 'comments.' It further pinpoints some issues such as communal interpretations in British India, space in the textbooks, administrative, social, political, and religious narrations, and the undeniable position on nationalism and patriotism which cannot be overlooked. The critique is an idealized posture which can hardly be met because of the limited space in the textbooks. This study offers a counter-narrative to the objections raised by many in and outside Pakistan against the PCTB textbooks of History and Pakistan Studies.

**KEYWORDS:** Textbooks, history, Pakistan Studies, distortion, interpretations of events, nationalism, patriotism, generations, governments, national history, British, communal, national standpoint.

## INTRODUCTION:

Textbooks and extremism in Pakistan remained a hot issue throughout history and the western media and policymakers showed concern over the situation of extremism in Pakistan. On 16 April 2016, the daily *Dawn* published news from Washington that Ambassador Jalil Abbas Jilani responding to a report “Teaching Intolerance in Pakistan” which pointed out about the extremist contents in the textbooks of Pakistan, explained that Pakistan’s government had removed the offensive references from the textbooks.<sup>4</sup> This highlights the problem as an international issue that determines its importance inside and outside Pakistan. Reports on hate crime and terrorism in the UK were circulated in the House of Commons which had discussed the students having tilt towards hate crime and their training from divergent channels.<sup>5</sup> All this was because of the domestic environment (domestic syllabi), contents (school syllabi) and interpretation by the teachers (fastidious avoidance from curriculum). The 9/11 incident provoked the religious extremism and counter-terrorism drive which has prevailed the world politics.

Many authors decry the ‘distortion’ of history in Pakistan Studies and History textbooks but hardly have they drawn a tangible line between errata, Skipping events, interpretation or national point of view and distortion. All ought to witness the official process of change in the syllabi repeatedly after few years by the PCTB that includes and excludes things according to the posture and tilt of time or expertise of the PCTB authors and reviewers. Textbooks in Punjab mean the school books from primary to intermediate classes which are supposed to narrate historical events very briefly. If the objections by the critics are addressed, the textbooks will swell to volumes because the critique seeks mention of the national as well as counter-narratives in these textbooks. Nelson Mandela opines that human nature is based on love and the parents, syllabus, and media teach hatred. What Rousseau wants Emile to be in the life is simply a person of his personality and nature as endowed by God but it all pertains to the individual personality while textbooks are designed and written keeping the national needs in mind.

Nations are endowed with the right to promote the religion, culture, system, and ideology minus violence. Owing and admiring the parents, religion, land, culture and nation is a natural phenomenon but the discourse must be kept away from hatred and violence against any group. Hatred grows from actions and experiences within or outside the society. Interpretation of these actions and experiences is not owned by the rival community or group while the latter’s

---

<sup>4</sup> US Commission on International Religious Freedom (USCIRF) managed this report. Daily, *Dawn*, 16 April 2016.

<sup>5</sup> <https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm201617/cmselect/cmhaff/609/609.pdf>; See also, <https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm201617/cmselect/cmhaff/135/135.pdf>, 14/11/17.

perception on these events are rebutted by the previous group. The war of 1857 in India was 'mutiny' for the British while the same was 'war of independence' for the locals. Usually, textbooks influence the tender minds and direct their future life to a specific intellectual line. Many surveys conducted by the civil society organizations and researchers have concluded that the nascent minds are vulnerable to the religious extremism because many religious groups teach contents in the perspective of hatred. Therefore, textbooks or contents and teachers play decisive role in the upbringing of the posterity and sometimes teachers become more important as they are to interpret the contents according to their own mindset. Curriculum shows its worth here when it confines teachers to the specific intellectual lines.

During the early 1840s, the European principals, Felix Boutros and Aloys Sprenger at Delhi College supervised the work on the school textbooks with help of the Indian teachers of the Oriental Department.<sup>6</sup> The presence of different religious communities in India had divergent interpretational positions on the historical events which moved the British to adopt descriptive approach in the history textbooks. The textbook offered narrations free of biases. This approach motivated the Indian historians to follow the direction taken the British historiography. The British styled way of historiography of India served the ruling nation in eliminating the influence of the local heritage from the Indian people.<sup>7</sup> By this, the British educated the locals but under the colonist approach which hammered the intellectual psyche of the coming generations.

The education policy initiated in Punjab from the 1850s onward discarded Punjabi language considering it a low status<sup>8</sup> although the British realized the mother-tongue phenomenon that the best way of learning is that the children can learn through their mother-tongue. The Punjabi children had to learn Punjabi as mother-tongue, English, and Urdu as official languages, and Arabic as religious language. This hurdle was realized by the policymakers but never addressed. K. Mohyeddin talks of the phenomenon that Urdu and English were the major hurdles in the way of learning for the Punjabi children:

According to the five years elementary course, the pupil had to start learning the second language (English) within that period, in the fourth standard. The

---

<sup>6</sup> Powell 2002: 96 in Ali Usman Qasmi, [https://www.academia.edu/31731902/Textbooks\\_for\\_History\\_and\\_Urdu\\_in\\_Punjab\\_Transiting\\_from\\_the\\_Colonial\\_to\\_the\\_Post-Colonial\\_Period](https://www.academia.edu/31731902/Textbooks_for_History_and_Urdu_in_Punjab_Transiting_from_the_Colonial_to_the_Post-Colonial_Period).

<sup>7</sup> Diamond 2014: 90-1 in Ali Usman Qasmi, [https://www.academia.edu/31731902/Textbooks\\_for\\_History\\_and\\_Urdu\\_in\\_Punjab\\_Transiting\\_from\\_the\\_Colonial\\_to\\_the\\_Post-Colonial\\_Period](https://www.academia.edu/31731902/Textbooks_for_History_and_Urdu_in_Punjab_Transiting_from_the_Colonial_to_the_Post-Colonial_Period).

<sup>8</sup> Ali Usman Qasmi, 'Textbooks for History and Urdu in Punjab: Transiting from the Colonial to the Post-Colonial Period,' 233, [file:///C:/Users/User/Downloads/Textbooks\\_for\\_History\\_and\\_Urdu\\_in\\_Punjab.pdf](file:///C:/Users/User/Downloads/Textbooks_for_History_and_Urdu_in_Punjab.pdf), 29/11/2018.

experiment, however, proved unsuccessful, and it had to be abolished, because the trilingual process of learning a slightly foreign language, like Urdu, together with a completely foreign one, like English, along with the mother-tongue (Punjabi) spoken in the homes, was rather burdensome for the child... the general illiteracy of the parents especially in the rural areas, on the one hand, and the position of Urdu language, as a sort of *via media* between the mother-tongue (Punjabi) and a foreign language (English), on the other, stand as obstacles in the way.<sup>9</sup>

The Punjab Textbook Board was formed after the Punjab Textbook Committee founded in 1877 and re-named as Advisory Board for Books in 1937. Ram Prasad, a professor of history at Government College Lahore, and Allama Muhammad Iqbal compiled a history textbook entitled *Tarikh-i-Hind* in 1913 which shed light on the geographical expression of India and the chronology including pre-historic, Aryan invasions, Vedic, Buddhism and Jainism, invasions by the Persians, Greeks and central Asian hordes, Muslim rulers and the British colonial period. The textbook also contains various reforms and wars by the British rulers.<sup>10</sup> Allama Iqbal produced Urdu, Persian, and history textbooks to meet his daily expenditures however he got relief on the award of the stipends from the states of Hyderabad and Bhopal. Allama Iqbal worked as an examiner for various universities and paper setter.<sup>11</sup> Usman Qasmi opines that many including Rafi-ud-Din Hashmi don't accept that the textbook *Tarikh-i-Hind* was authored by Allama Iqbal as many points in the book were contrary to his other writings or ideological stand. Hashmi claims that 'Iqbal must have simply lent his name to the project without properly scrutinising its text.'<sup>12</sup> Allama Muhammad Iqbal and Hakim Ahmad Shuja (1893-1969), authored four Urdu textbooks for class five to eight. Both the writers desired to promote love for the motherland (*madar-i-watan ki mahabat*), and ethical worldview to elevate the morale and confidence of the students.<sup>13</sup>

In the 1920s, a reform committee to discuss reforms and proposals regarding basic subjects for vernacular schools was set up by the education department. The committee sought the ways to make vernacular education more effective at the primary level but without putting the burden on the teachers because the teachers were to teach many subjects. Sir Fazl-i-Husain, the minister for education, approved the suggestion of merging science, history and drawing

<sup>9</sup> K. Mohyeddin M.Ed., 'The Teaching of Urdu in the Punjab,' *The Punjab Educational Journal*, vol. XXXVIII (November 1943): 463.

<sup>10</sup> Ali Qasmi, 'Textbooks for History and Urdu in Punjab: Transiting from the Colonial to the Post-Colonial Period,' 237.

<sup>11</sup> Rafi-ud-Din Hashmi. *Tasanif-i-Iqbal ka tehqiqi wa tauzihi mutala* (Lahore: Iqbal Academy, 2010), 408.

<sup>12</sup> Ali Usman Qasmi, 'Textbooks for History and Urdu in Punjab: Transiting from the Colonial to the Post-Colonial Period,' 239.

<sup>13</sup> Ali Usman Qasmi, 'Textbooks for History and Urdu in Punjab: Transiting from the Colonial to the Post-Colonial Period,' 241.

together under the new subject of general knowledge. The contents included sanitation, hygiene, agriculture, administration and cooperation, and biographical information.<sup>14</sup>

State monopoly was dropped gradually and 20 years later the private sector was given contracts to write textbooks. The school textbooks during the early 1950s contained historical stories of Moses, Umar b. Abdul Aziz, Tipu Sultan, Napoleon Bonaparte, Ram Chandar, Muhammad bin Qasim, Muhammad Ali Jinnah, and Allama Muhammad Iqbal, etc. The textbooks were 'Islamised' in the 1970s and no mention of non-Muslims became an outstanding feature of the school books. One of the earliest history textbooks in Pakistan entitled *Tarikh-i-Pak wa Hind* authored by Riaz-ul-Islam, Shaukat Ali, and Z. H. Zaidi (1953) maintained the past spirit of a history textbook and talked of the geography, people of India, sources of Indian history, Indus valley, Ramayan and Mahabharat, Buddhism, Jainism, the Greeks, Ashoka, the Gupta Empire, Chinese pilgrims' accounts and the Rajput states. The turbulent transitional period after 14 August 1947 did not let the administration to change the syllabi so the history textbooks began to be reformed in the 1950s and nationalized in the 1960s.<sup>15</sup> Ideological indoctrination in the school curriculum and textbooks was focused by Gen. Ayub Khan in 1965 and a Textbook Board was established in both the wings i.e., East Pakistan and West Pakistan. The West Pakistan Textbook Board established in 1962 became Punjab Textbook Board in 1971. The syllabus for primary and middle classes was a responsibility of the Directorate of Public Instruction and the Intermediate Education Board was to work on the syllabus of the secondary and higher secondary education.<sup>16</sup>

The West Pakistan Textbook Board established in July 1962 under West Pakistan Textbook Ordinance XLI of 1962 was substituted by the 'Punjab Textbook Board' under the Ordinance V of 1971. The Punjab Textbook Board sought the manuscripts authored by the experts to be placed in open competition after 1980 and three best manuscripts were to be selected and sent to Federal Ministry of Education for approval.<sup>17</sup> The Punjab Curriculum Authority was maintained under The Punjab Curriculum Authority Act 2012 (XLIX OF 2012) to arrange outsource textbooks including bidding,<sup>18</sup> writing, review and printing of the textbooks.<sup>19</sup> In the process of writing and reviewing the History book of grade

<sup>14</sup> Report on Progress of Education in the Punjab 1923: iii.

<sup>15</sup> Ali Usman Qasmi, 'Textbooks for History and Urdu in Punjab: Transiting from the Colonial to the Post-Colonial Period,' 244-45.

<sup>16</sup> Raja Rashid Ahmad, ed., *Nisabi kutub: tadvin se tabat tak* (Lahore: Punjab Textbook Board, 1974), 67.

<sup>17</sup> <http://www.ptb.gop.pk/history>, 15/2/2017.

<sup>18</sup> [http://eproc.punjab.gov.pk/BiddingDocuments/61416\\_SBD%20Sticker%202017-18\\_Final.pdf](http://eproc.punjab.gov.pk/BiddingDocuments/61416_SBD%20Sticker%202017-18_Final.pdf).

<sup>19</sup> <http://www.sahe.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/EM-I-Reviewing-quality-of-key-education-inputs-in-Pakistan-Part-6.pdf>, 12/8/2017.

VIII, a dispute of powers and corruption emerged. Consequently, an inquiry was initiated by the Chief Minister<sup>20</sup> against the Curriculum Development Authority and resultantly the government decided to conclude legislation on the very issue. The daily *Dawn* published news about the creation of new body to administer the writing, reviewing and publishing the textbooks:

A new ordinance has abolished the warring Punjab Textbook Board and the Punjab Curriculum Authority, merging their functions into a new Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board. The ordinance was promulgated by Acting Governor Rana Iqbal on September 19, abolishing the board and the authority which were at loggerheads since the creation of the latter in view of the devolution of its functions to the provinces under the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment. The bone of contention was the overlapping function of commanding the publication of textbooks of classes I to XII which the board considered its core duty and was not ready to share it with the authority.<sup>21</sup>

The provincial government through The Punjab Curriculum & Textbook Board Act 2015 (Act VI of 2015) merged The Punjab Curriculum Authority and Punjab Textbook Board in 2015 into a new body called The Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board.<sup>22</sup> The duty of the PCTB is to hire the services of good writers and subject experts to review a manuscript and publish the textbook.<sup>23</sup> This organization functions under Chairman, Director-General and Directors (Curriculum, Manuscripts, Finance, etc.) along with supporting staff.<sup>24</sup> The Curriculum<sup>25</sup> was approved by the national government in 2007<sup>26</sup> and the 18<sup>th</sup> Constitutional Amendment devolved this power to the provincial governments.

Historically, in the monarchical world, a ruler projected himself as a nation under the Divine Right theory. He formulated policies which might strengthen his authoritarian position. Focusing on the syllabi being taught to the coming generations, he used to order to incorporate the contents showing him a great savior, emancipator and patriot. Catherine the Great of Russia<sup>27</sup> and other dictators can be quoted as example. But in the democratic era, power shifted from individual to a government in which an individual was not the sole authority rather he could influence the government only through his talent and argument. Government is

---

<sup>20</sup> Mian Shahbaz Sharif was born in 1951 and he is the Chief Minister of the Punjab.

<sup>21</sup> Daily, *Dawn*, 26 September 2014.

<sup>22</sup> <http://punjablaws.gov.pk/laws/2589.html>, 12/8/2017.

<sup>23</sup> Details of the infrastructure, call for textbook writing, manuscripts, bidding, review, printing, etc can be found from the website, <http://pctb.punjab.gov.pk/guidelines>, 17/12/2017.

<sup>24</sup> <https://www.facebook.com/PunjabTextBookBoard/>, 12/8/2017.

<sup>25</sup> National Curriculum can be found here, [http://pctb.punjab.gov.pk/All\\_Curriculum](http://pctb.punjab.gov.pk/All_Curriculum), 17/12/2017.

<sup>26</sup> Curriculum for grades IV-V, <http://pctb.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/SOCIAL%20STUDIES%20IV-V.pdf>, 17/12/2017.

<sup>27</sup> Czarina Catherine II known as Catherine the Great remained Empress of Russia from 1762 until 1796, [https://apeurowebb.files.wordpress.com/2013/11/catherine\\_the\\_great.pdf](https://apeurowebb.files.wordpress.com/2013/11/catherine_the_great.pdf).

always applauded on positive policies and criticized on the weak steps. When required, governments first attack history, philosophy and the subject dealing with politics to project or reject some specific narrative. If it comes up as a national narrative it may be justified under the concept of 'national interest' which can only be protected through 'national history' or 'educational history'<sup>28</sup> because if some nation plans to protect its interest then it will have to produce nationalist human resource. However, the exhortation should not be immersed in hatred or violence as the extremist Maharashtra State Education Board removed the Mughal rule from grade VII textbook.<sup>29</sup> Pakistan also underwent some religious fanaticism and the Gen. Zia's government included religious extremism in the textbooks but at the same time they always tried to take care of the minorities. Few years back, sectarian killing occurred in different parts of Pakistan convinced the government to take stern action against the extremist material present in the textbooks. But the governments were helpless in handling the teachers belonging to some specific sectarian school of thought who misinterpreted the religious contents in the classes. Syllabus of History and Pakistan Studies was criticized more than that of Islamic Studies perhaps because both the subjects deal with the historical events of the Subcontinent and Islamic and Muslim history and Pakistan Studies. And Pakistan Studies being a compulsory subject at all levels (graduation) has come to limelight. Mian Shahbaz Sharif (Chief Minister, Punjab) under the direction of the Supreme Court of Pakistan laid stress on the subjects of Islamic Studies, History, Pakistan Studies, Sociology, Civics, etc., having sectarian and extremist trends, should be replaced with the new contents promoting tolerance, coexistence, nonviolence and harmony.<sup>30</sup> The Higher Education Department, Government of the Punjab, Pakistan assigned me the duty to present the concluded and agreed contents to the Vice Chancellors, Registrars and Deans of the universities of the Punjab province because the universities are responsible to design courses/contents for the affiliated colleges as textbooks do not come in the purview of the higher education. The School Education Department undertook the textbooks up to grade 12. Although this effort pertained to the contents of graduate classes but textbooks were discussed thoroughly by the academicians<sup>31</sup> and several recommendations were suggested to the universities. This verifies that the governments have procedure under the rules

---

<sup>28</sup> National History or Educational History means a book consisting of selective historical events with interpretation in the national perspective.

<sup>29</sup> <http://www.firstpost.com/india/mughals-disappearing-from-textbooks-across-the-country-as-history-seems-subject-to-change-3903053.html>, 12/11/2017.

<sup>30</sup> Daily *Dawn*, 8 March 2015, p. 17; see also, SMC No. 1/2014, [http://www.supremecourt.gov.pk/web/user\\_files/File/smc\\_1\\_2014.pdf](http://www.supremecourt.gov.pk/web/user_files/File/smc_1_2014.pdf) accessed July 25, 2016. P 11.

<sup>31</sup> This meeting was held in Arfa Kareem Tower under the chair of Dr. Muhammad Nizamuddin, Chairperson, Punjab HEC where the author coordinated the two sessions.



to revise the contents after few years in the light of the feedback by the stakeholders.

AH Nayyar and Ahmad Salim edited a book on the curricula and textbooks in Pakistan and pointed out many problems associated with the text relating to the movement for Pakistan. They opined that term 'Ideology of Pakistan' was never used by Quaid-i-Azam and it was labeled as Islam in 1962, "the phrase Ideology of Pakistan had no historical basis in the Pakistan movement."<sup>32</sup> Ex-Chief Justice Mohammad Munir writes about it:

The Quaid-i-Azam never used the words 'Ideology of Pakistan.' For fifteen years after the establishment of Pakistan, the Ideology of Pakistan was not known to anybody until in 1962 a solitary member of the *Jamaat-i-Islami* used these words for the first time when the Political Parties Bill was being discussed. On this, Chaudhry Fazal Elahi, who has recently retired as President of Pakistan, rose from his seat and objected that the 'Ideology of Pakistan' shall have to be defined. The member who had proposed the original amendment replied that the 'Ideology of Pakistan was Islam', but nobody asked him the further question 'What is Islam?' The amendment to the bill was therefore passed.<sup>33</sup>

Creating term 'Ideology of Pakistan' in prior or later era should not be a point of debate. If any intellectual narrative or stance is not given any name during its application, it has not lost the right to be named in future. Undeniable intellectual position on the struggle for Pakistan existed and it is not a crime if it is given some specific term or nomenclature in the coming time. Even some scholar can coin a better alternative in future if it gets popular consent. Terms are constructed always after the practical use of the intellectual directions. As pointed out, 'Ideology of Pakistan was enunciated by the Quaid' is the sentence used in the curriculum which was used as 'instruction' which means, 'ideological standpoint or narrative given by Quaid-i-Azam during the struggle period' otherwise the curriculum could contain 'Ideology of Pakistan defined by Quaid-i-Azam.' Not a single academic book can be quoted which offers any definition of Ideology of Pakistan enunciated or floated by the Founding Father. The scholars organized sentences taking points from the discussion and speeches of Quaid-i-Azam. The book objects that Quaid's speech of 11 August 1947 'is completely contrary to the so-called 'Ideology of Pakistan'<sup>34</sup> is debatable because the very speech offers the points to construct or complete the definition of Ideology of Pakistan therefore, it is not contrary to the Ideology of Pakistan instead it provides elements to 'complete' the definition. Many religions existed before the British advent in the Subcontinent but the term 'Two-Nation Theory' was used later. Several warrior races existed in the

<sup>32</sup> AH Nayyar and Ahmad Salim, ed., *The Subtle Subversion, The State of Curricula and Textbooks in Pakistan* (Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute, nd), 16.

<sup>33</sup> Mohammad Munir, *From Jinnah to Zia* (Lahore: Vanguard Books Ltd., 1980), 26.

<sup>34</sup> *Ibid.*, 17.

Subcontinent but ‘martial races’ were given the name later. So practices come first and they can be named and renamed by the scholars, thinkers, etc. when required. Therefore, Quaid’s speech of 11 August having appropriate ingredients accomplishes the definition of the ideology of Pakistan.

The rationale of the demand for Pakistan includes:

1. Separate religious beliefs and practices of the Hindu, Muslim, Christian and Sikh communities (for example the concept of *halal-haram*, music before mosques, no intermarriage, etc.). Two-Nation Theory/political separatism on the basis of religion as enunciated by the western philosophy of democracy and nationalism.
2. Majoritarian dilemma and exploitation in the social and political domains deepened the sense of separatism which ultimately ended on territorial split.

The above-mentioned stances gave birth to the Muslim separatism commonly known as Two-nation Theory. Indian National Congress opposed the due rights of the Muslims which convinced the All-India Muslim League under Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah to demand a separate homeland. Thus the intellectual heritage the Pakistani nation conceived from the founding fathers includes:

1. Islam as foundation of nationalism;
2. Democracy as system of government which ensures coexistence and freedom;
3. Minority rights, human rights and prosperity of the people of Pakistan relating to all religions;
4. Rule of law/equal treatment/justice without any discrimination.

Therefore, the above mentioned intellectual principles construct the ‘Ideology of Pakistan.’ The name of the country was adopted as Islamic Republic of Pakistan because the unity of the sub-nations into a nation was based on Islam while the political struggle for rights in British India and then Pakistan was based on the western philosophy. Resultantly, the Islamic Republic of Pakistan represents and embraces the both, identity as Muslims and democracy as system of the future government in which all living in Pakistan will enjoy equal rights as Pakistani citizens. Therefore, Ideology of Pakistan can be defined as under:

- An ideological base to ensure equal rights and prosperity to all the people living in the Muslim and democratic Pakistan is called ideology of Pakistan.

- Ideology of Pakistan consists of two phases i. e., pre-partition and post-partition eras. In first phase, the Muslims, to secure their rights, achieved Pakistan and the second phase aims at achieving the consolidation and prosperity of Pakistan. So ideology of Pakistan reflects the intellectual and conceptual framework to secure the Muslim rights and consolidation of Pakistan through prosperous and peaceful future by and of all the people enjoying equal living in this country.

Ideology of Pakistan is a blend of Two-nation Theory and consolidation of Pakistan. In British India, Muslims and Sikhs were two prominent minorities. One won Pakistan while other joined India. Pakistanis are independent and sovereign while Sikhs persecuted by the majority community have been living a hard life as slaves.

Every author has his/her own style of writing and expression. Historical facts are the same but everyone organizes and elaborates them in a different way therefore sometimes the style of the writers of the PCTB textbooks was criticized and taken up as history notwithstanding their own style has compatibility with that of the textbook writers. For example, if we analyse the text and language of the objection raised by Ahmed Salim, it verifies that the Punjabi writers usually write in the same way. Ahmed Salim objects that students “are forced to read a carefully crafted collection of falsehood and fairy tales”<sup>35</sup> which is the individual style to exaggerate the situation otherwise better and direct words could be picked up instead of using words ‘falsehood and fairy tales.’ When the writers identify the origin of Pakistan, they link it with the Arab advent in India but the critics show serious concern on it.<sup>36</sup> This is not a new approach rather Sikh history identifies the origin of Sikh rule in the anti-Mughal rule action taken by Guru Arjun Dev and especially Guru Hargobind (1595-1644) who adopted the royal style by wearing two swords, miri-piri (spiritual and political symbols). Banda Singh Bahadur after capturing Sarhind is accepted to have established the ‘Sikh rule’ in 1710 for the first time in the history,<sup>37</sup> nonetheless, Sikhs still have no sovereign country. Ahmed Salim considered this falsehood that the Bengali-India conspiracy separated East Pakistan in 1971<sup>38</sup> but where this criticism stands now when after several years Mr. Narendra Modi confessed during his visit to Bangladesh in June 2015 that India

---

<sup>35</sup> AH Nayyar, *The Subtle Subversion*, 65.

<sup>36</sup> Ibid., 68.

<sup>37</sup> [http://sikhpolice.org/MPSA%20Repository/Articles/Baba\\_Banda\\_Singh\\_Bahadur.pdf](http://sikhpolice.org/MPSA%20Repository/Articles/Baba_Banda_Singh_Bahadur.pdf); See also, Harbans Kaur Sagoo, *Banda Singh Bahadur and Sikh Sovereignty* (New Delhi: Deep & Deep Publications, 2001); Hari Ram Gupta, *Later Mughal History of the Punjab, 1707-1793* (Lahore: Sang-e-Meel Publications, 1976).

<sup>38</sup> AH Nayyar, *The Subtle Subversion*, 65, 72, 85.

had helped the Mukti Bahini against the Pakistan Army.<sup>39</sup> Indira Gandhi made foreign tour in the favour of the Bengali separatism.<sup>40</sup> Nayyar also states that a long list of the non-Muslim leaders who had joined struggle for Pakistan is available but the textbook did not pick up. Interestingly, the writer has not attached ‘the long list of the non-Muslim leaders’ who stood with Quaid-i-Azam in the struggle for Pakistan.

During the turbulent days after the revocation of the article 370 and 35 A and merger of Indian Occupied Kashmir into the Union the former Chief Minister Dr. Abdullah, Umar Abdullah and Mehbooba Mufti finally accepted that “their decision to side with India instead of Pakistan was a wrong decision, which has once again vindicated the ‘two nations’ theory” that made India and Pakistan two separate independent states.”<sup>41</sup>

Nations take stand for their national interest and the leaders are remembered and honoured by the nation on their daring and wise gestures on the dialogue table in favour of the country. Diplomatic history deals with the foreign policies of the world. Diplomatic skills including language, drafting, knowledge of international affairs, foreign policy tools and gestures and postures play key role in the dialogue but the most important point is the ‘national interest’ to be projected and achieved. Zulfeqar Ali Bhutto (1928-1979) was deemed as one of the best diplomats of the world and Henry Kissinger appreciated his leadership while speaking at Lahore:

When I was a Professor, many learned articles were written about whether or not individuals made a difference in history or whether history resulted from objective factors that would take the same course no matter who led his country. I believe that all of us who have had the privilege of knowing and working with the PM [Bhutto] understand that individuals do make a difference. We know how he took over this country in a tragic and desperate period and how he has returned it to international respect.<sup>42</sup>

This praise glorifies the Pakistani nation and the coming generations will quote it as a symbol of confidence and respect. It is historical fact that the Pakistani army fought against India and a sizeable portion of them became POW when Bhutto took over. However the nationalism and patriotism exhibited by Bhutto during his meetings impressed upon Kissinger and he could not help paying tribute to the PM in the words quoted above. Should a textbook of Pakistan Studies or History describe it in the Indian point of view? Look at the world history which confirms that all the military expeditions have been narrated in the perspective of their

<sup>39</sup> <https://herald.dawn.com/news/1153304>; see also, <https://defence.pk/pdf/threads/india-and-the-mukti-bahini.380073/>, 18/11/2017.

<sup>40</sup> <http://www.thehindu.com/opinion/op-ed/bangladesh-salutes-indira-gandhi/article2290625.ece>.

<sup>41</sup> Saleem Qamar Butt, ‘Two Nations Theory Stands Vindicated Again,’ *Daily Times*, 23 August 2019.

<sup>42</sup> Speech by Secretary Henry Kissinger, Lahore on 8 August 1976, *Department of State Bulletin*, vol. LXXV no. 1941 (6 September 1976), 317.

respective national standpoint. They pay homage to their martyrs despite knowing the fact the rival dead were also human beings. The PCTB textbooks of Pakistan Studies or History ought to describe the history in the national perspective to infuse a sense of national interest because the children should be educated in a way which in practical life can help them think to protect the national interest.

History books published by the Punjab government are mostly criticized by many regarding text, historical facts and ideological injections especially relating to the freedom movement. The publishers' opinion regarding the Punjab Textbook Board and Curriculum Development Authority was divided on the mechanism adopted by the provincial governments.<sup>43</sup> Some writers are of the opinion that very important historical events have been ignored in the textbooks but mostly the critics jump over the facts while writing against the textbooks of history. To them, history is being distorted and the process adopted by the provincial government needs to be standardized to ensure honesty or unbiased approach while selecting events for the books. The books of History and Pakistan Studies in the schools contain serious mistakes as pointed out by some people in the media and even in the books published by the internationally reputed publishers. Many share objection on the interpretations of the historical events. Faraz Anjum writes:

There is no denying the fact that their version of history, particularly related to East Pakistan crisis, is distorted, biased and incomplete in which the military has been unfairly glorified.<sup>44</sup>

Methodologically, biases in history cannot be deleted but can be minimized because one has right to say that the Bengalis revolted against the central government and proved traitors by joining hands with the secessionists under the Indian conspiracy.

Aamir Riaz highlights problems lying in the process including policymaking, education policy, offices and officers, curriculum and publishers. He contends that sometimes the policy or angle in the curriculum has different thrust but textbooks present the same with contradictory meanings. Aamir Riaz claims to have reviewed the textbooks from 1 to 10 grades (2009-2015) and finds numerous contradictions. The textbooks educate the students that the west had theft knowledge from the books written by the Muslims and attained prosperity and progress. In the same discussion, he condemns that textbooks appreciate the British/west on the establishment of headwork system or other reforms but they don't offer resistance by the local peoples. Nothing is written in the textbooks about Raja Porus, Gandhara, Harappa, and against the martial laws imposed in Pakistan.

---

<sup>43</sup> Appeal by Punjab Publishers Association to Chief Minister, Punjab in Daily, *Jang* (Lahore), 27 December 2013 in favour of new process of public-private partnership. Shahid Dogar supports old mechanism of Punjab Text Book Board, interview by researcher on 31 December 2013.

<sup>44</sup> Faraz Anjum, "Silencing the Past: Role of the Army in 1970-71 Conflict and Its Depiction in Pakistani Textbooks," *Pakistan Vision* 14, no. 1 (2013): 202-231.

The texts provided mean a vivid praise of the military rule and humiliation of the Pakistani politicians. He writes that the period of Maharaja Ranjit Singh is mentioned as 'Sikh rule' which is not right.<sup>45</sup> The books talk of the measures taken by either military or civil rule and if few good policies of the military rule is valued the textbooks lack the political and financial corruption of the Pakistani politicians while we studied a topic of political corruption in the US while studying at Area Study Center, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad. But in our textbooks nothing about the corruption and illegality started and popularized by the politicians is included.

The textbook authors ignored peace, prowess and resisting nature of the Punjab and failed to portray the resistance of the Punjabis against the century-extended attacks and dispute these invasions the culture, language, joviality and prosperity of the Punjab remained intact and alive as usual. Prof. Aziz-ud-Din Ahmed deplores the maltreatment of the textbook authors with the Punjab and the masses. They glorified the aggressors and plunderers who destroyed the peaceful and prosperous the land, society and people. They have demoralized the locals and praised the foreign people, armies, goods, cultures and intellect. They did not mention as to how the Punjabi people suffered at the hands of the foreign attacks without any provocation and then survived despite ruthless and inhuman actions by the invaders against the locals. Such ferocious attacks and maltreatment ruin society, culture and people but Punjab remained always alive, prosperous, jubilant and resistant throughout the history but the authors consciously degraded the brave Punjabis in the textbooks because most of them came either of the tribes belonging to the non-Indian regions or the Darbari (courtiers). The writer further criticizes the textbooks which conceal the killings by the Muslim invaders. The writer points out that the Indian historiography of that period was much influenced by the foreign origin people who being decedents of the non-Indian races had glorified the stories of the foreign invaders despite having different religious affiliations. Alexander and Changez were presented as heroes and their names became popular among the Muslims although they were not Muslims and nobody objected the glorification of these foreign invaders.<sup>46</sup> This is true that Punjab, its culture, martial and peacemaking status, coexistence, language, literature, and resisting potential were totally ignored by the textbook authors and the text still does not offer compatibility with the natural and original Punjabi legacy. However, the two-nation theory based on religion sought the authors to create a link with the Muslims entered in the Subcontinent but this does not mean that the textbooks have ignored other facets relating to the history but yes this is true that Punjabi heritage is yet to be

---

<sup>45</sup> Aamir Riaz, 'Text Books, Education, Politics and Our Youth,' <https://m.youtube.com/watch?v=ZfH8QErirWc>, 20/6/2019.

<sup>46</sup> Prof. Aziz-ud-Din Ahmed, *Punjabaur Beruni Hamla Awar* (Urdu) (Lahore: Book Home, 2014), 15-17.

highlighted properly in the PCTB textbooks.

This is stark reality that the conscious effort to Islamise the History and Pakistan Studies in Pakistan created confusion in the tender minds because bifurcation between History and Islamic Studies should be maintained so that these two subjects as separate branches of knowledge can serve the posterity in a true spirit. Dr. Madiha Afzal shares the same horror that Pakistani governments think religion the sole binding and integrating power for the ethnicities:

What of the different ethnicities and histories of the four provinces? They are omitted. Because linguistic differences threaten Pakistan less, they are acknowledged more in the textbook. Ethnicity worries the state, because it does not want identity to be driven by it. So the state invokes and imposes religion, hoping that it will make the provinces forget their separateness; the Pakistani identity is equated entirely with Islam.<sup>47</sup>

This is the fact that religion remained dormant and impotent power during the East Pakistan crisis while language and culture prevailed in the situation. Similarly, Hazara, Jinnahpur<sup>48</sup> Karachi and Saraiki Suba movements were initiated on the basis of language and culture. Religion well served during the struggle for Pakistan but the post-partition politics revolves around the language and culture.<sup>49</sup> All the provincial textbook boards have been publishing their own books under the guidelines given by the national curriculum and the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment empowered them project their language, history and culture but the national stance should neither be disowned nor dishonoured.

The Nazria-i-Pakistan Trust, Lahore arranged 4<sup>th</sup> Nazria-i-Pakistan Conference in February 2012 to highlight the political and ideological heritage of Pakistan. Numerous plenary sessions undertook the work to seek suggestions to popularize Two Nation theory in the syllabi of Pakistan Studies and History in Pakistan.<sup>50</sup> All the speakers and participants including one ex-federal minister and a scholar from the US suggested to 'Islamise' the contents of Pakistan Studies and History. On my hue and cry that Pakistan Studies should be identified as a separate subject from Islamic Studies few talked to the point but most of the participants lacked knowledge of freedom movement and the primary sources therefore, they were just showing their presence. I think, the major flaw the nation has been facing was the

<sup>47</sup> Dr. Madiha Afzal, 'Erased provincial histories,' *The Express Tribune*, 2 March 2016.

<sup>48</sup> <https://www.amazon.co.uk/Formation-Republic-Jinnahpur-Inevitable-Solution/dp/0595514537>, 11/1/2018.

<sup>49</sup> Akhtar Hussain Sandhu, 'Saraiki Suba Movement in Pakistani Punjab: Viability in Focus,' *Pakistan Perspectives*, Vol. 20, No. 2 - July-December 2015.

<sup>50</sup> I served as Coordinator of the session Group no. XIII on 'How to incorporate the Ideology of Pakistan in the national educational syllabi' in the Nazria-i-Pakistan Conference arranged by Nazria-i-Pakistan Trust, The Mall, Lahore, dated 16-18 February 2012. *The Nation*, 15 February 2012, <http://nation.com.pk/15-Feb-2012/nizami-to-open-4th-npc-on-thursday>.

lack of professionalism and expertise. Therefore, two opinions came up:

- a. People who desire 'true historical facts';
- b. Islamisation of History and Pakistan Studies.

Pakistan emerged as a 'new country' in August 1947 while India became 'independent country' in August 1947 therefore a big difference between the status of India and Pakistan can be noted. Pakistan came into being on 14 August 1947 while India was already there on the map of the world with a sound historical, cultural, religious and civilizational identity. It was Pakistan that emerged as a new country and it was to get recognition from the world and start new life as a sovereign nation. India had infrastructure, buildings, offices, parliament building, embassies in other countries, system, organizations, departments, colleges, universities, airports, naval bases, and working groups in foreign countries while Pakistan lacked all these blessings as a brother separating from his brothers in the Punjab's social setup is supposed to make all arrangements for new and independent living while the brothers living in the parental home do not need to do something. Moreover, Indian units enjoyed political harmony while the Muslim League had to experience a new posture of dealing with pro-Congress groups in different provinces of Pakistan. Religion could no more redeem the ruling leadership from the cultural and lingual biases. The making of history was another important task for the newly emerged nation and sub-nations. Question arises as to why India in general and Pakistan in particular needed to create their own histories? This question tells the importance of syllabi or textbooks. The British occupied India and had introduced their own syllabus which the new countries needed to replace with their own contents. The ruled community had become ruling people now so they were forced to create their own history through new syllabi.

History cannot be created rather history is reinterpreted according to the need and national stance. There were same historical events and facts under the British rule but were to be interpreted in the perspective of Hindu, British, Muslim and Sikh point of view. After 1947, India and Pakistan required their 'national histories' that could infuse a sense of Indian and Pakistani nationalisms for the respective generations. Even groups within these communities could adopt any of the interpretative postures. India cannot justify the Muslim League's political stance while Pakistan cannot support the Congress stance in their textbooks. Dr. Mubarak Ali points out that India and Pakistan tried to construct their histories but Pakistani historians could not perform well and produced weak national narratives and interpretations. "The historians of newly-independent faced tremendous problems." The Pakistani historians "failed to give an effective response to these challenges. Neither the history of the past has been objectively reshaped, nor is the history of the world and civilization studied with the changing interpretations of time." Dr. Mubarak Ali castigates the Universities and history departments which could not produce specific work regarding different fields. Not a single History



Department in any of the Pakistani universities has specific programme or agenda to produce researchers and historians in specific field.<sup>51</sup> Point to be noted here is that not on textbooks, the criticism of the author is on the historians and faculty working in the history departments in the Pakistani universities because they produce human resource for specific fields. Dr. Mubarak Ali embarks on the textbook boards of Pakistan because the textbooks of History and Pakistan Studies were “written by incompetent writers who are not well versed in the subject.” He further complains that these “writers do not include new research findings.”<sup>52</sup> The critique seeks to have good writers so that better textbooks of the History and Pakistan Studies can be authored and published. I do agree with Mubarak Ali quoting my experience while I wrote chapters of History and Social Studies for Punjab Curriculum and Textbooks.<sup>53</sup> Though having no knowhow of history, a bureaucrat heading the PCTB refused to accept few terms such Punjab Premier as being used before 1947 and retained what he wanted, Chief Minister. He tried to remove word ‘Rajput’ and refused to accept new findings such as before Ch. Rehmat Ali, word ‘Pakistan’ already existed.<sup>54</sup> He passed verbal instructions not to use terms ‘Hindu-Muslim,’ instead he suggested ‘non-Muslim’ that could not be followed to avoid a tangible confusion because many non-Muslim communities existed in the Subcontinent. Several new information and untraditional information were discouraged by the head<sup>55</sup> as told by the Subject Specialist. They were of the opinion that the media could pick up any line and highlight it on media as a blunder therefore, it would become impossible for them to satisfy the high-ups. So better to follow the past book version was the best option because if the author had given the same information from the existing PCTB books, it would be justifiable to convince the higher officers.

Facts given in the Punjab textbooks of History and Pakistan Studies or the textbooks having History chapters were questioned by the Pakistani writers and scholars. Their main focus was the errata, incomplete information and interpretation which were perceived and highlighted as ‘distortion’ of history and facts. Much criticism comes to the fore about the distortion of history events relating to the non-Muslims. They highlight that the textbooks disown glorious history of the Subcontinent prior to the Muslim advent in AD 712. The textbooks offer history of the region as dominated by the Muslims only and the pre-Muslim history is not told to the young minds. Some writers follow the outcry by some propagandists without going into the depth of the factual position. Ahsan Butt

---

<sup>51</sup> Mubarak Ali, *In the Shadow of History* (Lahore: Fiction House, 1998), 35.

<sup>52</sup> *Ibid.*, 38-39.

<sup>53</sup> <http://www.ptb.gop.pk/system/files/Social%20Studies%205%20E.M.pdf>.

<sup>54</sup> See chapter 7, Akhtar Sandhu, *Punjab: An Anatomy of Muslim-Sikh Politics* (Lahore: Dogar Publishers, 2014).

<sup>55</sup> Director-General, PCTB.

misperceives that Jamat-i-Islami having much influence in the bureaucracy therefore the syllabi could not be changed. He further writes:

History textbooks encapsulate a state's official narrative for its citizens, and depending on their content, can create and sustain chauvinistic attitudes toward out-groups.<sup>56</sup>

Pervez Hoodbhoy concluded in 2005 that the rewriting history textbooks intended to follow the traditional line under the influence of Jamat-i-Islami which inculcated that Pakistan was achieved to be made an Islamic state:

Viewed from this angle, it becomes essential to project the movement for Pakistan as the movement for an Islamic state, the creation of which became a historic inevitability with the first Muslim invasion of the subcontinent. The revised history of Pakistan uses much the same idiom, and the same concepts of Islamic state and of politics in Islam, as the *Jamaat-i-Islami*. Its wholesale dissemination through educational institutions demonstrates both the influence of the *Jamaat* on education as well as the confluence of interests and philosophy of military rulers and the *Jamaat*.<sup>57</sup>

The history syllabi were revised massively in 2016-17 despite the Jamat-i-Islami was still functioning in Pakistan which testifies that though governments push their respective vision to be highlighted in the syllabi but the *Jamaat* is not a decisive factor in the decision-making regarding content development of the textbooks in the Punjab. The major shift is depending on the knowledge and intention of the subject experts who work as authors and reviewers.

Ahsan Butt quotes Madiha Afzal and establishes his conclusion that the history textbooks in Pakistan have been destroying the minorities and ethnic groups:

In South Asia, research has found that Pakistani textbooks used in social studies, history, and Pakistan studies feature statements that are "entirely one-sided, in favor of Muslims and Pakistan,"<sup>58</sup>

To be clear of the fact that the Pakistani nation cannot adopt the Indian version of history textbooks as the Indian nation does not adopt pro-Muslim League stance in the textbooks. And at present no religious group is targeted negatively or sidelined in the history textbooks in Pakistan. The people having knowhow and fresh knowledge about the textbooks being taught presently in the Punjab schools cannot object to this point as all the historical periods are the part of the school books as partly appreciated by some writers:

On the history front one feels instant relief. Pakistan's date of birth has thankfully been set at 1947 and away from 712 — the year Arab imperial conqueror

---

<sup>56</sup> Ahsan Butt, 'Nationalistic Narratives in Pakistani Textbooks,' file:///C:/Users/User/Desktop/Articles%20Working%20Nov%202017/PB210-Nationalistic-Narratives-in-Pakistani-Textbooks.pdf, 22/12/2017.

<sup>57</sup> Pervez Amirali Hoodbhoy and Abdul Hameed Nayyar, 'Rewriting the History of Pakistan,' www.sacw.net | February 6, 2005, <http://www.sacw.net/HateEducation/1985HoodbhoyNayyar06022005.html>, 23/12/2017.

<sup>58</sup> Ibid.

Mohammed bin Qasim set foot in Sindh.<sup>59</sup>

Mariam Chughtai rightly explores the angle in the research findings about the motives behind the history contents in Pakistan:

I propose the possibility that history education in Pakistan does not foster religious nationalism for the sake of religion, but uses religion as one tool amongst many, to further secular, political, and nationalistic objectives.<sup>60</sup>

Yaar Muhammad sees a positive change in the contents of the Pakistan Studies textbook in 2006 although equality and promotion of all minorities, languages and cultures have been ensured through the Constitution that is told in the textbooks:

A new curriculum for secondary Pakistan studies introduced in 2006. This curriculum attempted to more explicitly recognize the ethnic and religious diversity of Pakistan and aimed to prepare young people as citizens of a democratic society and for global citizenship.<sup>61</sup>

As far as the history is concerned the school students in Punjab are taught about the ancient Indian legacy. The textbooks provide proper information about the worship places and sacred days of the Hindus, Sikhs and Christians in a respectful manner. The syllabus also talks of Buddhism and non-Muslim personalities and rulers when it offers details about the Indus civilization and religious and political history of India.<sup>62</sup> Ancient India produced rich literature and experts in different fields of life. In 771 AD, Sanskrit literature was translated into Arabic (a book on astronomy named, *Sindhanta* by Brahmagupt was translated in Arabic which came to be known as *Sindhind* in Arabic). In mathematics, the most important contribution of India to Arabic learning was the introduction of what called 'Indian Numerals' (*Ruqum-al-Hindiyyah*). Manka (Indian Doctor or tabeeb) treated ruler Harun-al-Rashid<sup>63</sup> during his illness and was richly rewarded.<sup>64</sup> Teachers while talking on the ancient Indian legacy given in the textbooks can throw light on this historical fact if he/she is equipped with the sufficient knowledge relating to the topic. The textbooks of history take up the era from grade 4 to 8 start from Indus Valley Civilization to the current years. It means the students are supposed to study or learn the brief survey of the history of the land from BC to present day.

<sup>59</sup> Pervez Hoodbhoy, 'Textbooks – kudos to Punjab,' Daily, *Dawn*, 25 November 2017.

<sup>60</sup> Mariam Chughtai, 'What Produces a History Textbook?,' Ph.D. thesis (Faculty of the Graduate School of Education of Harvard University, 2015), 2, <https://dash.harvard.edu/handle/1/16461056>, 22/12/2017.

<sup>61</sup> Yaar Muhammad and Peter Brett, 'Beyond binary discourse? Pakistan studies textbooks and representations of cultural, national and global identity,' [http://www.academia.edu/19794616/Beyond\\_binary\\_discourses\\_Pakistan\\_studies\\_textbooks\\_and\\_representations\\_of\\_cultural\\_national\\_and\\_global\\_identity](http://www.academia.edu/19794616/Beyond_binary_discourses_Pakistan_studies_textbooks_and_representations_of_cultural_national_and_global_identity), 22/12/2017.

<sup>62</sup> See textbooks of primary levels. See also Safdar Mahmood, 'Hamara Dou Tok Nisab,' Daily *Jang* (Lahore), 12 June 2016.

<sup>63</sup> Abbasid ruler from 763 or 766 to 809 AD.

<sup>64</sup> SM Ikram, *History of Muslim Civilization in India and Pakistan* (Lahore: Ferozsons Ltd., 1993), 47.

Many people and organizations raised voice from time to time against the anti-minority injections in the textbooks which promoted extremism.<sup>65</sup> Mariam Chughtai presents her analysis that “is grounded in a particular understanding of religious nationalism and identity politics which is essential in conceptualizing religious political extremism.”<sup>66</sup> But sometimes very strange objections are published by some writers. They want to eliminate the ‘national point of view’ from the textbooks as Salman Ali writes:

... students of government schools in Punjab and even other provinces are being taught, “Muhammad Ali Jinnah felt that Hindus wanted to make Muslims their slaves and since he hated slavery, he left the Congress.” At another place in grade-III, it says, “The Congress was actually a party of Hindus. Muslims felt that after getting freedom, Hindus would make them their slaves.”<sup>67</sup>

The empirical evidence verifies that Quaid-i-Azam saved the Muslims from the slavery of the cruel Hindu majority. Sikhs and Muslims were two minorities in the British India. Sikhs decided to remain under Hindu majority and have become ‘slaves’ while the Muslims are a sovereign nation. Congressite Muslims protested against the Hinduised environment of the Congress meetings. The Congress protested against the separate electorates for Muslims but the same for Sikhs was not opposed in 1919. In June 1931, the *Manchester Guardian* highlighted the Muslims’ demand for the separation of Sindh from Bombay and commented that the very demand showed the Muslims’ resentment towards the Congress or Hindu attitude. This demand was leading them to separatism<sup>68</sup> which confirms the anti-Muslim character of the Congress party. No nation can afford to sacrifice the national point of view to appease the dissidents.

The process of publishing books in Punjab seems very transparent and accurate but many problems and practices uglify the exercise. Not only the government but publishers, incompetent subject experts, unemployment, litigation, the non-academic attitude of the administration, and favoritism may be responsible for the low-standard of the contents and even reaction in the form of objections. The problem starts with the subject expert whether in the stage of writing a book or reviewing the manuscript. Romila Thapar unveils that the senior Indian professors thought it low standard work to write a book for a school or college.<sup>69</sup> The university professors like a well-paid project that means leaving the space for non-

<sup>65</sup> <https://themuslimissue.wordpress.com/2013/10/20/textbooks-in-pakistani-government-schools-teaching-hate-against-christians-and-hindus-jihad-and-martyrdom-to-young-students/>; see also, <http://www.reuters.com/article/us-pakistan-education/pakistan-province-rewrites-text-books-to-satisfy-islamic-conservatives-idUSKBN0IJ1G820141030>.

<sup>66</sup> Mariam Chughtai, ‘What Produces a History Textbook?’, V.

<sup>67</sup> Salman Ali & Saira Ahmad, ‘Pakistani Textbooks Controversy,’ *Daily Times*, 13 November 2017.

<sup>68</sup> Tara Chand, *History of Freedom Movement*, vol. IV (Lahore: Book Traders, n.d.), 167.

<sup>69</sup> Romila Thapar, *The Past and Present: Forging Contemporary Identities Through History* (New Delhi: Aleph Book Co., 2014).

academic people. Textbooks particularly the history and Pakistan Studies undergo the same problem and writers having no research experience compiled material taken from different books into a new manuscript. Even books written by laymen were published with eminent names just to make a smooth move to the official recognition or recommendation.

To many writers, the standard of the textbooks in Punjab can become better if the approved manuscript is publicized on the website for the feedback from all stakeholders. KK Aziz was highlighted by the media and so-called academicians considering the History textbooks as half-truth:

In Pakistan, histories related to the ideological make-up of the country have been gradually mutated; a process in which, over the decades, every major political debacle has seen the insertion of a series of brand new half-truths in school textbooks.<sup>70</sup>

KK Aziz and many others criticize that Sir Syed Ahmad Khan cannot be included in the freedom movement leaders because he stood against the anti-British Indians in the war of 1857.<sup>71</sup> By accepting this contention, we will have to deal with the anti-Bhagat Singh attitude of MK Gandhi and exclude Gandhi from the Indian freedom movement. Actually, question arises, what the War of 1857 aimed at was to get rid of the British while the nonviolent groups of the Indian peoples opined that the mighty British could not be expelled from India by force, therefore, the best way was to accept their authority for the time being and fight for their rights and then freedom could be attained gradually. Both the camps in 1857 intended to serve the communities by liberating the land from the British colonists. Sir Syed Ahmad Khan won over the British hearts and led the Muslims through a nonviolent strategy to secure a respectable position in the government as well as in the society. The Hindus and Sikhs adopted the same policy and popularized the gradual struggle. They accepted the constitutional writ of the British and prepared their respective communities to fight for the rights and finally independence. Therefore, leaders either pro-British or anti-British became the Muslim heroes because both tried to seek a reasonable position and honorable future for the Muslims. Therefore, historians having an objection to the contradictory attitude of the Muslim groups in the War of 1857 could not comprehend the situation properly and wisely.

Volume or space in textbooks is the main issue while writing textbooks of history, Pakistan Studies, or social studies. Few pages are allotted to the textbooks at different levels and all events cannot be included in these pages, therefore, the authors are forced to be selective in picking up the relevant material from the sources keeping the level of the children in mind. The book entitled *Murder of*

---

<sup>70</sup> Daily, *Dawn*, 17 April 2014, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1101992>. The statement quoted by Nadeem Piracha. <https://books.google.co.uk/books>.

<sup>71</sup> KK Aziz, *Murder of History*, 198.

*History* contains about 260 pages merely highlighting objections and errata. Redressing the objections mentioned in this book requires hundreds of pages for one textbook while the history section of the textbooks consists of few pages. Interestingly, all the critics wrote hundreds of pages against the history and Pakistan Studies textbooks but they did not dare to write few pages as ‘model’ or ‘alternative textbooks.’ This verifies the antagonistic egotism and issue of material benefits by many involved in this fight. Therefore, the critics can be classified into two categories including academic people and businessmen. The latter have disputes with the PCTB regarding publishing, printing, and distribution share and several cases are in progress in the courts as well. Sometimes, they provide data to the media and try to embarrass the PCTB administration so that they could adopt a bargaining attitude. Media in Pakistan is an effective source to harass the officers. Critique by the academicians on the contents is partly a sincere input but three dimensions create doubt about their sincerity:

1. They are well aware of the issues of errata, allocated pages, national narratives as a universal phenomenon as a compulsion but even then they kept on crying against the textbooks.
2. They did not write any textbook as a model although it was a less time-taking effort than the writings against the textbooks.
3. They mention that the government and other authorities did not give them importance ramifies the personal ego and rapacity to gain some profitable place.

Educating the new generations in the perspective of national perspective and historical heritage is not a flawed version instead interpretation based on unlinked historical events is not a healthy and productive exercise (as the Unionists and others are discarded in the syllabus). Textbooks of history and Pakistan Studies published in Punjab present a specific or national point of view and it is an international phenomenon that the countries select topics to promote nationalism and patriotism. Many quote the textbooks in the western countries having no stride to educate a specific ideological narrative but the fact is that the big countries having glorious heritage stretching over centuries do not need to preach such things at the school level rather the prestige already persists in them that the members of a big nation feel. The newly emerged states need to create national narratives to unite the multicultural and multi-religious identities. The Pakistani and Indian governments seek and change the narratives because their status has changed from a rule to the ruling nations. Despite all verbosity, the big countries never seem to surrender their nationalism and patriotism. The USA adopted ‘The Pledge of Allegiance’ in 1892 which infuses respect of US flag and this Pledge maintains and creates a sense of unity and nationalism among the American people who recite it placing hands on their hearts:

Every morning across the United States of America, over 60 million teachers and students recite The Pledge of Allegiance. Congress sessions open with the recitation of the Pledge, and it is recited at many public events:

*I pledge allegiance to the Flag  
of the United States of America,  
and to the Republic for which it stands:  
one Nation under God, indivisible,  
With Liberty and Justice for all.*<sup>72</sup>

The UK schools suggest readings or books to the students which not only mention ‘selective personalities’ but also present entirely a British national narrative. The book entitled *Heroes of History* suggested by the Kates Hill Primary School, Peel Street, Dudley (UK) to the students contains not a single Muslim leader while it covers the era from 1478 BC to 2014. It mentions MK Gandhi but only as a nonviolent strategist. It also distorts history:

Gandhi was horrified by the violence caused by Indian’s partition (dividing up) after independence. He traveled to rioting areas to try to stop the Hindu-Muslim conflict.<sup>73</sup>

The above-mentioned text shows that after the partition of 1947, MK Gandhi was visiting the troubled areas of the Punjab and Bengal therefore he was killed by a Hindu fanatic while it can hardly be verified. Just read what the killer<sup>74</sup> of MK Gandhi spoke in the court that is different:

I do say that my shots were fired at the person whose policy and action had brought rack and ruin and destruction to millions of Hindus ... I bear no ill will towards anyone individually, but I do say that I had no respect for the present government owing to their policy, which was unfairly favorable towards the Muslims. But at the same time, I could see that the policy was entirely due to the presence of Gandhi...<sup>75</sup>

This book does not mention about ‘divide and rule policy’<sup>76</sup> and killings inflicted by the British. It talks of Malala Yusufzai as anti-Taliban voice in few lines although she is neither a general nor a political leader. It gives Talibans a term ‘an

<sup>72</sup> Read original text, <https://books.google.com.pk/books?id=ObKAXxGdmMkC&pg=PA298&dq=Pledge+of+Allegiance+since+its+creation+in+1892.&hl=en&sa=X&ved=0ahUKEwiyIOvohtHVAhWOzRoKHXshAi4Q6AEIJTAA#v=onepage&q=Pledge%20of%20Allegiance%20since%20its%20creation%20in%201892.&f=false>.

<sup>73</sup> Anita Ganeri, *Heroes of History* (Dorking, Surrey: Weldon Owen, 2015), 150.

<sup>74</sup> Nathram/Nathuram Godse, a member of RSS and Hindu Mahasabha, belonged to a devotional Brahmin family.

<sup>75</sup> *Hindustan Times*, <http://www.hindustantimes.com/analysis/the-politics-of-an-assassination-who-killed-gandhi-and-why/story-iUJqKjuw0sP9nAfc5KcOII.html>, 7/12/2017.

<sup>76</sup> I don’t believe in it but most of the historians highlight this as the policy of divide and rule.

extremist Islamic group’<sup>77</sup> despite knowing the difference between ‘Islamic’ and ‘Muslim.’ Talibans are extremist Muslim group instead of Islamic group. There is even no mention of Holy Prophet (PBUH) and MA Jinnah. This book discusses the War of Waterloo (1815)<sup>78</sup> in which Napoleon Bonaparte was defeated but not a single war has been given in which Britain was smashed by the French General. The GCSE-History book starts with the definition and explanation of ‘sources’ in the following words:

Sources are things that historians use to find out about and make sense of the past.<sup>79</sup>

The words ‘make the sense of the past’ mean to fabricate the events into a specific direction otherwise a historian can’t take up the history of all the nations and notions along with all the interpretations as a conceptual framework of his writing. Mohinderpal Singh Dhaliwal stated that the Indian syllabus has overlooked anti-British Ghadrites while the British syllabus ostensibly has ignored the services of the Indian soldiers in the world wars.<sup>80</sup> Therefore, the national or specific narrative or mindset guides the writer who has to look at the sources under the intellectual influence though this influence can be further influenced reversely by the facts found in the primary sources. Big statues of the British soldiers hoisted in the roads of London impress upon every passerby reminding the British victory over the other nations. These displays can be observed and perceived as ‘mass textbooks’<sup>81</sup> which overawe the peoples coming from all over the world. Similarly, all the nations display the status of their national heroes which means to the national heritage and prestige. In 2015, the World Sikh Organization of Canada joined hands with the Christians who were arguing in the case of *Loyola High School v. Quebec (Attorney General) at the Supreme Court of Canada* on the issue of teaching the “Ethics and Religious Culture” that the school ultimately won.<sup>82</sup>

The World War convinced the New Zealand authorities to teach the students especially about ‘patriotism.’<sup>83</sup> New Zealand went into battle in both World Wars without hesitation despite its geographic location and small population. Kerin

<sup>77</sup> Anita Ganeri, *Heroes of History*, 144.

<sup>78</sup> *Ibid.*, 80-83.

<sup>79</sup> *GCSE-History-OCR: Schools History Projects* (For the Grade 9-11 course), [www.egpbooks.co.uk](http://www.egpbooks.co.uk). Students of Kate Hill Primary School Dudley are studying the book.

<sup>80</sup> Interview of Mohinderpal Singh Dhaliwal in Sathi ke Sang Sang at MATV 22/3/2018 at 9:10 pm (London).

<sup>81</sup> Term ‘Mass textbooks’ is defined as the displays showing victory and prestige as signs of pride exhibited in parks on buildings, roads, public places and banners etc. by a nation.

<sup>82</sup> Gian Singh Sandhu, *An Uncommon Road: How Canadian Sikhs Struggles out of the Fringes and into the Mainstream* (Vancouver: ECHO Storytelling Agency, 2018), 200-201.

<sup>83</sup> [http://learn.burnside.school.nz/pluginfile.php/43847/mod\\_resource/content/1/WWII%20children.pdf](http://learn.burnside.school.nz/pluginfile.php/43847/mod_resource/content/1/WWII%20children.pdf) 12/11/2017.



Freeman, novelist, and author, has worked in a Girls College with girls having behavioral and learning disabilities, said that patriotism is taught to all students, infusing them with a sense of national prestige, responsibility, and pride. New Zealand schools' curriculum contains material on patriotism because they believe they live in a great country where anyone can succeed if they want to. New Zealand, though a small island, that thinks it is a much bigger one.<sup>84</sup>

Boundaries and national flags are among the major components which popularize and ensure love for the country. Boundaries and national flags are respected by all respective nations which are taken as the biggest symbols of nationalism and patriotism. Muslims in post-partition India have been striving for decades to be acknowledged as the loyal and true Indians but they were never trusted. This struggle still continues because the BJP extremists are following religious while the Muslims and moderate Hindus under secular cloak are respecting 'territorial nationalism.'<sup>85</sup> The BJP extremists tried to distort history by deletions and additions relating to the Muslim rule and areas making Pakistan. The onslaught or wave of the 'religious nationalism' in the form of Modi<sup>86</sup> government in India has alarmed the people who vociferated on the secular character of the Indian society and the theocratic mannerism of the Pakistani setup. The All-India Muslim League was presented with the same dichotomy for decades but its demand for Pakistan was declared as a divide and rule policy of the British.<sup>87</sup> The painful experience of the Indian National Congress ministries in 1937 moved the Muslims to demand Pakistan on 23 March 1940. Romila Thapar testifies the decades-old phenomenon of Muslim separatism after facing the extremist Hindu authorities in India and despite it the voters' decision to crown the religiously extremist Hindu religious political party when she writes that "Hindu and Muslim communalists had their organizational bases in the 1920s such as the Muslim League and the Hindu Mahasabha. Despite it being in essence anti-nationalist, the two-nation theory is now effectively not questioned. If anything it is once again being endorsed by some political parties."<sup>88</sup> The secular minds are perturbed on the Hindutva politics which can repeat the history of the 20<sup>th</sup> century India. Nevertheless, teaching and learning history can be classified into two types:

	<b>Types</b>	<b>Age</b>	<b>Objectives</b>	<b>Status</b>
--	--------------	------------	-------------------	---------------

<sup>84</sup> Kerin Freeman, novelist and author from New Zealand, online interview with the researcher on 12 November 2017.

<sup>85</sup> Read book entitled, *Muslims against Partition* by Shamsul Islam.

<sup>86</sup> *The Indian Prime Minister Narendra Damodardas Modi belongs to Bharatiya Janata Party.*

<sup>87</sup> British had no policy of divide and rule in British India as no documentary evidence testifies it and moreover not riots but peace perpetuates and strengthens rule. Communalism was the side-effect of the newly introduced policies by the British. See, [http://www.nihcr.edu.pk/latest\\_english\\_journal/reality\\_of\\_divide\\_rule.pdf](http://www.nihcr.edu.pk/latest_english_journal/reality_of_divide_rule.pdf).

<sup>88</sup> Romila Thapar, *The Past and Present*., 111.

		<b>Group</b>		
1.	National History/ Educational History (Textbooks)	Tender age	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Construction and justification of nationalism/patriotism.</li> <li>• Interpretation of historical events according to the national standpoint.</li> <li>• To produce loyal and responsible citizens (outcome).</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Biased /value loaded</li> </ul>
2.	History (as knowledge)	Mature age	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• History as a file of events</li> <li>• Philosophy of history.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• History as a pure subject</li> <li>• All interpretations/sc hools of thought are studied</li> </ul>

National or educational history aims at creating patriotism and nationalism in the minds of the posterity therefore this objective can be achieved through curriculum and syllabi. Curriculum is developed by the highly educated academicians who set targets along with instructions to materialize the objectives and expectations. Curriculum guides the textbook boards to design textbooks for schools or educational institutions. The notable point is that syllabus educates generations to solve intellectual intricacies in the perspective of their respective culture and heritage that moves specific people to a specific direction. Youth reaching sane and mature age enters university which imparts knowledge relating to all the incomplete information of the historical events they had read at the schools. University opens horizon of the students by offering them comparative studies, philosophical positions, research, debate, open dialogue and criticism at the international standards. At this stage, the textbook knowledge steers them out to comprehend the comparison with other stances in the history along with the nationalistic interpretation and if some of the youth adopt defiant attitude as a dissident group they must be influenced by the philosophy or internationally recognized path of intellectuality. Such dissidents prove assets of the nation and humanity because they will come up with tremendous capacity to see things or events beyond self-centered and traditional interpretations. Educationalists have divided class into different categories such as dull minded, sharp minds and average students that is also a vivid reflection of a society which provides different minds to different professions. In university life, students are referred to libraries and archives because now they, after receiving specific recognition and having maturity in differentiating national interests and anti-national stance, are capable to see things in the perspective of international and humanistic realities. All sorts of shelves of books

are open for university students to conclude events after studying several schools of thought or divergent interpretations. This process can produce good historians, authors, leaders, philosophers, theorists, economists, engineers, sociologists, true critics and scholars in any field of knowledge.

Objection that the important historical events have been skipped from the textbooks of History and Pakistan Studies and has created confusion is also a one-sided picture. Zarina Salamat suggests incorporation 'peace' in the textbooks while Dr. Maliha desiring problems and grievances of the ethnicities in Pakistan to be included writes about Balochistan that "Balochistan has risen up in five insurgencies, the fifth one ongoing, never mentioned in its own country's textbooks."<sup>89</sup> Personality studies, study of an era or ethnic group, historical events and the events with clear vision and interpretations covered in thousands of pages generally cannot be accommodated in the limited space of the textbooks. Even the teachers will need Ph.D. qualification to teach at schools if the reservations by the critics are accommodated. If just a mention of the historical events or timeline creates confusion in the tender minds, then how the Indian history from 712 AD to 1857 AD can be elaborated within 40 pages? History is being taught in the Punjab from grades 4 to 12 without deletion of any ruling period. Look at the pages allocated to History and Pakistan Studies textbooks at different levels:

Grade/Class	Book Name	History Period	Exercise	Pure Subject Pages	Comments
4 <sup>th</sup>	<i>Muashrti Uloom</i>	2500 BC-1947	2 pages	11	Pictures, tables, and exercise reduce further space
5 <sup>th</sup>	<i>Muashrti Uloom</i>	1857-2013	3	7	Pictures, tables, and exercise reduce further space
6 <sup>th</sup>	<i>Tareekh</i>	Indus Valley to Advent of Mughal Dynasty (3800BC-1526AD)	-----	----- -	-----
7 <sup>th</sup>	<i>Tareekh (Mughal Rule)</i>	1526-1857	-----	----- -	-----

<sup>89</sup> Dr. Maliha Afzal, *The Express Tribune*, 2 March 2016.

Grade/Class	Book Name	History Period	Exercise	Pure Subject Pages	Comments
8 <sup>th</sup>	<i>Tareekh</i>	1857-1947	16	54	Pictures, tables, and exercise reduce further space
9 <sup>th</sup>	<i>Mutalia Pakistan</i> , (2015-16)	1857-1947	10	41	Moreover, pictures and pages on ideology further restrict the space
10 <sup>th</sup>	ibid.	ibid.	ibid.	ibid.	
11 <sup>th</sup>	History of Muslim World <sup>90</sup>	Europe, World Wars, Decolonisation, Cold War, etc,			
12 <sup>th</sup>	<i>Mutalia Pakistan</i>	1857-1947 1947-2014 Topics relating to society, government, culture, etc. Including chapter on Hazrat Umar (RA)	12	26 Total Book: 145	It contains 11 chapters: history of freedom movement, early problems, Geography, Measures to make Pakistan a democratic state, Government system and good governance, culture, languages, national unity and prosperity, economic planning, women rights, foreign policy.

Source: Publications by the Punjab Curriculum & Textbook Board, Lahore.

The table shows a narrow space to elaborate history and Pakistan Studies being taught at different levels in which the authors are restricted to pick very prominent topics and narrate them in few sentences. Fatima Sajjad also suggests to ‘discuss

<sup>90</sup> Curriculum by Federal Government, <http://pctb.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/History%20Of%20Modern%20World%20XI-XII.pdf>.

multiple perspectives on history instead of the ‘official narrative’<sup>91</sup> which totally ignores the issue the space, time, low qualification and biased personality of a teacher. Can the critique as demanded by the objectionists be accommodated in this space? Definitely, it is next to impossible to place historical details relating to all schools of thought including Hindu, Sikh, British, Leftist, Rightist, Unionist, Mahasabha, Khaksar, Ahrar, Jatt Sabha, Momin, and other regional interpretations in this little space. Mariam Chughtai suggests to narrate all the causes of the separation of East Pakistan in the textbook:

..... educating readers about the deeper causes of the territorial split, textbooks gloss over state culpability in both the outbreak of, and violence during, the crisis. Instead, they highlight how regional or global powers conspired to create Bangladesh, with little fidelity to the historical record.<sup>92</sup>

One can compare the pages allocated to the textbooks at different levels and the suggestion by the scholar will encroach all the allocated space and by this all other topics will be needed to exclude from the textbook.

The History textbooks fully reply to the critics who believe that ancient legacy has been deleted from the PCTB textbooks. A textbook tells about Ashoka in the following words:

Historians believe that Indian history remembers Ashoka as a great ruler. It is noteworthy to mention that numerous foreign kings ruled over India but Ashoka came of indigenous identity and was a wise ruler<sup>93</sup> (translation).

The text relating to Bin Qasim in the Punjab textbook grade 5 includes the narrative in the following lines:

Muslim rule in the Subcontinent started in 712 AD with the conquest of Muhammad bin Qasim. At that time, Muslim rule had spread to the Arab and neighboring areas. Muhammad bin Qasim conquered Sindh after defeating Raja Dahir. Multan was also captured after further expeditions. Muhammad bin Qasim fixed stipends for Hindu and Buddhist leaders and extended honor and respect. Weighing this respect for the non-Muslim, many embraced Islam. Despite onslaught by the foreign invaders, the people of Sindh, Punjab and other regions continued their living according to their cultures.<sup>94</sup>(translation)

Maharaja Ranjit Singh has been described and admired in the textbook in the following words:

Maharaja Ranjit Singh was a brave and famous ruler of the Sikh period. He

<sup>91</sup> Dr. Fatima Sajjad, ‘Revising Curriculum for Tolerance: A View from Practice,’ [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/310784451\\_Revising\\_Curriculum\\_for\\_Tolerance\\_A\\_View\\_from\\_Practice](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/310784451_Revising_Curriculum_for_Tolerance_A_View_from_Practice), 9/2/2018.

<sup>92</sup> Mariam Chughtai, ‘What Produces a History Textbook.’

<sup>93</sup> *Moasharti Uloom (Social Studies) Grade 4*, (Lahore: Punjab Curriculum & Textbook Board, 2016-17), chapter 2’ see also Safdar Mahmood, daily *Jang*, 17 June 2016. Chapter 2.

<sup>94</sup> *Moasharti Uloom (Social Studies) Grade 5*, (Lahore: Punjab Curriculum & Textbook Board, 2017), 24.

established his rule in Afghan areas, Kashmir and Punjab. No foreign invader dared to attack the Subcontinent during his reign.<sup>95</sup>

Mention of the two-nation theory depicts reality without any exaggeration:

The two-nation theory means that two big nations, non-Muslim and Muslim, were inhabiting in the Subcontinent and Hindus constituted a majority. Although, both the nations had been living side by side for centuries but could not be merged into each other. A combined and one society could not exist and the very reality offered the foundation of the Two-nation theory<sup>96</sup> (translation).

The impact of Islam on the social life of the Subcontinent blocked the possibility for the Hindus, Sikhs, and Muslims to be merged into one identity therefore, all these nations retained their identity on the basis of religion. The textbook Grade 4 talks of the Congress in the following words:

In 1885, an Englishman AO Hume established a political party, Indian National Congress so that people's grievances might be conveyed to the British government. This party worked under the auspice of the British government and several Englishmen presided over its annual meetings. And in 1947 after independence, an Englishman (Lord Mountbatten) became first Governor-General of India.... No student could become a member of Congress.<sup>97</sup> (translation).

All are facts mentioned above can be verified from the documents and books written by the Hindu and non-Muslim authors. Five Englishmen presided over the annual meetings from 1885-1918 including George Yule in 1888, William Wedderburn in 1889 and 1910, Alfred Webb in 1894, Henry Cotton in 1904, and Annie Besant in 1917. Mehrotra quoting the reason for inviting the Britons writes, the "Congress deliberately chose Britons as presidents to prove its loyal, moderate and non-racial character."<sup>98</sup>

The world in different ways adopts a method to teach 'national history' as an intellectual injection that Pakistan also needs to do. This may be called 'interpretational History' which translates the historical events according to the national narrative or standpoint. One event reflects communitarian standpoints as separate electorate right in British India is interpreted and argued differently by the British, Hindus, Muslims, and Sikhs and at the moment all these communities or nations teach their respective interpretation because it is the duty of the policymakers to produce generations who love their country and work for its bright future. Similarly, the Pakistani generations have right to understand history in the

<sup>95</sup> *Moasharti Uloom (Social Studies)* Grade 4, (Lahore: Punjab Curriculum & Textbook Board, 2016-17), 17-18.

<sup>96</sup> *Moasharti Uloom (Social Studies)* Grade 5, 24.  
<http://pctb.punjab.gov.pk/system/files/Social%20Studies%204%20E.M.pdf>.

<sup>97</sup> *Ibid.*, 25.

<sup>98</sup> SR Mehrotra, "The Early Indian National Congress, 1885-1918: Ideals, Objectives and Organization," in By BR Nanda, ed., *Essays in Modern Indian History* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1980), 45-48.

perspective of the freedom movement, a historical legacy that differs from others' points of view. To permeate the nation's heritage, the government ought to popularize 'national history' without distortion and religionization of the historical events in the schools. Historical events interpreted in the perspective of the communitarian stand in British India are deemed as national or ideological heritage that India and Pakistan educate their youth through syllabi. Clark writes that syllabi construct nationalism.<sup>99</sup>

No country can introduce too many points of view or schools of thought at school level because too long narratives will be a burden on the tender minds, therefore, inclusion of all events and points of views at school level would be an impractical idea. Picking up the events relating to the national standpoint is a national right and prestige and the posterity ought to be given feelings of having affiliation with a respectable and brave nation and this is not a Pakistani standard rather this is an international criterion under which the educational history or national history is written and taught at the school level. India, Bangladesh and Nepal have incorporated the official stances relating to history and geography in the textbooks. *Financial Times* published a report on the distortion of history, geography and syllabi which reflects the nationalization of history and geography. Stephen Colbert devised term 'truthiness'<sup>100</sup> that means refusal from historical facts and declaring the national narratives the only truth. It aims at denying the true historical facts. India has law to imprison for 6 months the person who publishes unofficial map. Now the BJP has suggested 7 month imprisonment along with 1.50 crore dollars. The bill seeks that the maps showing disputed areas as parts of India will have the official and legal status. The campaign to revise the syllabi of Rajasthan, the Hindu extremists tried to exclude Jawaharlal Nehru from the textbooks. They have been endeavouring to mute the Muslim period of rule in the textbooks.<sup>101</sup> In the Indian schools, the students are taught that the meat eaters "easily cheat, tell lies, forget promises, are dishonest and tell bad words, steal, fight and turn to violence and commit sex crimes."<sup>102</sup> Truthiness term makes no sense as the national point of view serves the purpose very well in this regard.

Bangladesh got freedom from Pakistan therefore its syllabi present Pakistan as enemy country while many Pakistanis believe the Bengalis as traitors who conspired with the help of India against the motherland. The European countries are not allowed to refuse the holocaust in their syllabi. The ruling party of Hasina

<sup>99</sup> Anna Clark, *Teaching the Nation: Politics and Pedagogy in Australian History* (Carlton, Vic. : Melbourne University Publishing, 2006), 4

<sup>100</sup> National History or Educational History means to represent a specific ideological stance which does not negate the historical facts rather counters the rival interpretations.

<sup>101</sup> Edition of Daily *Jang* (Lahore), 23 May 2016.

<sup>102</sup> "<http://www.riazhaq.com/2010/07/hindutva-distortions-whitewash-history.html>, 22/12/2017; see also, Five Bizarre 'Lessons' in Indian Textbooks," BBC News, September 23, 2015, last accessed June 1, 2016, [www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-34336826](http://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-34336826) in Ahsan Butt.

Wajid has been trying to suffocate the rightists just because they, according to the Bengali extremists, debate that during the Awami League's movement lakhs of Bengali people were killed while the research tells the death toll was in thousands and this group of the Bengalis just exaggerated the figures<sup>103</sup> to defame Pakistan's government and army. Nepali and Europeans are also involved in the same 'truthiness.'<sup>104</sup> The question whether this is distortion of history and geography or not is worth discussing. To understand this phenomenon, this is important to differentiate between 'distortion' and 'interpretation' of history. To negate the reality of Indus Valley civilization and showing this civilization in south India is a distortion that is unjust endeavour to kill the truth while to interpret any historical event in the national perspective is right of a country, society or social group. Just look at the departure of the Britishers from the Subcontinent, the British interpret it as a 'transfer of power' and 'honourable return' while the Indians translate it as a result of their freedom struggle. Dr. Mubarak Ali depicts the same:

In India and Pakistan, the role of these freedom fighters is highly eulogised in order to give them the right to rule the new nations. Interestingly, British historians describe the freedom struggle as a 'transfer of power', implying that the change that took place was a voluntary surrender of power and not as a result of struggle. These two interpretations reflect two antithetical approaches to history.<sup>105</sup>

The critics while writing against the textbooks of history and Pakistan Studies forget the main point that the PCTB publishes history/Pakistan Studies books from grade 4 to intermediate classes only but they usually start criticism on the textbooks but slip to the university courses. Fatima Sajjad takes up the issue of national curriculum as directed by the Supreme Court of Pakistan but claims the university students as the lab and she writes, the 'current study examines the response of this new directive in university classrooms.'<sup>106</sup>

Dr. Madiha talking of the regional heroes desires to consolidate regional information and impart the students of all the provinces of Pakistan:

What of ethnic heroes? When the Bacha Khan University attack happened on January 20 in Charsadda, it is likely that many Pakistani schoolchildren outside Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa were wondering who exactly Bacha Khan was. Their textbooks are to blame. In Pakistan's narrow conception of history and in creating a national identity in opposition to India, the tragedy is that Pakistani schoolchildren do not even learn about one another.<sup>107</sup>

The writer wants that the school going children should be taught about the

---

<sup>103</sup> Edition of Daily *Jang* (Lahore), 23 May 2016.

<sup>104</sup> Ibid.

<sup>105</sup> Mubarak Ali, *Pakistan in Search of Identity* (Delhi: Aakar Books, 2011), 65-66; see also, [http://el.doccentre.info/eldoc/n00\\_/02nov02EPW.pdf](http://el.doccentre.info/eldoc/n00_/02nov02EPW.pdf), 16/11/17.

<sup>106</sup> Dr. Fatima Sajjad, 'Revising Curriculum for Tolerance: A View from Practice.'

<sup>107</sup> Dr. Madiha, *The Express Tribune*, 2 March 2016.



personalities such as politicians, educationalists, warriors, poets, philanthropists and so on from all the regions of Pakistan. Apart from the practicality of this vision, to serve this purpose, how many pages are required to add is another problem because voluminous book will be hard to absorb, teach and learn. Another problem arises regarding the pre-partition histories of different regions in Pakistan. The national narratives accommodate only pro-Pakistan movement leaders in the textbooks while the anti-Pakistan personalities may be mentioned with respect but not as political heroes because once an anti-Pakistan leader is given prestige the next demand will come from Jamat-i-Islami, Jamiat-ul-Ulama-i-Pakistan, etc. to include their people in the syllabi. Moreover, some so-called secular intelligentsia could demand the inclusion of MK Gandhi and J. Nehru. All this will sabotage the national history. India has not included MA Jinnah in the Indian textbooks who fought for Hindu-Muslim unity and Indian freedom. Someone can demand to include Maulana Abul Kalam Azad in all the textbooks despite his name was not included in the Indian textbooks. In secular India, Tamil Nadu published textbook at 10<sup>th</sup> level and in the chapter titled 'The Indian Press and Literature' there is no mention of any Muslim newspaper or journalists like Maulana Zafar Ali Khan, Hasrat Mohani, Allama Iqbal.<sup>108</sup> In Pakistan, the regional histories and cultures are mentioned in the textbooks at least published by the PCTB but this is also a true picture that the regional heroes being disputed in terms of Pakistan movement are skipped. But the curriculum produced by the Higher Education Commission for BS/MS in Pakistan Studies contains all the regional leaders, cultures and movements.<sup>109</sup> However, the textbooks of all the provinces should mention about the regional languages and cultures while mention of the political 'heroes' should start from BS/graduate classes but all such textbooks should be monitored by a central authority to check distortion of the historical facts under the national narrative as the children and disciples of the specific groups who opposed Quaid-i-Azam and Pakistan movement have been claiming their pre-partition leaders as the founders of Pakistan. Such leaders' bright aspects or their standpoint can be hinted briefly in the textbooks but not as heroes during the Pakistan movement. Instead their social services can be elaborated.

The next problem is the weak role of the bureaucracy in the Punjab. They are unable to afford single news true or false published in the media against them. If happened the big boss immediately holds inquiry against some lower grade officer to show his efficiency despite he knows that the accused is totally innocent. News was aired in a TV program that the PCTB had deleted the names of the

---

<sup>108</sup> Safdar Mahmood, 'Hamara Dou Tok Nisab,' Daily, *Jang* (Lahore) 17 June 2016.

<sup>109</sup> The author was a part of this activity and worked as Secretary of the committee. See Syllabus of Pakistan Studies 2013, Higher Education Commission, Islamabad. See, <http://hec.gov.pk/english/services/universities/RevisedCurricula/Documents/2012-2013/pakistan%20studies%202012-13.pdf>, 16/11/17.

pictures of the martyrs of 1965 and 1971 wars. The bureaucrat might have received order to restore things without any delay. I was called immediately by the PCTB officials and got instruction to include the pictures. I turned over the pages and came to know that the syllabus of the book goes till 1947. I explained that the news was not true because the textbook of next class already covers the era from 1947 onward and it contains the two wars along with all the relevant pictures. They replied that they were not ordered to take the opinion instead to ensure the inclusion of the pictures. I was sure that the objection was not raised by the defence office and bureaucracy had lost the nerves that the government could snatch the office from the DG on the very news. I suggested the inclusion of all the prominent personalities such as Malala Yousufzai, Abdul Sattar Edhi and Arfa Kareem Randhawa in the chapter of Heroism. They agreed and the problem was over. The Sindh textbook Board had already included the names of Malala Yousufzai, Abdul Sattar Edhi and Arfa Kareem Randhawa in the elementary school books.<sup>110</sup>

Printing the textbooks by private publishers is concerned with their business only who usually take the issues to the courts<sup>111</sup> and media because being affluent and politically well connected people they pressurize the PCTB easily. Mariam Chughtai explains the same in the following words:

...private publishers had become a politically well-connected and powerful faction by then. A PTB staff member commented that at times private publishers dictated their terms to PTB senior staff, as opposed to the other way around; they tell PTB which clauses suit them and which do not, and can adjust the rules on late deliveries and associated fines.<sup>112</sup>

Involvement of the pure business minded faction in the preparation and printing of the textbooks has proved a stunning blow to the standard and professionalism. Though the private publishers may have some genuine reasons in filing writs against the PCTB but it damages the spirit and image of the organisation. Such pressure paves the way for bargaining and ultimately corruption to get rid of the agony of the court procedures. Sometimes, they manage anti-PCTB propaganda through media. Genuine or weak, news items published against the PCTB embarrass the administration and they run after the media men to search and bargain with the people behind these pieces of the news. Many of the government officers in the Punjab are so scared of the political government that they relegate to the bargaining position and this fulfills the real desire of the blackmailing group. High-ups at the provincial level don't have a deep look at the news and the intention and honest working of the officers and take action against the PCTB management while the PCTB high-ups put responsibility on the subordinate staff. By this the junior

<sup>110</sup> <https://tribune.com.pk/story/686885/education-gets-politicised-as-textbooks-and-heroes-are-changed/>.

<sup>111</sup> <http://nation.com.pk/06-Jun-2017/verdict-reserved-on-petition-against-ptb>.

<sup>112</sup> Mariam Chughtai, 'What Produces a History Textbook?', 196.

are punished just because why the news was published. No officer possesses potential and courage to understand and defend the official standpoint. The Punjab lacks a big number of the strong officers who have exercised integrity and honest power to resist the injustice inflicted by the political government or blackmailing groups. The weak attitude by the officers let the corrupt go and by this many media men would be appreciating their working and wisdom but actually this is ruinous and damaging sign that leads to decay and utter failure of the institutions and capability of offices. For example, I wrote the history portion of 5<sup>th</sup> class in which map of the Punjab showed Azad Kashmir as disputed area under the national stance. A journalist published an article in colour edition of a famous daily on 27 May 2016 against the map and wrote that PCTB's book has eliminated Azad Kashmir from the map of Pakistan.<sup>113</sup> He wanted that Azad Kashmir should have been displayed as a part of Pakistan. The scared officers of the PCTB called me and sought strategy to counter this news. I suggested writing a note of clarification and sending it to the high ups who might be thinking to take action against them. I also requested them to send the same to the Chief Editor of the daily so that he could know what game his journalists were playing with the PCTB but I am sure the PCTB could not have dared to point out this mistake made by the journalist and he succeeded in the game of exploitation.

## CONCLUSION

The PCTB textbooks of History and Pakistan Studies have massively been changed therefore the most of the critique has proved obsolete and irrelevant but few people are still using the outdated version of critique on the new textbooks. The critique is relating to errata, interpretation, skipping events, ignoring counter-narratives and leaders, verbosity, focus on Muslim heritage, using wrong nomenclatures, wrong data, and so on given in the past PCTB textbooks of History and Pakistan Studies. Are errata a distortion or murder of history? History can neither be distorted nor murdered because the file of events is history under the definition. 'History is the name of past events not comments.' Interpretations in a specific direction create several schools of thought and such interpretational history stems from 'history' therefore history retains and preserves its purity and authenticity. History can be defined as the subject of events organized chronologically based on direct evidence. This study finds no major flaw in the PCTB textbooks of History and Pakistan Studies. 'Distortion of history' in the textbooks highlighted by many writers and media persons is in fact 'interpretation of history' in the light of the national narratives which is the duty of a state to educate the generations about their political legacy. At the same time, infusion of

---

<sup>113</sup> Daily *Jang* (Edition), 27 April 2016, Lahore.

hatred against other nations and groups is not a healthy attitude in the interpretation of historical events. Hatred should be remembered but ignored for the goodwill and humanity. Textbooks ought to be the tool to infuse patriotism, nationalism and humanism. It ought to teach love for all and hatred for hate only. Peace education pedagogy aims to ensure holistic understanding of issues, debate and sense of analytical capacity among the students<sup>114</sup> and the very contents offer such positive environment in the Punjab's schools. The main problem is that the objections on the textbooks come on the assumption that the state or Pakistani or Punjab government is backing such 'distortion' of history if it exists. The Pakistani government approved the curriculum on the nationalistic lines with clear objectives as the universities approve course contents and the rest of responsibility goes to the relevant teachers. The provincial governments following the workable procedure and SLOs (student learning outcomes) produce the textbooks keeping in view the national needs. The textbooks of History and Pakistan Studies have a bit weak aspect that the PCTB functions in the hands of the least interested bureaucracy in academics, incompetent experts and business tycoons. The experience of outsource textbooks proved unworkable in the presence of nepotism and corruption by the provincial ministry and the subordinates. Therefore, the process of the textbook publication is excellent but the problem lies in hiring the services of subject specialists for writing and review. The other problem is the textbook board administration consisting of non-academic people like non-academic minded bureaucrats and retired army men. Many critics of the textbooks create confusion because they criticize the textbooks (classes 4-12) but targeting the undergraduate and graduate levels. As cried, no 'distortion' of history in Pakistan Studies and History textbooks can be verified as a national policy but errata, skipping events, interpretation, or national point of view like issues have been perceived and propagated as a distortion of history. Few assert that the Pakistani nation does not need textbooks because this system creates a specific mindset however the people have a specific domestic and social environment and norms that may be taken as a family or social textbooks. After all, the parents have specific dreams and goals and to achieve such goals they need a specific environment, literature, and mindset. Therefore, I think, all have curriculum and textbooks as the parents set objectives for their children to achieve in life by following certain lines. Similarly, the new generation needs to have some objectives, direction, and vision to follow and contribute to life, society, and humanity. Why curriculum and syllabi were created and implemented in all the western countries in the past is a piece of evidence to understand the phenomenon that every country requires return (aims and objectives) from the education sector if they spend a huge budget on it. The main

---

<sup>114</sup> See Peace Education Program; A Professional Development Course for Educators <http://www.achva.ac.il/sites/default/files/achvafiles/r%26d/institute/rd/PEP%20Curriculum%20FINAL%20-%20Sep2011%20Revision.pdf> accessed July 26, 2016, p 162.

objectives of the curriculum are to create patriotism and the capacity to serve humanity. National Education Policy 2009 (Pakistan) sought to promote ideology as enunciated in the Constitution, create religious harmony and respect cultural and religious diversity.<sup>115</sup> Pakistan follows the policy through intellectual injection and definitely, most of the countries do the same. Parents tell successes and applaud for their ancestors to infuse a sense of pride and psychological confidence among the posterity. No parents can degrade their forefathers and appreciate the others or rivals. Similarly, no country can insult their historical legacy and highlight the grandeur of the rivals in its syllabi. Self-confidence and respect pervade and retain a sense and desire to survive as a member of an honorable nation that possesses honourable history, culture, and religion. The authors' critique on history in Pakistan seems an endeavor to get the attention of the governments for having lucrative places and at least admitting their importance and acknowledgment. If they get nothing from the government, at least media projection is not a less prestigious objective although it is a one day highlight. Otherwise, history has proved that it cannot be 'murdered' because history is a record of truth, realities, and facts. Umayyad and Abbasid in Muslim history, foreign attacks and oppressive Mughal rule in Subcontinent history, Gen. Zia-ul-Haq in Pakistan and BJP governments in India made their utmost endeavor to distort the history but their sinister ambitions were repulsed and decried by the scholars and researchers that shows history is and will be alive as a true record of human activities. If some author distorts facts it does not mean the demise of the facts. Historical facts can be attacked and reinterpreted in favourable and antagonistic perspectives but the 'facts' can never be 'murdered.' Therefore, KK Aziz adopted title '*Murder of History*' just to dramatize the writing otherwise 'reality' survives in any case. Falsehood is rejected based on the truth therefore if someone claims the 'murder of history' it is based on the 'history alive.' 'Falsehood' is recognized based on the 'truth.' The critics ignore usually the space allocation as the main problem while writing textbooks of history, Pakistan Studies, or Social Studies. A little space in textbooks cannot welcome all the events and schools of thought, therefore, the authors are bound to select the events and briefly mention them keeping the level of the children and space in their mind. Dr. Mubarak Ali and others mainly speak against the incapability of the writers of the textbooks in Pakistan but many present their critique as a distortion of history. Every nation spends huge funding on the schooling of its young citizens. 'National narrative' exists behind 'national interest' and every policy pursued by any government. Many countries offer specific syllabi with specific objectives. These objectives are mainly relating to nationalism, patriotism, and humanity. This worldly trend as practiced by Pakistan or PCTB also has its educational policy which plans to produce responsible and patriotic citizens.

---

<sup>115</sup> National Education Policy 2009, Government of Pakistan, <http://unesco.org.pk/education/teachereducation/files/National%20Education%20Policy.pdf>, 23/12/2017.

Distortion of history as blamed is not a true picture of the textbooks because these books contain text-based on respecting the other religions, cultures, and people. Sometimes, critics admonish that the textbooks start Pakistan's history from Muhammad Bin Qasim that is the wrong perception because the textbooks start from Indus Valley Civilization up to recent history with mention of Ashoka as a great ruler. It also discusses Maharaja Ranjit Singh and other non-Muslim rulers in an accurate way.<sup>116</sup> Interestingly, the critics produced hundreds of pages on the critique against the PCTB textbooks of History and Pakistan Studies but could not write few pages as model textbooks of these subjects.

\*\*\*\*\*

---

<sup>116</sup> *Social Studies* Grade 4, Chapter 2. See also Safdar Mahmood, daily *Jang*, 17 June 2016.

## Recommendations

The study recommends the following steps to redress the grievances and observations:

1. The Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board should be administered by the academicians only. In case of Ph.D. qualification or research contribution or special interest in research or academics, bureaucrats or army men can also be engaged in the administration.
2. Qualification of the authors of textbooks and reviewers can be determined officially to engage the best stuff. Ph.D. and research publications can be the criteria.
3. Syllabi of History and Pakistan Studies ought to be quantified properly according to the capacity of the students.
4. No immediate action like inquiry and transfer of the PCTB officers/officials should be taken on the news published or broadcasted on television. Action like transfer or inquiry under PEEDA Act against any official should not be recommended until the internal inquiry has proved the allegations.
5. Publishers should not be involved in authoring books instead they can be hired only for printing purposes.
6. National consensus through political leaders, historians, and statesmen can be concluded on the regional heroes and the agreed life sketch of the regional heroes may be included in the textbooks of all provinces/units. However, the textbooks of all the provinces should mention the regional languages and cultures as they do and the mention of the heroes should start from BS/graduate classes.
7. The PCTB should send a written invitation to the researcher or writer critical of any textbook for authoring a book as a model addressing all the reservations pointed out by him/her. The model books should be advertised on social media to seek feedback from the people of different strata of life.
8. Only subject specialists should teach History and Pakistan Studies in schools.
9. Manual for Teachers based on skill to link lessons to peace and harmony must be published and taught in capacity building programs.
10. Hate Studies have become an important subject so one chapter can be added to Social Studies.

# US SANCTIONS ON IRAN AND ITS IMPACTS ON IRAN'S ECONOMY

**Zainab Mohsin,**

Lahore College for Women University, Lahore

**&**

**Sana Rasheed,**

Lahore College for Women University, Lahore

## **Abstract**

This paper discusses a proposed nuclear deal that was around the corner that would limit the Iranian Nuclear Program and in return sanctions over Iran will be lifted. Iranian nuclear program has been a threat, according to the Western powers, to global peace. Started as a peaceful civil program in collaboration with the West, it turned into a pursuit of nuclear warheads that triggered alarms of the Western powers. To limit this pursuit, sanctions were imposed on Iran that limited the Iranian economy drastically and by 2011 it nearly crumbled. Now with an agreement, the sanctions will be lifted resulting in the revival of the economy of Iran. Iranian oil will once again be traded in the open market and inflation will decrease in Iran as well as unemployment.

**Keywords:** Sanction, Nuclear Warheads, Global Peace, Iranian Economy, Unemployment, Iranian Oil

## **INTRODUCTION**

On April 12, 2015, Iran agreed to restrict its nuclear to a great extent as a result of the negotiations of Iran with the west. This agreement will relieve both the west as well as Iran in the way that it will sigh relief to the west for not having another nuclear-armed state that can compromise global peace and for Iran it will soften the sanctions that have halted the Iranian economy for a decade or so. Iranian nuclear program was a major concern for the international community since 2002 after the news leaked out that the Iranian nuclear program is no more a civil nuclear program now and there are secret facilities that might be involved in the pursuit of nuclear weapons. This forced the international community to impose certain sanctions on Iran and tried to force her to stop their pursuit of nuclear arms. For this



purpose, permanent members of the Security Council of United Nations i.e. United States, United Kingdom, Russia, China, and France plus Germany (known as P5+1) tried to negotiate with Iran to stop her to produce nuclear arms that can be a threat to world peace. In response to these negotiations, Iran always had a strict stand of not to bow against the western powers and to remain in pursuit of a nuclear-armed Iran. What mocked the west, mainly the United States was that this nuclear program was initiated with the help of them in the middle of the 20th century and this fact was, in fact, a great burden on their shoulders. On the other hand, Iran has also suffered in the past decade or so, with no trade with Europe and North America, the Iranian economy saw a substantial decrease as those were the main markets of Iranian oil and Persian rugs.

Now with the agreement around the corner, both the parties can have a sigh of relief. Iran most probably will sign the agreement and will be bound to accept the policy of non-proliferation of nuclear arms that will ensure global peace to a great extent while it will give the chance to Iran to grow her economy once again once the limited sanctions are lifted. So, in this way, there is a win-win situation for both. In this article west will see a brief history of the Iranian nuclear program alongside the history of the US-Iran relationship. We will then see how this proposed agreement will affect the Iranian economy and its impact on the world economically and politically but first, we will see an account on the timeline of this agreement.

## **COOPERATION AGREEMENT ON IRANIAN NUCLEAR PROGRAM**

The negotiations between Iran and IAEA were going on since 2002 and P5+1 were involved in these negotiations since 2006 but the breakthrough came in November 2013 when Iranian Minister Javed Zarif and Catherine Ashton, leader of the P5+1 negotiating team, signed the agreement known as Joint Plan of Action in Geneva. This agreement was to layout specific measures both the parties had to take in six months and also to construct a framework for workable and durable solutions. According to this plan, Iran had to cut off some of her stocks of Uranium and also to give access to IAEA to monitor nuclear sites. Iran will receive some relief in sanctions in return and no more sanctions will be imposed on Iran. In response to the Joint Plan of Action, Iran started halting its uranium enrichment to the agreed amount and also gave access to IAEA to its nuclear sites including Arak Heavy Water Reactor. The US and the EU also responded by taking off certain sanctions decided in the Plan.

In May 2014, Iran and P5+1 started drafting the agreement. They also announced further steps Iran had to take before 25 August. In July 2014, P5+1 agreed to give another \$2.8 billion to Iran as funds. In November 2014, Foreign

Ministers of all the P5+1 countries met the Iranian delegates in Vienna where they saw a way forward in negotiations and extended the circle of negotiations. They announced that they will reach a political agreement by March and will try to implement it till June 30, 2015. They also agreed on continuing the practices adopted in the result of the Joint Plan of Action and also made additional commitments. In December 2014, Iran once again announced that her nuclear program is peaceful and showed her hopes for the comprehensive agreement to be successful.

In the early trimester of 2015 numerous meetings took place between Iran and P5+1 leaders in which they tried to finalize the general framework of the comprehensive agreement. Meanwhile, the Prime Minister of Israel showed his concerns over Iranian intentions. On April 2, Iran and P5+1 announced the agreement on a general framework in which the parameters of the nuclear deal were outlined. Both the parties were bound to finalize the deal till June 30. Later, both the parties met again in further meetings and continued drafting the agreement and are hopeful that it will be completed till June 30.<sup>1</sup>

## **HISTORY OF US-IRAN RELATIONSHIPS**

The US-Iran relationships have been a rollercoaster ride for the past century or so. The main reasons for these relationship shifts are oil, religious sentiments, military growth, economy, and the most important alliances. If we dig history we see that Iranian oil has been a reason for Iran's importance for the west. Iran was one of the major suppliers of fuel to the Royal Navy in the south during World War I. In World War II, Iran was in control of the British and Russia in the south and the north respectively. After the war was over the United States forced both Britain and Russia to withdraw from Iran and this started a healthy relationship between Tehran and Washington. The U.S. helped Iran to develop a strong economy and helped to build infrastructure following modern times. Meanwhile, Russia refused to withdraw her forces from Iran but after the threats from United States Stalin rationally withdrew the forces but the northern oilfields were still in his control. Britain also had control over Iranian oilfields and was not willing for profit-sharing; when Mossadegh, the then Prime Minister of Iran, announced his intentions to free Iranian oilfields from the British once again Americans came to prevent any conflict by convincing the British on profit-sharing. Enraged on this, the British MI6 planned a coup d'état by pursuing Shah to overthrow Mossadegh's government and asked Americans for support but couldn't get any positive response from them because Mossadegh got hints of the plan and in response, he expelled the British diplomats from Iranian soil.

---

<sup>1</sup><https://www.armscontrol.org/factsheet/Timeline-of-Nuclear-Diplomacy-With-Iran> [Last Visited: May 5, 2020 at 1:41 AM]

With the change in government in the States, things changed as well. A shift in the relationship occurred when Eisenhower took over the government. Eisenhower's team was skeptical towards Mossadegh as they considered the Iranian government close to Moscow and were spooked on alleged communist effects in Iran. To counter these vibes, the United States' high-ups empowered Kermit Roosevelt, a veteran CIA agent, to carry "Operation Ajax" in which the Shah would hand over the government to General Zahedi through a royal decree but this plan backfired when Mossadegh ignored the decree and issued an arrest warrant for Zahedi. With the complete failure of Operation Ajax, Shah fled to Rome, Zahedi disappeared and the CIA was back on thinking of alternatives. Enraged with the results Roosevelt, in collaboration with MI6, mercenaries loyal to Shah to stage a street power show that helped Zahedi to gain some authority and arrested Mossadegh and made way for Shah to return to Iran. This was one of the so-called victories of the U.S. against communism in the Cold War by overthrowing an elected Prime Minister and derailing democracy by clearing the way for a pro-American government in a non-democratic way.<sup>2</sup>

With the end of Mossadegh's government, the romance between the Shah and U.S. government continued when Shah resolved the Iranian oil issue in a pleasant manner and also by joining CENTO. Iran also established ties with Israel, to please the U.S., to limit Soviet influence on the Middle East and North Africa. In the early 1960s, Tehran suffered a major turmoil when riots erupted due to the economic policies of Shah. To solve this problem American president Kennedy invited Shah to Washington to help him design a framework to bring change, known as the White Revolution, in the economy; to satisfy the people by launching reforms in every sector of life and to induce modernization among the masses. The response of the revolution was not very welcoming by the landlords and regional clerics and they called this Westoxification. Among the critics of the revolution was Ruhollah Khomeini who was banished by the Shah on extensive criticism on the plans. The White Revolution brought drastic changes in Iran and put her economy on a fast track while the U.S. remained the most important factor in the success. To make a stronghold in the Middle East and to counter USSR's moves during Cold War, President Richard Nixon offered Shah the "Nixon Doctrine" according to which Nixon permitted Iran to buy any non-nuclear arm and arsenal. Shah accepted this offer whole-heartedly and did buy military equipment of \$13 billion worth from 1972 to 1977 and also made huge profits in the oil trade during the Israel-Arab war.

Once again change in Oval Office brought changes in the relationships between Washington and Tehran when Jimmy Carter took over the government. He was not very happy with Shah's policy and during a meeting in Washington, he

---

<sup>2</sup> <https://www.armscontrol.org/factsheet/Timeline-of-Nuclear-Diplomacy-With-Iran> [Last Visited: May 5, 2020 at 1:41 AM]

asked Shah to change his policies. Though Carter was not convinced of Shah's policies still he acknowledged that Iran was a land of peace when her surroundings were troublesome areas.

Meanwhile, pro-Khomeini protests continued in Iran against Shah's policies and Shah continued to dominate them by force. During such attempts of oppression, Iranian security forces killed hundreds and injured thousands on more than one occasion. This made the situation worse and for the first time in forty years, America seriously thought of an Iran without Shah. Pahlavi was exiled to Egypt and Khomeini returned. Under Khomeini's leadership, anti-American protests continued as according to Khomeini it was essential to cleanse Iran from "the Great Satan". In such an attempt of cleansing Khomeini's supporters attacked the U.S. embassy in Tehran and 53 U.S. diplomats were made hostage for the next 444 days. This made the U.S.-Iran relationship on the worst stage in history. On January 20, 1981, Iran released the hostages but the relations between Tehran and Washington remained cold.

After 1981, the US-Iran relationships remained unchanged. U.S. helped Saddam in the Iran-Iraq war and Iran supported Islamic radical groups like Hezbollah who was fighting against the U.S. in Lebanon. America had to face two enemies in the 1990s Iran and Iraq who were enemies themselves making a triangle in which all three sides were enemies. Mohammad Khatami became President of Iran in May 1997 and was eager to restore ties with America but Clinton asked him to cease support to Islamic radicals in Lebanon and to halt the Iranian nuclear program. Meanwhile in 2002 secrets of the Iranian Nuclear Program leaked out; George W. Bush announced Iran a terrorist state and put Iran in "the Axis of Evil" alongside South Korea and Iraq. To return the favor Khatami condemned America on attacking Iraq and Iranian intelligence worked side-by-side with Iraqi Shia militants in guerilla warfare in Iraq.

In June 2005, Mahmoud Ahmadinejad, a conservative Islamist, and pro-Khomeini became President of Iran and openly announced his plans of making Iran a nuclear state. He also called for Jihad against America and Israel. With the time the U.S.-Iran relations got even colder and in 2009 Bush left the Oval Office and Barack Obama became the President of the United States of America. Obama was keen for a new beginning and wanted a healthy relationship with the Muslim world including Iran. He also admitted that it was a wrong move on part of Americans during the Cold War when an elected government was overthrown. Obama asserted multiples times that Washington wants a healthy relationship with Tehran if Tehran is willing to do so though Ahmadinejad outrightly rejected it as mere talks. In 2009, presidential elections were held in Iran and extensive bloodshed was witnessed. Despite the decreasing popularity of Ahmadinejad he once again stood victorious.

America had reservations over the bloodshed but remained quiet as it was supposed to do more harm than good.

In the 2013 Presidential Election of Iran, Hassan Rouhani became President. Rouhani is a moderate Muslim and wants good relations with the west. Rouhani showed positive intent towards nuclear talks and arranged meetings with P5+1. He also had a phone conversation with President Barack Obama registering the first direct conversation between the two presidents in more than three decades through the general public disliked it and protested against it. It is hopeful with Hassan Rouhani as President that Iran-U.S. relations will bloom further in the future ensuring global peace.

### **HISTORY OF IRANIAN NUCLEAR PROGRAM**

Iranian Nuclear Program is a major concern for Western powers in the past decade or so. This is the same nuclear program which was started with the help of western powers for civilian purposes in the 1950s is now considered, by western countries, as a major threat to so-called world peace and now in the last thirteen years, it has been a matter of uncertainty after a dissident group revealed some documents revealing a secret nuclear program of Iranian government which was defiance of Non-Proliferation Treaty which Iran did sign in 1968. Iranian Civil Nuclear Program was running smoothly until the Iranian Revolution in 1979 when Shapour Bakhtiar, the then Prime Minister of Iran, canceled the deal for the construction of two nuclear power plants.

In 1988, the nuclear program restarts after the Iran-Iraq war, and Saddam's interest in military supremacy in the region also triggered this step. In 1995, Russia and Iran signed a deal according to which Russia will help Iran to build two nuclear light water reactors at Bushehr. Due to suspicions over the Iranian Nuclear Program that Iran is in pursuit of nuclear weapons U.S. President Bill Clinton imposed sanctions over Iran alongside Libya. In 1999, Mohammad Khatami visited Saudi Arabia, the first by any Iranian leader since 1979, and met King Fahd and showed his concerns over the Israeli nuclear program. Both countries acknowledged that the Middle East should be nuclear-free.

The year 2002 holds an important position in the history of the Iranian Nuclear Program when an Iranian rebel group Mujahedeen Khalq leaked out an underground nuclear project which was previously unknown to the United Nations that included a uranium enrichment plant at Natanz and a heavy water plant at Arak. This triggered a wave of criticism over the Iranian Nuclear Program and U.S. accused Iran of pursuing weapons of mass destruction. Meanwhile, Iran asked

Russia to speed up the construction of the nuclear plant at Bushehr.<sup>3</sup> When, in 2003, America invaded Iraq on account of Iraq's weapons of mass destruction, the Iranian Supreme Leader ordered to suspend the Iranian Nuclear Program. Iran also agreed to be allowed to inspect its nuclear sites.

In 2005, when Mahmoud Ahmadinejad became president of Iran he openly announced of making Iran a nuclear state. Known as an Islamic conservative, Ahmadinejad, despite the UN Security Council's call to halt it, he refused to do it in enmity of Israel. In 2006, Iran restarted the reactor in Natanz for uranium enrichment and a heavy water production plant in Arak. A few months later, the UN-imposed first round of sanctions on Iran. In the coming years many talks were ended in deadlock and many secret missions were installed in Iranian Nuclear Program by the West and Israel to analyze the nuclear program due to lack of confidence between Iran and the West. These missions resulted in destabilizing the nuclear program as well providing enough evidence to the Security Council that Iran is definitely in pursuit of a nuclear warhead.<sup>4</sup> In June 2010, a new round of sanctions was approved by UN and till November 2011, more sanctions were imposed.

In the start of 2012, Iranian economy started to tumble and till the last trimester of 2012 it got worse. Till the mid of 2013, Iran continued to increase her uranium enriching capability but things changed in August 2013 when Hassan Rouhani was elected as President of Iran. Rouhani was keen to make amends and raise the Iranian economy. For this purpose, he started serious talks with the West and also started slowing down the uranium enrichment. He allowed I.A.E.A. to inspect the sites and nuclear facilities. In November 2013, Iran halted the nuclear program in result of an accord to give some window to negotiate. In response to this, the West started lifting sanctions over Tehran. On April 2, 2015, Iran and world powers agreed on a proposed agreement whose framework is yet to be drafted but hopefully, things will be resolved before the June 30 deadline.

## **SANCTIONS OVER IRAN**

Sanctions are imposed over Iran by the international community including United States of America, the European Union, United Nations Security Council and many other countries because of Iran's refusal to suspend Iranian Nuclear Program. These are the sanction on military, diplomatic, economic and trade issues. Following are some of the sanctions over Iran.<sup>56</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup><http://theconversation.com/iran-nuclear-deal-should-boost-economy-yet-unknowns-remain-39770>

<sup>4</sup><http://theconversation.com/iran-nuclear-deal-should-boost-economy-yet-unknowns-remain-39770>

<sup>5</sup><http://www.state.gov/e/eb/tfs/spi/iran/index.htm> [Last Visited May 5, 2020 at 3:28 AM]

<sup>6</sup><http://www.bbc.com/news/world-middle-east-15983302> [Last Visited May 5, 2020 at 3.41AM]

- To block the transfer of weapons, components, technology, and dual-use items to Iran's prohibited nuclear and missile programs
- To target select sectors of the Iranian economy relevant to its proliferation activities
- To induce Iran to engage constructively, through discussions with the United States, China, France, Germany, the United Kingdom, and Russia in the "E3+3 process," to fulfill its nonproliferation obligations.
- Restrictions on trade in equipment that could be used for uranium enrichment.
- An asset freeze on a list of individuals and organizations that the EU believed were helping advance the nuclear program, and a ban on them entering the EU.
- A ban on any transactions with Iranian banks and financial institutions.
- Ban on the import, purchase, and transport of Iranian crude oil and natural gas - the EU had previously accounted for 20% of Iran's oil exports. European companies were also stopped from insuring Iranian oil shipments. These sanctions had halted the Iranian economy and till 2011, Iranian economy really crumbled. With the smell of nuclear deal in the air these sanctions are likely to be lifted.

### **IMPACTS ON IRANIAN ECONOMY**

There is an Old Iranian proverb that "A good year can be recognized through its spring time. So spiritually Iranian New Year started with a major hike with the proclamation of nuclear deal between Iran and six world powers on April 2.<sup>7</sup> Iranian people celebrated this deal as their victory and welcomed the nuclear negotiating team which was a very positive impact of this proclamation. Moreover on April 4, (the first full working day after the New Year holidays), the Iranian rial got strength in trading, which was a very optimistic sign for the local business community.

Certainly, this deal isn't finalized yet but it is expected to be achieved by the middle of this year and if both the sides manage to agree on this comprehensive deal then it would lead to the lifting of important sanctions (including economic and financial) by the end of this year. So let's have a look at some of the economic yardstick based on the above assumption.

### **FOREIGN EXCHANGE RATE**

The first positive impact of the declaration of Lausanne was a strengthening of the Iranian Rial spite of the rate is recovered to its previous position of 33,000 rials to dollar & on the other hand official foreign exchange rate is about 28000 rials to dollar however strengthening of the rial is also a challenge to Iranian exporters because they will have to bear 15 percent annual inflation. So Iran needs

---

<sup>7</sup><http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2014/11/20/world/middleeast/Iran-nuclear-timeline.html>

to develop such policy that will not enfeeble their export. Hence it is expected that after the finalization of this deal both these rates will inline towards 32,000 rials doing the groundwork for having a single exchange rate by the end of 2015.

### **UNEMPLOYMENT AND INFLATION**

Unemployment rate in Iran is about 10 %. Tackling the unemployment is in Hassan Rouhani's (seventh president of Iran) top priorities and his management has controlled seasonal ups and downs in it. This deal will definitely give hike to their economic activity that will lead to creation of new jobs. It is very obvious that after this very deal transactions will increase which would make the ground for the creation of new jobs and opportunities. New investments by foreign private sector companies will also help to boost the economy. Moreover Iranian officials believe that planned aggrandizement to the tourism will create new jobs and opportunities. Consequently, this deal will definitely reduce the unemployment and will leave a positive impact on the socio-economic phenomena.<sup>8</sup>

Reducing the inflation rate from 42% to 15 % is Rouhani's government notable achievement. Their target is to reduce it to single digit figure and this could be practicable if government can bear the impacts of this eclectic deal. Experts are expecting a reverberation in housing sector that will increase the housing prices and then government would have no choice except to enact subsidy reforms which is supposed to rise in fuel prices. We should also know that Iran hasn't seen single digit inflation rate since 1989.

### **OIL AND GAS PRODUCTION AND EXPORTS**

Iran has attained about \$152 billion in foreign trade in the past year there is no doubt that Iran's foreign trade will sprout up after the lifting of sanctions. Iranian importers will be looking forward to import needed goods and machinery etc. directly and without legal nuisance. On the other side, country's exporters would have new international markets and opportunities.<sup>9</sup>

Iranian administration reckon that after lifting of the sanctions they can escalate export and production by 1 million bpd (barrels per day) but it's not that easy. Experts suppose that country can reinstate about 400,000 bpd of production comparatively swiftly but it will require more investment for further capacity but Iran can give boom to her actual exports by using the 30 million barrels of oil that it is stored over the last two years, It will also rise Iran's hard currency revenues. Oil and Gas production will also benefit from new technology from European and American companies. Despite of sanctions regimes Iran has managed to keep on

---

<sup>8</sup><http://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2014/11/20/world/middleeast/Iran-nuclear-timeline.html>

<sup>9</sup> <http://theconversation.com/iran-nuclear-deal-should-boost-economy-yet-unknowns-remain-39770>



increasing their gas production and now after lifting the sanctions will accelerate the production.

## **INTERNATIONAL REPERCUSSIONS**

The global peace, once that was threatened, will be ensured again, partially though. Iran has got a pretty important strategic location and holds a huge impact on global oil trade. Iran is on the north of “Strait of Hormuz”, an important point which connects Persian Gulf to Indian Ocean. About 20% of world’s traded oil passes through this point. Iran in 2011, announced that she will block this point if sanctions are not lifted. Luckily, at that time it did not happen but it was a continuous threat to the oil trade. With the agreement about to be signed this threat will be minimized.

Iran and Arab world has disputes for a long time based on sectarian conflicts. With this deal the Arab world do got some reservations and they might be rethinking their policies towards the west. This could affect the world drastically as Arab world holds an important position in world industry due to their oil reserves and natural resources. This might influence the oil prices as well.

## **CONCLUSION**

As a result of this deal Iran will get relief from Western sanctions and access to nearly \$4.2bn of frozen assets in eight installments. Although the deal hasn't finalized yet but psychological boost created by this deal would be sufficient enough to create noteworthy economic momentum. Hence, this deal irrefutably will give rise to Iranian exports. There is nothing to worry about but if agreement is not put in action by both the parties concurrently then the agreement will be suspended. With this deal some threats on the global peace would be eliminated. Iranian economy who crumbled in 2011 will lift up and Iranian oil will once again be the part of worldwide industry. Persian rugs will be exported once again that will furnish the mansions around the world. If the other powers don't consummate their commitments release Iran's frozen money abroad, Iran is ready to recommence enriching uranium to 20 percent.

\*\*\*\*\*

## BOOK REVIEW

<b>Book:</b>	<b>Speaking Like A State: Language And Nationalism In Pakistan</b>
<b>Author:</b>	<b>Alyssa Ayres</b>
<b>Language:</b>	<b>English Language</b>
<b>Year of Publication:</b>	<b>2016</b>
<b>2012</b>	
<b>Pages:</b>	<b>230</b>
<b>ISBN:</b>	<b>1107404436</b>
<b>Reviewer:</b>	<b>Adnan Tariq</b>

A cultural historian Alyssa Ayres is a prolific writer in the South Asian region. Her first award (American Institute of Pakistan Studies book prize for 2011-2012) winning book entitled '*Speaking Like a State: Language and Nationalism in Pakistan*' published under Cambridge University Press in 2009. The next year she was appointed as deputy assistant secretary of state for South Asia from 2010 to 2013 under Barack Obama's administration on her seminal work. She covered all issues regarding the above mention region and provided policy direction for four American embassies and consulates. She has co-edited three books on India and Indian foreign policy entitled such as *Power Realignment in Asia*, *India Briefing: Takeoff at Last*, and *India Briefing: Quickening the Pace of Change*. Her recent book entitled *Our Time Has Come: How India is Making Its Place in the World* was published by Oxford University Press in 2018. Her book titled *Speaking Like a State: Language and Nationalism in Pakistan* is one important contribution in the studies of Pakistan as this book tries to procure a framework on the role of history, language and its relationship with the nationalism in the newly incepted state of Pakistan. Because of its content which deals with nationalism, culture, and politics of Pakistan, this work occupies a seminal space in the scholarship on the relevant subject. This book explore a debate regarding the questions of definition of nation, and possibilities of its role in shaping modern south Asia. Author has taken the conceptual assistance from the underpinnings of ideas of nationalism and its various possible contours and defines the nation as "the nation, after all, claims and organizes political sovereignty- statehood over discrete territory". Writer calls globalization a threat to the nation but on the other hand, she also finds that the local impulses have been inevitably inherent to nationalism. In this context of conceptual underpinnings author tried to trace the growth and spread of nationalism which operate through the political logic of cultural difference. Thus it enables different people to have a right to rule them. Only national languages enjoy stronghold as strong and coherent pivot of national life and this came only through the state

practices of regulating language laws, state education institutions, and media campaigns. Language plays a vital role in the shaping of national identity. This book argues that language plays in the creation of national identity in the nation-state of Pakistan as a tool of modernity. Throughout the world, debates about national identity inevitably revolve around the politics of the culture, in which language serves as a cause, a solution, a muse for the national self, and a technology of the state.

This book investigates the language-culture-nation linkages through a paradigmatic and important case of Pakistan. International attention increased towards Pakistan most importantly after the growth of radical Islamic extremism and its threat to Pakistani civic life. The international community also has two more concerns such as the dominant role of Pakistan's military and the country's struggle to regain civilian rule. It deals with the question of Pakistan's cultural identity, emblemized through language which remains a source of conflict and internal competition. It also focuses on nationalism and the nation by sharing the experiences of western Europe, Eastern Europe, and the Soviet Union. Drawing upon Pakistan's cultural history with comparative reference to India and Indonesia and how these three countries conceptualized, defined, and legislated their national cultures. It also throws light on how ideologies of language impact public policy and how policies of culture-making impact public life. She employed two theoretical principles such as primordialism and instrumentalism. Dr. Ayres beautifully connects her ideas in the theoretical framework of the book in the most articulating way and used scholarly language, which increases its importance among readers. I liked this book in totality but chapter seven impressed me a lot that explores the rule of Urdu language dominates nationalist historiography which does not match with existing Pakistan. She emphasizes newer efforts to write the new historical narrative that demand the inclusion of Punjabi and Sindhi heroes by using regional language sources that exhibit different narratives of ethnicity and even of heroism. Her engaging and thought-provoking study is required reading for historians of South Asia interested in language politics.

## BOOK REVIEW

<b>Book:</b>	<b>Resistance Themes in Punjabi Literature,</b>
<b>Author:</b>	<b>Shafqat Tanveer Mirza</b>
<b>Language:</b>	<b>English language</b>
<b>ISBN:</b>	<b>978-1-987900-16-3</b>
<b>Year of Publication:</b>	<b>1999.</b>
<b>Pages:</b>	<b>221</b>
<b>Publisher:</b>	<b>Sang-e-Meel Publications Lahore.</b>
<b>Reviewer:</b>	<b>Muhammad Hasan Rai</b>

Resistance Themes in Punjabi Literature is a unique book by its contextual analysis because it showed the real face of the Punjab which the British suppressed it on technical grounds. The author used such Punjabi poetry of Punjabi poets based on resistance which produced such a history of Punjab completely intervened state narrative in this context. Mirza brought forward such Punjabi freedom fighters or heroes to the readers who were not popularly known among masses and established historian in the historical perspective of Punjab but they were the real heroes who became a martyr after bravely fighting against traitors and ruling elite such as Rai Ahmad Khan Kharal and Murad Fatiana. Mirza beautifully incorporated Punjabi poetry containing resistant themes into a historical perspective that opposed the British narrative as England built India. This book contained twenty-three chapters that covered the area of three hundred years regarding Resistance Themes in Punjabi Literature from the 18<sup>th</sup> to 20<sup>th</sup> centuries. Mirza appreciated the Heer-symbol of resistance in these words as “she continues to inspire because of her relentless struggle for the restoration of her fundamental rights. She is a beacon light, particularly for women in Pakistan fighting for their rights. Shah Hussain described Dullah Bhatti’s struggle against Mughal king Akbar in his poetry. Ali Haider exposed Nadir Shah invasion over Punjab through his poetry by criticizing such collaborators who were welcoming against Indians. Najabat exposed Nadir’s invasion and his plans and his coterie and of the stalwarts of the Dehli darbar, including prime minister Qamar-ud-Din Khan and Nizam-ul-Mulk Mansoor Ali Khan. Waris Shah said that Ahmad Shah would devastate the country. But God will save Jandiala (village of the poet) from his tyranny. He admired Shahnawaz who gave a fight to Abdali. In the fifth chapter, Mirza tried to change a strange impression has been created that the Punjabis welcomed and helped the invaders from whichever side they descended on the soil of the Indus valley by presenting this huge corpus of resistance written during the last five hundred years is Var Dullah Bhatti, Var Nadir Shah, See Harfi Waris Shah, Jang Hind-Punjab by Shah Mohammad and some dholas about Rai Ahmad Khan Kharal and his comrades-in-arm. He admired Kharal tribe for their consistency against invaders in such words as “The Kharal has been fighting with the previous government. Ranjeet Singh

avoided confrontation with them and used to bypass their areas. Their tribal leader Mirza – a hero of a Punjabi love story Miraz Saheban), was murdered by the Sails (the tribe of Saheban). The Kharals squared accounts with the Sails. They attacked the Sail territory and destroyed them. They also engaged Emperor Akbar and never wavered in the battlefields. They snatched the wealth of Alexander the great and never surrendered it". Bulleh Shah came forward to praise three tribes such as Bhattis and Tarars of Hafizabad and Chatthas of Wazirabad who carried on an unceasing and bitter struggle against Sikh ascendancy till their final overthrow in 1799. Shah Azeem wrote a poem entitled Multan di Var or Nawab Muzaffar di Var that recorded a battle between Sikhs and Nawab Muzaffar Khan. Shah Mohammad of Wadala, district Amritsar, has recorded the life and achievements of Maharaja Ranjeet Singh in his jangnama Hind Punjab-an epic poem. Mirza bluntly appreciated Rai Ahmad Khan Kharal's bravery against the British forces in the chapter entitled Kharals of 1857. He took Punjabi text from Kall Bolaindi by A.D.Ejaz. Murad—The Hero of Fatianas tributed by Mirza used the poetry of Murad's mother and Shamoo of Dherkey. A nationalist of Pathankot—Ram Singh who challenged the new conquerors of Punjab with these words as I will fight the Farangi, I have a claim against the English, My life is a thing of but four days. Three poets such as Allama Iqbal, an unknown poet, and Hakeem Abdul Lateef Arif wrote poetry on the Jallianwala Massacre. Mohammad Din Jarar highlighted Kashmir issue with the reference of partition. The next chapter elaborated on the role of underdogs in this context through Nizam Lohar's poetry. All three Nizam Lohar, Jabroo Nai, and Malangi Faqir are known as dacoits and they will continue to be known as such because they belong to any respectable family. Both poets such as Sehrai Gurdaspuri and Fazal Karim Mujahid Jhelumi defined Quaid e Azam's role especially in the struggle of a separate country. The last six chapters of the book are related to the Punjabi language such as Baranmanh—a form of Punjabi poetry, privation, and deprivation of Punjabi language, modern trends in literature, comparative study of Heer Waris Shah, Heer Damodar, Baba Farid – the pioneer of Punjabi poetry and Punjabi –language of the masses. Baranmanh—a form of Punjabi poetry discussed in detail by examples of three poets who wrote Baranmanh such as Wilayat Shah, Ram Acharya Musafir, and Amrita Pritam. Resistance Themes in Punjabi Literature provided encyclopedic information about Punjabi language, poets, fiction writers, resistance themes, etc. It encouraged young researchers to write the history of Punjab in this way such as Farina Mir used this technique (using Punjabi poetry) in her book entitled *Social Space of Language: Vernacular Culture in British Colonial Punjab*. On the other hand, this book does not fulfill the modern techniques of research. Overall it is a good book for such readers who want to read counter-narrative about Punjab.

## BOOK REVIEW

<b>Book Title</b>	<b>THE SIKH HERITAGE: BEYOND BORDERS</b>
<b>Author</b>	<b>Dalvir Singh Pannu</b>
<b>Language</b>	<b>English</b>
<b>ISBN:</b>	<b>1733293701</b>
<b>Year of Publication:</b>	<b>2019</b>
<b>Edition</b>	<b>1<sup>st</sup></b>
<b>Pages</b>	<b>416</b>
<b>Publisher:</b>	<b>Pannu Dental Group, San Jose. USA</b>
<b>Reviewer</b>	<b>Prof. Sidra Shafi</b>

The zest and inspiration of research were nurtured in the heart of Dr. Dalvir Singh Pannu which encouraged and motivated him to pen down, “*The Sikh Heritage: Beyond Borders*” by his long-standing passion for unearthing the narratives of Sikh historical and religious places displaced during the India-Pakistan partition of 1947. The bloodshed, pangs, miseries of the departed souls during the process of partition were agonized by meeting desertion from the sacred and historical memorials. Today, these priceless monuments stand out as a symbol of the peaceful and harmonious past lives of people sharing a heritage whose affinities range beyond physical borders and territories. The most glaring aspect is that Dr. Dalvir has dedicated this book to Guru Nanak on his 550<sup>th</sup> birth anniversary which is celebrated across the globe in November 2019. The father of Sikhism, Guru Nanak was a great humanitarian, a brilliant scholar, and a devout missionary who spent his entire life discoursing on and pursuing the conception of one true God. He holds universal reverence for breaking the barriers of class, caste, and communities.

The book on the Sikh heritage dedicates one chapter each to the 84 sites that it documents, transporting readers to the past by narrating the detailed history of each marvel that the author and his team photographed throughout Pakistan. This book is the culmination of decade-long fieldwork of finding and exploring the heritage sites, alongside analyzing multiple Janamsakhis (hagiographical accounts). The author’s process of doing extensive analysis and cross-referencing with other sources enables readers to comprehend Sikh history, by posing inquiries, applying critical thinking, and investigating a hundred sources. He includes a multitude of primary sources and Gurumukhi inscriptions, translated into English, to increase local and international heritage-lovers; understanding of these sites and to help and

preserve their beauty and histories through his writing. Sainly heritage has always been considered as a hub for social and communal attraction in societies for their growth and development. Its significance cannot be denied at all. Dr. Dalvir has penned down this onerous task to take the responsibility on his shoulders and presents a very compact and comprehensive visual narrative of Sikh Sacred Places whether they are in a good a or bad condition; being braved of negligence. The current volume of this book pertains to the pictures of the Sikh sacred places located in district Lahore, Sheikhpura, Nankana Sahib, Kasur, Narowal, and Sialkot.

The description of Gurdwara Janam Asthan at Nankana Sahib has been discussed in detail. The various pictures cover the inner interior of the Gurdwara including a well and ancient tree where Sikhs were burnt alive on 20<sup>th</sup> February 1921. The inscriptions on the ceiling and walls narrate the story of ancestral heritage. The aerial view of the Gurdwara Complex evinces the serenity and peacefulness as a placid religious center. The Gurdwara was built to commemorate the site where Guru Nanak, the founder of Sikhism, settled after his missionary work for the rest of his life. Certain other pictures reflect the young students learning Gurbani and Gurmukhi from their teachers. It describes their daily routine practice every morning at Gurbani Santhiya Class where Sikh youth used to practice the correct pronunciation of Sri Guru Granth Sahib. It is worth appreciating that the author has very skillfully presented the blend of historical and religious expeditions and events through a pictorial sketch of the holiest sites of the Sikh religion. It imparted the preaching of Guru: peace, harmony, and the message of universal brotherhood. It was his mandate as he believed in equality between castes, religions and presented the concept of “oneness of God” meaning there is only one God. The scholarly tour to Bale Da Khooh with Mr. Pannu satiated the folk desire of readers and takes the flight of historical venture while narrating the momentous events regarding the progression of language. It emphasized the identity of Bala and Janamsakhi. How the giant well was renovated on the grant provided voluntarily by Misaldar Ranjit Singh and the zeal and zest of community service in its construction, is well sketched. The affixation of the framed photograph at a shrine in Shikarpur, Sindh displaying Guru Nanak seated on a mat with a tree looming above his head as a canopy enlightens the souls of worshippers who visit it for ziarat. The visit to Gurdwara Sacchi Manji is known for its historic significance at Haft Madr. It is presenting a scene of ruins. Unfortunately, it remained unattended and all the holy relics (cot, shoes, walking stick) have been either destroyed or vanished.

In district Sheikhpura, there is a Gurdwara named Sucha Sauda which is an illustration of Baba Nanak's generosity and desire to serve humanity at any cost. The elegant white tinted structure of Gurdwara is the center of attraction for tourists and worshippers. The interior view of the main hall is too praiseworthy. Gurdwara Babe di Ber in Sialkot is the epitome of meeting between Baba Guru Nanak with Faqeer Hamza Ghaus Sarkar. The inner hall of the ceiling with abraded painting decorates the pictorial view of the above-stated meeting in a charismatic way. There is another picturesque meeting between Guru Gobind and Punj Piyare at Shri Anandpur Sahib during the Khalsa Initiation in 1699. The graphic view of the author of the book is commendable. The wall painting attained a historical significance due to its best quaint artwork. These pictures captured the spacious chamber of Gurdwara and many plaques are telling the stories of pre-partition donations being affixed on the walls. The aerial view of the building is a conspicuous piece of photography that netted the historic *beri tree* located on the premises of Gurdwara. The adjacent graveyard owned the mausoleum of Hamza Ghaus Sarkar which affirms the strong affinity between Baba Guru Nanak and Hamza Ghaus Sarkar. It further preaches a lesson to Muslims and Sikh community to maintain peace and stability in the society by promoting interfaith harmony. The descriptive details of another Gurdwara Manji Sahib at Deokay, Pasrur is another example of strong communion between Mian Mithu faqeer and Baba Guru Nanak. This place is enlightened with the everlasting lamps of spirituality. The portraits of Gurdwara Nanaksar in the village of Bhinder is mourning over its debris. The interior view of the ruins of Gurdwara has been waiting for its worshippers to get it restored to its original interior. A Gurmukhi inscription inside Gurdwara Nankar is not legible now because of the deteriorated condition of the building which has been converted now into the storage room.

It is pertinent to appraise the pictorial description of Alpa situated in Kasur; worth appreciating. The disfigured architect ramped paintings on the walls, and the unavailability of any inscriptions of plaques at this structure cannot define the further details about the building. Gurdwara at Chunian district Kasur where Guru Arjan visited and helped people to assuage their hardships and problems to combat natural disaster; has been illustrating the historic stories/events for centuries. The floral designs on the interior ceilings reflect the stories of remnants of Guru Hargobind. Some pictures focused on the floral patterns of the dome which certify the glorious historic elevation of this building. Gurdwara Janamasthan Guru Ram Das at Chuna Mandi Lahore is an exemplary symbol of a beautiful architect and a place of worship. It is worth mentioning that the author has discussed 40 pictorial descriptions of Gurdwaras located in district Lahore, each a marvel at its own,



owing to Pakistan is considered as the center of religious hub for Sikhs. It is satisfying to delineate that this book is comprehensive in content to address and quench the thirst of readers within a short period. It is pertinent to add here that this book not only delivers and narrates the pictures but also gives a complete description and details related to different sacred places of Sikh Heritage. The book has a very detailed index at the end of the book which will impress librarians, and the entries have almost an equal number of Muslim names as that of Sikh. It shows how much the author struggled to maintain the balance of Sikh and Muslim narratives in the work. The endnotes and bibliography is very detailed and will provide a vital resource to the history researchers. The Gurmukhi verses and inscriptions are translated in English to make it easy for international academicians

The study of this book enlightens the souls of readers while taking them into the realm of the sacred culture of Sikhs that awards vitality to the cultural notions and soothes the inner core of the soul. It transforms its readers on the wings of virtual flight to get the maximum taste of purity and sacredness. It would be appropriate to articulate that this (book) is a Heritage of Punjab. It is the religious legacy. It is the culture of Sikhs. This tells about the co-existence between Muslims and Sikhs and Hindus. The time these two cultures had spent altogether before partition. It is evident of their cordial relationships too. Because everybody loves saints. The saintly love and heritage is always been honored by the Punjabis. Therefore, this is the capaciousness of the Punjabi culture and society to live a reverent life and to maintain a liaison with other religions. So the Punjab is a secular and liberal land, one can see that the rural Punjab is always peaceful, placid and serene whereas the suicide attacks are the urban phenomena and rural life is still counted as peaceable; it is an existing fact that the cultural hubs are always the rural areas. The cities are polluted with the politics, religious secularism, communal riots and dogmatic maneuverings are the order of the day. But rural Punjab is always helping, interdependent, following caste system interlinked with saintly heritage. Guru Granth Sahib, the Sikh sacred book contains poetry of Baba Farid, Ashlok of Baba Fareed as well. Along with practicing full time dentistry, the author has a fervor for Sikh heritage around the globe. Believing that each historic and religious site has a story to tell. This book has a unique and everlasting contribution to Sikh Heritage focusing on a saintly legacy. I tend to convey my heartiest congratulations to Dr. Dalvir Singh Pannu for this very positive contribution to the cultural heritage of the literary world.

\*\*\*\*\*

## BOOK REVIEW

<b>Title:</b>	<i>Urdu: Evolution and Reforms</i>
<b>Author:</b>	María I. Maldonado García
<b>Genre:</b>	Linguistics of Urdu Language
<b>Price:</b>	Rs.2,000  \$35  €30
<b>Language:</b>	Written in the English language
<b>ISBN:</b>	978-969-9815-06-5.
<b>Publisher:</b>	Punjab University, Lahore
<b>Reviewed by</b>	Akhtar Hussain Sandhu

Maria Isabel Maldonado Garcia is currently working as Professor at the University of Lahore but she has made much scholastic contribution while working at the University of the Punjab, Lahore as Director of Institute of Languages and Director, External Linkages. The book under review is a product of the glorious days and the University honored and acknowledged her talent by publishing this scholarly work entitled *Urdu: Evolution and Reforms*. This was the era when academia was thinking to work on linguistics therefore the research of Dr. Maria Maldonado encouraged the Pakistani researchers to focus on linguistics which opened a new horizon for the academicians. The work ranges from Urdu, Saraiki, Arabic, Spanish, Persian languages along with a history of the languages.

Maria Isabel Maldonado Garcia is an eminent linguist and scholar of international repute. She was born in Spain and nowadays living in Lahore with her Pakistani family. The variety and novelty of her splendid work moved me to peak into the British-Indian history in which language and scripts first created a separate identity and then it concluded to the point of the territorial split. Demand for a separate homeland based on specific factors including script and language did not stop with the partition of India instead it also affected the solidarity of Pakistan and East Pakistan became Bangladesh in 1971. During the British period, Devanagari, Persian, and Gurmukhi scripts created a sense of identity among the people belonging to the same ancestral stock but having an association with different religions. The concept of democracy and nationalism got popularity among the Indians but soon 'religion' as the motivating factor behind prevailed in social strata. The identity based on religion permeated politics as well because the political parties attracted membership mainly from their respective religious communities. Without any doubt, language played a pivotal role in establishing communal identity among the Indian peoples. Urdu once owned wholeheartedly by all the Indian writers and poets regardless of religious and racial link, progressed but the rise of the western philosophy of nationalism moved the Hindus to demand Devanagri script which assured a clear-cut communal bifurcation as quoted by Sir Syed Ahmad Khan. The Hindus aligned themselves on the basis of religion and religious heritage. They had become much sensitive about their language and script. Although language does not own any religion but it has been playing an important role in the political

happenings and this phenomenon still persists in the world therefore the work produced by Dr. Maria becomes massively relevant to the current affairs of the South Asian and other regional politics. The authors' work provides divergent perspectives including religious, artistic, sectarian, cultural, or financial angles. Bengalis disliked Urdu to the extent that even today the Bengali Muslims castigate the Urdu literature but they don't snub because the major portion of this literature belongs to Islam and being taught in the religious institutions or *Madaras* but the religious teachers still demand to be provided with the alternative literature in Bangla language.

Dr. Maria has proved the link of Urdu with other languages sorting out the similarity of the words. Urdu once emerged as a symbol of unity for all the religious communities living in the different corners of the Subcontinent but the Hindu demand for Devanagari script instead of Nastaleeq script convinced the Muslims to own their Muslim heritage which culminated when they opted for separation. By this script and language caused separatist tendencies among the Muslims. Conspiracy theories remain always active and operational, therefore, the Indian communities labeled the British reforms as the policy of 'divide and rule.'<sup>11</sup>In fact, the revolutionary administrative and political reforms introduced by the British carved a sweeping impact on the Indians that their vision could not counterblast the British maneuvering. They were unable to mitigate the effects of the tremendous and potential challenge of the British education and system. The vanquished and unorganized locals could not stand before this challenge having any alternatives. Resultantly, the communities and factions within the communities started taking their own way as they hit upon. Most of the factions thought it right and beneficial for the respective communities to lean with the new change. We look, until the last moment of the British raj, the Indian communities seemed claiming that a certain policy would be advantageous for India. The cultural, political, administrative, educational, philosophical, social, legal, systemic and lingual onslaught was too sweeping and forceful to be countered by the vanquished. As a result, factions emerged and operated on the basis of the philosophy propounded by the ruling nation. The weak, by all means, started and kept on struggling for their languages. Despite their parleys and friendship with the masters, the language issue remained hard topic. Human psyche, creativity and diversity of mind construct every possible standpoint and justification so every faction presented justification behind the choice. This witnesses the disunity among the people, nevertheless, the sane minds of the same society sensing the grave consequences of a specific cult came up with alternative and countering discourses and struggles. In Indian politics, we see the Muslim and non-Muslims repeated their protest against the anti-Muslim rhetoric adopted by the rude Congress and Mahasabha leadership but their voice was suffocated by the arrogant majority. Urdu was a language of Hindus too but the script and use of Persian and Arabic terms created problems during the British period and they objected on the script chosen to represent Urdu and continued utilizing Devanagari. Why do the historians not deem it a 'divide and rule policy' when the symbol of unity was dismantled by the Hindus? The language created a gulf between Hindus and Muslims while in Punjab *Nastaleeq* (Shahmukhi) script became a problematic issue. Dr. Maria hints at this development briefly. The Sikhs demanded introduction of Gurmukhi in the schools wherein Sikh students were studying. We find many similarities on the language issue at central level and in British Punjab. After 1947, Urdu and Bangla became an irritant issue

within the Muslim community and was a partial reason for the split within the Muslim community. Urdu has recently been declared once again as an official language but its implementation requires practical measures. Moreover, political will on the part of the parliamentarians is required to meet this gigantic challenge while the invention of new words or terms can facilitate Urdu to work as an official language. All discussed above, a reader can find in the book, *Urdu: Evolution and Reforms*, produced by Dr. Maria Maldonado.

The evolution and development of the Urdu language have been an important research topic in Pakistan and abundant work on Urdu literature produced by the Pakistani researchers is available that provides a base for the emerging researchers. Nevertheless, linguistics is a neglected area in Pakistan. A look at a few years back shows a few struggling to make a place for such good work despite an encouraging environment was inexistent but they worked relentlessly and proved their capability in the field. The author has decorated her book with seven articulate chapters containing diverse angles relating to Urdu and its status in Pakistan. The first chapter, 'Introduction' titled 'The Reforms of the Urdu Language,' elaborates and analyzes Urdu's genealogical affiliation, history, reforms, and evolutionary process from its birth until the post-partition era. The second chapter deals with the shared vocabulary of Turkish and Urdu language and it is the first-ever work in Pakistan of its kind. This chapter has been framed within the discipline of applied and historical linguistics and historical onomasiology. One hundred and fifty apparent cognates in Turkish and Urdu languages were analyzed to confirm their origin. The Pakistani linguists have usually thought that Urdu was a mixture of Turkish, Persian, and Arabic languages. This specific chapter proves that Arabic and Persian had influenced Urdu and Turkish and the similarity between certain words in both languages results from this influence. The words of Turkish in the Urdu language are minimal. The next part of the book discusses the relation of Urdu with Sanskrit and the Prakrit group of languages. Urdu had developed from Sanskrit into the Prakrits and had borrowed lexical elements from Persian, and Arabic due to cultural and Islamic influences. In my opinion, there is a very minute distance between Islamic or cultural and political influences as they all were intermingled in this stance. Perhaps, this could have dragged the researcher to an unending debate, consequently the author successfully confined herself to the area of focus. The role of Persian and Arabic elements in the Urdu language is the next chapter which unveils very important facts regarding Urdu. Dr. Maria provides proof that Hindi and Urdu were the same languages that separated due to the split of the script (the phenomenon called digraphia). The next chapter is a witness as to how English words sought space in the Urdu language. The British colonization of India facilitated the English language to enter the equation through language contact. This research is significant since it is one of the first corpus-based surveys of the density of English lexicon in the basic vocabulary of the Urdu language found to date. The next study calculates the density of each particular etymological element in the basic vocabulary of Urdu, to provide the reader with full comprehension of the total density of each element. To end, Urdu as the official language of Pakistan is the last chapter. The author provides the readers with a thought-provoking look at the constitutional position of the Urdu language in the light of the Supreme Court ruling of September 2015 and the response of the political government in the matter. Dr. Maria Maldonado has suggested several approaches and modalities from which the

Pakistani government can benefit. She has suggested constitutional amendments to eliminate the existing delusions and her intellectual input relating to the implementation of the court order can guide the authorities in the right direction.

Dr. Maria having western origin and training is an asset and blessing for Pakistani academia and scholarly circles because she has undertaken a project to research Urdu linguistics, its evolution, and development. She could continue working on the Spanish language as her area of specialty and gain international repute as Spanish is being spoken in 49 countries including the USA but she opted for the Pakistani languages for her research passions. Spanish is the third most spoken language in the world and its popularity is growing day by day. Everyone prefers working on the area that honors the author with money, fame, and respect at the international level. Dr. Maria, a Spanish and Christian by origin but for the last twenty-five years Pakistani and Muslim, has been serving Pakistan by conducting research on Urdu and Pakistan. She has produced several researchers and many are still working under her supervision. She takes passionate interest in her students and many scholars pursue to benefit from her vision and guidance. She has interest in history of linguistics and her commitment with Urdu language and deep adherence towards Pakistan is a type of kindness and favour and the patriot hearts will not help appreciating her enthusiasm and work skill. We Pakistanis express deep regards for Dr. Maria Maldonado and her excellent work on history, linguistics and Pakistan.

*The reviewer is a Professor of History and Columnist (Daily, Nawa-i-Waqt, Islamabad), Pakistan*

\*\*\*\*\*